

School of Management



PROCEEDINGS OF THE 45TH ANNUAL MACROMARKETING CONFERENCE

Transitioning Markets: Opportunities, Challenges & Future Trends

Macromarketing







UNIVERSITY OF NEBRASKA-LINCOLN

BOGOTÁ, COLOMBIA

Proceedings of the 45th Annual Macromarketing Conference

"Transitioning Markets: Opportunities, Challenges & Future Trends"

July 7-10, 2020

Program Chairs & Proceedings Editors

Andrés Barrios, Universidad de los Andes Bogotá Colombia Jie G. Fowler, Valdosta State University Clifford Shultz, II, Loyola University Chicago James Gentry, University of Nebraska -Lincoln

Published by

The Macromarketing Society, Inc., Laramie, Wyoming in cooperation with Universidad de los Andes, Bogotá, Colombia ISSN 2168-1481 (online)

Note from editors:

The 45th Annual Macromarketing Conference is the first Macromarketing Conference to be held entirely online. Originally scheduled to be held at Universidad de los Andes, in Bogotá, Colombia, the COVID-19 pandemic disrupted countries, institutions and people around the world. The Macromarketing Society was not spared. To ensure the health, safety and well-being of Conference participants, we agreed to assemble via interactive video-conferencing, specifically, "Zoom".

The Conference theme, fittingly, is "Transitioning Markets: Opportunities, Challenges & Future Trends". Markets, marketing and societies the world over are under acute stresses and are undergoing profound transitions, which are truly challenging. Macromarketers know those challenges create obligations and opportunities to facilitate individual and societal well-being. Thus, we have organized a Symposium – a series of webinars, July 7-10 – and these Proceedings featuring timely, topical and timeless macromarketing themes, which reveal the depth, breadth and utility of macromarketing research.

Readers will see the Proceedings are comprised of abstracts. The digital format of this year's Conference precludes presentations of all papers and abstracts, as well as panels and discussions. Authors are encouraged to develop further their papers for presentation at the 2021 Macromarketing Conference or for submission to the *Journal of Macromarketing*.

The full accounting of the devastation from the COVID-19 pandemic may not be possible or understood for years to come, but these Proceedings will indicate forever the resolve, adaptability and intrepid spirit of macromarketing scholars. We appreciate you and your many contributions.

Lastly, we thank the track chairs, authors, reviewers, and the support teams of the Macromarketing Society and Universidad de los Andes. Your professionalism and enthusiasm under difficult circumstances were/are vital to the creation and administration of this seminal event.

Andrés, Jie, Cliff, Jim

Copyright Statement

The Macromarketing Society and Universidad de los Andes do not take copyright for abstracts or papers appearing in the proceedings. The copyright of each abstract or paper in the proceedings belongs to the paper's author(s). Authors are responsible for the content of their papers or abstracts. The ideas in them do not necessarily represent the ideas of the editors or other members of the Macromarketing Society; they are published in these proceedings in the spirit of academic freedom and consistent with the decades-long Macromarketing tradition of rich discussion and intelligent debate.

Contents (list in track alphabetical order)

ETHICAL AND SUSTAINABLE CONSUMPTION	10
"I Don't Want to Produce Another Consumer": Going Childfree as 'Sustainable' Lifestyle Option in Times of Climate Change	11
Making One's Religious Self Feel Better about Luxury Use: The Role of Religiosity in Choic Disposal Option for Luxury Goods	
Macromarketing and Ethical Salesperson Behaviors	14
The Detrimental Effects of Informational Arbitrage in Specialty Coffee Value Chains and Proposed Solutions	15
EXPLORING SOCIAL MEDIA IN SHIFTING, TRANSFORMING, AND TRANSITIONIN MARKETS	
Social Media-based Crowdfunding among Marginalized Populations: Unintended Consequen of the #TransCrowdFund Movement on Twitter	
Social Media for New Service Development in a Developing and Transitional Economy	18
Insta-Humanitarianism: The Use of Jungian Archetypes in a Humanitarian Aid Organization' Social Media	
Girls for Sale: How Facebook Community Standards are Implicated in Commercializing Underage Marriage Transactions	22
FOOD MARKETING	25
Food Markets and Marketing in Developing Countries: Issues and Implications	26
O2O: Friend or Foe for Society?	28
Culture and Communication for a Wellbeing-Oriented Food Marketing Strategy	29
Policy Efforts to Encourage Healthy Food Purchases: Looking More Closely at SNAP Incent	
Taste, Looks, and Idealization: An Examination of Consumer Ideology in Shanghai's "Celebr Restaurants"	-
A Conceptual Introduction to an AI-Based Food Marketing System: Navigating Assortment Expansion from Farm to Fork	35
Eating Insects: Acquiring Taste and Shaping Food Desirability	37
Top Macromarketing Lessons of the COVID-19 Outbreak	39
Peers' and Siblings' Influences on Teenagers' Preferences for Brand Name Food Products	42

Health Promotion and Welfare in the Context of Urban Agriculture in a Brazilian City: An Approach on Food Desert under Lens of Practice Theory
The Vulnerability of the Young Adult Consumer to Food Consumption and its Relationship with Nutritional Interest
FORCIBLY DISPLACED COMMUNITIES & MARKETING SYSTEMS 45
The Role of Aid-Agencies in Stimulating the Food Retail Market in the Time of Social Conflicts: The Case of Syrian Refugees in Lebanon
Integration of Skilled Immigrants (SIs) in Finland: Examining the "Business Lead" Program through the Lenses of Acculturation
The Economic Lives and Marketing Systems of Refugees in Settlements: A Systematic Literature Review and Future Research Trajectory
From Behavioral Micro-Choices to Macro Decision-Making: Macromarketing Implications of Consumer Animosity for the Inclusion of Refugees in Lebanon
Venezuelan Refugee Crisis and Humanitarian Marketing Systems on Colombia
GENDER AND INTERSECTIONALITIES: ADVANCING MACROMARKETING TOPICS AND THEORETICAL PERSPECTIVES
«New Fathers» Reshaping the Marketplace: A Focus on Single-Fathers Families
"No Pain, no Gain": Consumption and Masculinities in Road Cycling
Where Agism and the Feminization of Poverty Meet: A South American Perspective
Strategic Ideological Filtering as a Framework for Understanding Female Recreational Athletes' Critiques of Fitness Advertising
If You Like Then You Better Put a Name On It: Gender Fluidity, Artificial Intelligence, and the Parsing of LGBTQ+ Identities
GLOBALIZATION, (NEO)COLONIALISM, AND MARKETING
Three Historical Narratives on Advertising Self-Control and the Origin of Conar: When Consumer Rights turn into Business Rights
The Darker Side of Advertising Self-Regulation: Imperialism and Eurocentric Consumerism in the Third World
Emancipation Alternatives in Neocolonial Global Food Markets
Genderless fashion discourse in Vogue International
Markets, Marketing Systems and Quality of Life: An analysis departing from the Andean worldview of <i>Buen Vivir</i>
Civil Society Participation in the Organic Products Market Formation

HISTORICAL RESEARCH IN MARKETING
Emergence and Decline of the Rural Pulpería: An Important Institution in Costa Rica's Early Marketing System
Markets as Narrative Constructions: Analysis of the Narratives for the Creation of Public Cemeteries
Tale of Two Bazaars: Indian Bazaar-Market Systems from a Microhistorical Perspective (1958-2017) 76
Firearms Provisioning and the Historical Roots of Gun Violence in Latin America
MACROMARKETING AND PEDAGOGY IN IBERO AMERICA: TOWARDS A CRITICAL PEDAGOGY IN MACROMARKETING
Macromarketing and Pedagogy in Ibero America: Towards a Critical Pedagogy
Appropriations of Macromarketing Pedagogy: from Teaching to Pedagogical Practice from a Freirean Perspective
MACROMARKETING MINDSET: EDUCATION IN THE CLASSROOM AND BEYOND. 84
Transitioning to low carbon research and teaching: Supporting necessary change through participative inquiry
Inserting Biology into the Genome of Marketing: Interdisciplinary Lessons for Exploring Societal Problems
MARGINALIZATION, STIGMA AND MISREPRESENTATION IN THE MARKETPLACE: ADVANCING A MACROMARKETING VIEW OF DESTIGMATIZATION AND MARKETPLACE INCLUSION
Exploring the Dialectics of Marketplace Exclusion: A Systematic Literature Review and Research Agenda
On-line Sports Betting and Consumer's Vulnerability
MARKETING SYSTEMS - MACROMARKETING
Evolving Structures and Systems: Tourism Development in Ninh Binh, Vietnam
Transition Markets – an Example of Systems of Transport in Brazil
METHODS AND MEASUREMENT
Caravaggio: Painting a Macromarketing Framework in early 1600 Naples
Macromarketing and the Systems Imperative: Systems and the Macromarketing Imperative 100
Reflexive Thematic Analysis: understanding interactions between markets and society (Favourite and Desired clothing as Exemplar)

Dynamic Meanings in Marketing Systems
POLICY AND MACROMARKETING 104
Alternative Banking Services: A Consumers' Perspective on the Banking System 105
A Global Phenomenal in a Sports Fanatic Country: Reality and Policy Challenges of Sports Betting in Brazil
QUALITY OF LIFE
Consumers' Perceptions of the Role of the Marketing System in Subjective Well-Being 111
Making Macromarketing Meaningful: A Eudaimonic View of Quality of Life and Consumer Well-being
How Does Economic Inequality Impact Consumer Well-being: A Case in China 116
Macromarketing Metrics of Consumer Well-Being: An Update
RETAILING AND DISTRIBUTION 120
Household Expenditures at Food and Beverage Retailers in Japan
SOCIAL CONFLICT
(Dis) trust effect on entrepreneurial development: the case of a stigmatized community-based enterprise
Re-examining beneficiary value: Conflict and impact of development interventions in local communities
The transition to peace. Colombia's implementation of the peace accord and Mexico's cycles of violence. A study in the use and value of social marketing in post-conflict resolution and integration
SUBSISTENCE MARKETING & DEVELOPMENT
How Social Enterprises Work Through Nested Institutions to Foster Market Inclusion of the Differently Abled – a macro-marketing perspective
Fortune for the Bottom-of-the-Pyramid- A Macromarketing Perspective
Forgers Identity Formation: a study in the Brazilian footwear industry
The 'nasi lemak' ladies: How female micro-entrepreneurs navigate transitioning markets 139
Ethics of marketing persuasive technology: A research agenda
Instant loans as market violence
A Critical Discourse Analysis of newspaper articles under a reform of tuition fee removal in Chilean Higher Education

Environmental protection initiatives and subsequent shifts in commodity production and	
marketing: A case study of Aba Prefecture, Sichuan, China	145
Just because we <i>can</i> , does it mean we <i>should</i> ? From Nestlé's baby formula to vaping & e-cigarettes	147
Responsible customer experience: exploring the missing link to encourage sustainable consumption	149

ETHICAL AND SUSTAINABLE CONSUMPTION

Stephanie Oneto, University of Wyoming USA



"I Don't Want to Produce Another Consumer": Going Childfree as 'Sustainable' Lifestyle Option in Times of Climate Change

Sabrina Helm, University of Arizona, USA

Joya Kemper, University of Auckland, New Zealand

Samantha White, University of Canterbury, New Zealand

The majority of individuals around the world believe global climate change is a major threat, and many recognize that current consumerist lifestyles are unsustainable and contributing to this crisis. Some individuals consider their impact beyond their own consumption, questioning if they should "produce another consumer". Such societal dynamics affect marketing systems; individuals decision to forgo childbearing can lead to serious implications for the viability of economic systems and societies. To address this research problem, 24 interviews were conducted with young adults in the U.S and New Zealand. The decision to go childfree is linked to uncertainty and bleak outlooks of the future, and concern for overpopulation and overconsumption.

Making One's Religious Self Feel Better about Luxury Use: The Role of Religiosity in Choice of Disposal Option for Luxury Goods

Stephanie Geiger-Oneto, University of Wyoming, USA

Elizabeth A. Minton, University of Wyoming, USA

The global market for new luxury goods has steadily increased over the past few years and reached \$250 billion in 2015 (D'Arpizio, 2015). Despite this growth, most luxury goods end up collecting dust or taking up space in a landfill once they have outlived their usefulness. Additionally, purchasing luxury goods can lead to shame and guilt for consumers as they think about the money spent on unnecessary items (Hagtvedt & Patrick, 2016; Ki, Lee, & Kim, 2017). Examining the disposal of luxury products has the potential to identify compensatory mechanisms used to help relieve negative emotions associated with luxury consumption and restore positive views of one's self-identity that align with their moral convictions. As such, our paper adds to the growing literature on luxury and sustainable consumption/disposal behaviors by examining how luxury disposal behavior 1) influences the luxury brand experience, 2) compensates for possible negative moral affect (shame and guilt) experienced after luxury consumption and 3) how this differs based on a consumer's moral convictions, as measured by religiosity.

Both prior research and popular culture indicate religious values influence consumer behavior broadly (Mathras, Cohen, Mandel, & Mick, 2016; Minton, Kahle, Jiuan, & Tambyah, 2016). For example, the song "Mercedes Benz" (Joplin, McClure, & Neuwirth, 1970) features Janis Joplin asking the Lord to bless her with a luxury car. Similarly, premium clothing brands, such as Affliction and True Religion, feature symbolic religious imagery (crosses, Buddha, etc.) on clothing products. Additionally, gold iPhone cases that feature crosses, religious figures (e.g., Catholic Saints), and bible verses (Spooky, 2017) are also available.

Research shows a general negative relationship between consumer religiosity and materialistic desires/actions (LaBarbera & Gurhan, 1997; Pace, 2013; Rindfleisch, Burroughs, & Wong, 2009; Swinyard, Kau, & Phua, 2001). We argue it is this avoidance of materialism that leads to guilt and shame producing compensatory mechanisms to reduce such negative affect after luxury consumption through morality-restoring disposal behaviors. In line with this reasoning, a consumer's religious beliefs have been shown to positively influence participation in sustainable behaviors (Leary, Minton, & Mittelstaedt, 2016; Minton, Kahle, & Kim, 2015), such that sustainably disposing of luxury products may help to compensate for negative affect, thereby restoring a positive view of one's self.

More specifically, a consumer's type of religiosity should differentially influence preference for various disposal methods. Allport and Ross (1967) describe that consumers can be primarily extrinsically or intrinsically religious. While extrinsic religiosity is a more social form of religiosity where consumers perform religious actions more for show and social approval, intrinsic religiosity captures more of an internal connection to a god or divine being without need for external motives (Donahue, 1985; Saroglou, 2002). As such, we expect religiosity to influence luxury disposal method, with intrinsic religiosity (as

opposed to extrinsic religiosity) being more positively connected with sustainable luxury disposal, as a means to compensate for negative affect and restore belief-behavior congruency.

More specifically, this research has four main purposes: (1) to establish the relationship between religiosity dimensions (intrinsic and extrinsic) and disposal method for luxury products, (2) to examine the moderating influence of emotions (guilt and shame) on likelihood of using various disposal methods as an explanation for when congruency is lost between beliefs and behaviors, (3) to identify how religiosity influences response to marketing about luxury disposal programs, and (4) to test identity fit as a mediator between consumers' religiosity and positive response toward luxury disposal programs when consumers seek to compensate for negative affect to restore belief-behavior congruency.

Macromarketing and Ethical Salesperson Behaviors

Rhett Epler, University of Wyoming, USA

Mark Leach, University of Wyoming, USA

In the Western world, the contemporary era is marred by excessive levels of consumption. This has led to numerous societal and environmental consequences; both for participating parties, and most certainly in the form of externalities. Myriad factors are often presented as the reason behind the rise in harmful consumption patterns, including, capitalism, obscene wealth, marketing/advertising, greed, lack of regulation and many others. Individual actors are also often blamed for over-consumption, this includes CEO's, executives, and most certainly, salespeople. We seek to examine ethical salesperson behavior as a part of a marketing system. Specifically, we plan to utilize a critical incident technique (CIT) driven interview process to examine ethical challenges faced by salespeople. How do salespeople adapt to ethical challenges? What are the steps that they took to resolve these challenges? Do these actions impede success? How do interactions with the other participants in these marketing systems contribute to ethical dilemmas?

The Detrimental Effects of Informational Arbitrage in Specialty Coffee Value Chains and Proposed Solutions

Benjamin Marcus, Stonehill College, USA

Elif Sisli Ciamarra, Stonehill College, USA

Lee McGinnis, Stonehill College, USA

The growth of the specialty coffee segment has created new opportunities and risks for its value chain participants. Market intermediaries have promoted the idealism of "rewarding higher quality" as the path toward greater prosperity for producers. In selecting products, consumers must decipher intermediaries' signals of higher quality, which presents both a choice dilemma and an opportunity to signal their own superiority. While products may have real differences in sensory quality, economic fairness, or ecological impact, measurement along these dimensions is not trivial. Quality differences are thus summarized and obscured for consumers as increasingly commoditized certifications and labels. Using a macromarketing perspective, we argue that intermediaries enjoy positional and informational advantages in these chains that allow them to exploit both producer dependency and consumer desire for higher quality products and conspicuous consumption. The interplay between intermediaries and consumers leads to distorted price-quality relationships, and increasingly to winner-takes-all outcomes throughout these chains.

As globalization became the norm, supply chains' complexity was magnified as the degree of separation between the initial producers and ultimate consumers of goods increased. In consequence, many products became commoditized. Consumers increasingly aim to procure products for the lowest possible prices, without much regard for the impact of their consumption on the livelihoods of the producers. These developments exert significant pressure on many small producers, and in extreme cases force them out of production, and leave consumers with a less variety to choose from.

In this paper, we develop a theoretical framework to conceptualize the distribution of economic surplus (the difference between the price paid for a good by the ultimate consumer and the cost of production) between participants of the global supply chains. We use specialty coffee markets as a case study to develop our framework. Our main conclusion is that a disproportionate amount of the economic surplus accrues to the intermediaries in the supply chains (traders and roasters in the example of specialty coffee markets) as a function of their market power, and there is a need for redistribution of the surplus from intermediaries to the producers. Absent such redistribution, the consumers will enjoy far few varieties of goods in the future because production of many goods will become unsustainable. In the context of coffee value chains, production could eventually be limited to Brazil and Vietnam within the next 30 years, where the coffee production is being done at the lowest cost and on the largest industrial scale. We propose several mechanisms that would help such redistribution, ranging from "radical transparency" to "consumer education."

EXPLORING SOCIAL MEDIA IN SHIFTING, TRANSFORMING, AND TRANSITIONING MARKETS

Jenna Drenten , Loyola University Chicago, USA Akon E. Ekpo , Loyola University Chicago, USA



Social Media-based Crowdfunding among Marginalized Populations: Unintended Consequences of the #TransCrowdFund Movement on Twitter

Jenna Drenten, Loyola University Chicago, USA

The #TransCrowdFund hashtag emerged as form of resistance, particularly as transgender individuals face increased risks of housing discrimination, healthcare discrimination, and employment discrimination. This study explores the practices and potential unintended consequences of social mediabased crowdfunding initiatives among marginalized populations. Specifically, how do transgender individuals use social media for crowdfunding through the #TransCrowdFund hashtag on Twitter, and how do these practices potentially reinforce gender-based marginalization? By analyzing a corpus of 32,818 tweets from the #TransCrowdFund community, this study suggests marginalization is reinforced, albeit unintentionally, through #TransCrowdFund campaigns on Twitter. Preliminary findings identify three unintended consequences of transgender crowdfunding campaigns: reproducing a moral meritocracy of transgender needs, compromising consumers' transgender identities, and redistributing financial burden onto transgender consumers.

Social Media for New Service Development in a Developing and Transitional Economy

Intekhab (Ian) Alam, State University of New York at Geneseo, USA

Despite the growing importance of social media as an interactive platform, research on the use of social media for customer interaction in New Service Development (NSD) is very nascent. Our study aims to address this shortcoming and contribute to this growing research stream by focusing on social media for securing customer input for NSD projects in a developing and transitional economy. Drawing on case-based research, findings reveal that although the use of social media has proliferated in many service firms, the traditional modes of interaction provide better customer input and information than the social media in the emerging and transitional economy. This research offers valuable insights for the managers and companies aiming to leverage the strategy of customer input and interaction and harnessing the power of social media for their NSD programs.

New Service Development (NSD) is a key strategic decision for many firms and as a result it is an important area of research. Also, extant literature suggests that a firm shall interact with its customers for NSD via a variety of interaction modes. Yet, the literature has largely overlooked the use of social media as an important mode of customer interaction. Over the last decade, digital media have revolutionized the overall marketing practices by offering new ways to reach customers (Lamberton and Stephen 2016). Our study aims to address the general failure of this literature to focus on the use of social media to secure customer input for NSD projects.

We conducted case-based research of NSD and customer interaction in an emerging and transitional economy. This research is set in the financial services industry in which we investigate the business-to-business (B2B) services. We collected data from 34 service firms in which we interviewed two managers and two customers in each firm. Thus a total of 68 service managers and 68 customers provided data for this research. We reviewed several documents and archival record for data triangulation purpose.

The findings reveal that although the use of social media has proliferated in many service firms, the traditional modes of interaction provide better customer input and information than social media in the emerging and transitional economy. The use of social media has a deep impact on the business environment of a country creating new modes of customer engagement. But the traditional modes of customer interaction still have an important role to play for NSD. The article has several implications for the financial service firms interested in marketing and developing new services in the emerging and transitional markets. Although the use of social media has thrived in various economies and been the beneficiary of significant scholarly attention, little work has studied its importance in the context of customer interaction for NSD. To build on this research stream, we investigate the use of social media for customer interaction alongside the traditional interaction modes and their synergistic impact on NSD strategies.

This research also offers valuable insights for the managers and companies aiming to leverage the strategy of customer input and interaction and harnessing the power of social media for their NSD programs. Extant literature does offer guidelines on how to interact with the customers and obtain input

from them during NSD (Alam 2002, 2006; Fang 2008; Chang and Taylor 2016). However, we take a step further by delineating the process of obtaining customer input from the traditional modes of interaction and combining them with the new and emerging mode of social media.

References

- Alam, I. 2002. An exploratory investigation of user involvement in new service development. *Journal of the Academy of Marketing Science*, 30(3): 250-261.
- Alam, I. 2006. Removing the fuzziness from the fuzzy front-end of service innovations through customer interactions. *Industrial Marketing Management*, 35(4): 468-480.
- Chang, W. and S.A Taylor. 2016. The effectiveness of customer participation in new product development: A meta-analysis, *Journal of Marketing*, 80(1): 47-64.
- Fang, E. 2008. Customer participation and the trade-off between new product innovativeness and speed to market. *Journal of Marketing*, 72(4): 90–104.
- Lamberton, C and A.T Stephen. 2016. A thematic exploration of digital, social media, and mobile marketing: research evolution from 2000 to 2015 and an agenda for future inquiry. *Journal of Marketing*, 80(6): 146-170.

Insta-Humanitarianism: The Use of Jungian Archetypes in a Humanitarian Aid Organization's Social Media

Robert Mittelman, Royal Roads University, Canada

This exploratory work represents initial steps in the analysis of how a humanitarian aid organization, Médecins Sans Frontières (MSF), used Instagram to explain its work and engage stakeholder. Using ethnographic content analysis, the aim is to uncover patterns and meaning in the use of marketing and communications images for humanitarian aid following the media release of the image of a drown Syrian child refugee, Alan Kurdi. Initial results show that MSF nearly doubled the number of posts centred on work in the Middle East post-Kurdi and there is a discovery of patterns within the images that garnered the most engagement related to the use of archetypal characters, namely Jung's character of the Hero. The appearance of the Hero merits further exploration on the effectiveness in driving donor engagement and the societal impacts of such marketing practices including potential unintended consequences of the promotion of racial stereotypes and Western privilege.

It was an image that brought the Syrian refugee crisis to the front of a wider society's consciousness. The image of the small, motionless body of two-year-old Alan Kurdi, a young Syrian boy, whose body had washed ashore after he drowned in the Mediterranean Sea on September 2, 2015 is the impetus for this research project. The objective of this study is to explore how a humanitarian aid organization used Instagram to explain its work and engage stakeholders around the seminal moment of the release of Alan Kurdi's image. This work examines how Médecins Sans Frontières (MSF, or Doctors Without Borders in English) Instagram account presents images and whether there was any alteration in posting habits after this moment and the corresponding levels of user engagement.

Instagram offers a way for users to 'immortalize' their lives; to create a visual account of their existence in the world (Ibrahim 2015). Mortensen (2017) believed that users of the platform foster social relationships not only by creating content and publishing for others to consume, but also by being consumers themselves and thus creating bonds—in this instance, moral bonds—with a global community. Most studies on social media use for international humanitarian aid focus on celebrity engagement (e.g. Mohring Reestorff 2018). Literature on the use of Instagram by humanitarian aid organizations is in short supply. This project aims to address this gap and to further uncover patterns and meaning in the use of images and Instagram for humanitarian aid.

I used ethnographic content analysis (Altheide and Schneider 2017) to examine 264 images over a one-year period from the MSF Instagram account, with the mid-point of the timeline being the release of the Kurdi image. Initial coding results show that MSF nearly doubled the number of posts centred on work in the Middle East post-Kurdi image and there is a discovery of patterns within the images that garnered the most engagement related to the use of, and connection to, archetypal characters. Over 40% of the images used during the one-year period showed MSF workers in positions of power, by providing care and positionally above the suffering. Engagement, measured through likes, increased by almost 30% after the Kurdi image. On four occasions, a post doubled the average number of likes. These four images were analyzed for similarities that could be used to determine what could generate such high engagement. The pattern associated with each image depicted negative traumatic content while placing the MSF worker at the centre or the story, as opposed to the suffering and the needy. In several instances, we seldom even view the sufferer, or the person to whom the MSF worker is providing aid. It is implied that help is being given through the chaos of the image, the equipment, and the setting. The sufferer also exists, somewhere out of visual range, obscured in some way. These results fit with Jung's archetypal character of the Hero. According to Jung (1959), the archetypal hero symbolizes the unity of opposites, the hero heals the sufferer. The Hero, however, exists in a paradox. While human, the Hero is given an elevated quality above others, a semi-godlike persona. Despite this godly position, the Hero fights with human vulnerability and this paradox, according to Jung, is what makes the Hero an attachable figure. The MSF worker's central representation in the images is one that we can assign attachment and meaning to— the healer, highly educated and knowledgeable, a saviour—and thus create a deeper connection with stakeholders. When a donor creates a deeper connection with a character, trust is increased.

The project helps begin to address a gap in the study of social media and imagery in humanitarian aid and charitable giving. The appearance of The Hero in social media imagery driving user engagement in humanitarian aid communication merits further exploration on the effectiveness in driving donor engagement and the societal impacts of such practices including potential unintended consequences of the promotion of racial stereotypes and Western privilege. These social, marketing, and social media related questions about humanitarian aid are ideally situated in macromarketing as the depiction of the "other" in marketing has significant ideological consequences and addresses one of the central tenants of macromarketing; how marketing affects society.

References

Altheide, D. & Schneider, C. (2017). Qualitative Media Analysis. SAGE Publications.

- Ibrahim, Y. (2015). Instagramming life: Banal imaging and the poetics of the everyday. *Journal of Media Practice*, 16(1), 42-54.
- Jung, C. G. (1959). The archetypes and the collective unconscious. In H. Read, M. Fordham, & G. Adler (Eds.), *Collected works*, Vol. 9, Part 1. Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press. (Originally published 1916.)
- Mohring Reestorff, C. (2018). Instagrammable humanitarianism and the politics of guilt. *Journal of Aesthetics & Culture*. 10(2), 83-96.
- Mortensen, M. (2017). Constructing, confirming, and contesting icons: The Alan Kurdi imagery appropriated by #humanitywashedashore, Ai Weiwei, and Charlie Hebdo. *Media, Culture & Society*, 39(8), 1142-1161.

Girls for Sale: How Facebook Community Standards are Implicated in Commercializing Underage Marriage Transactions

Katharine (Kate) Jones, Auckland University of Technology, New Zealand

D. Marama Winder, The Sephira Institute, New Zealand

Cultural contexts with norms emphasising adherence to tradition and customs, especially to webs of kinship relations such as those operating in African communities (Alber, Haberlein and Martin, 2010), determine how easily people can survive. Kinship expectations of people such as facilitating underage marriage transactions are part of long-established cultural forces exerting significant power over the behaviour of men and women (Kumar, 2010). Explicit directions in Article 21 of the African Charter on the Rights and Welfare of the Child (1990) prohibiting child marriage and the betrothal of girls and boys under age 18 provide legal provision to support the prohibitions. However, the consequent trading of especially girls into underage marriage still forms part of local kinship and clan dynamics in many of these communities. According to UNICEF, as far back as the early 1990's (Croll, 2006), gender discrimination against girls has become so routine in so many societies that it forms a pandemic and is virtually invisible (pg. 1285).

Many societies have failed to operationalise girls' rights. The strong focus in development discourse on universal child standards (Croll, 2006) means that gender stereotypes are maintained even within agencies charged with protecting girls.

Facebook and other social media technology platforms (e.g. Twitter, Instagram, and YouTube) have spread rapidly from their origins in the global north and now encompass the world. Globalisation of information and communications technologies is assumed to help societies modernise by giving people access to twenty first century digital technology. The idea of universal modernity (Kumar, 2010) presumes that states have the resources and motivation to provide the conditions necessary so people can make use of the new digital technologies.

Regulatory elements found in all social media platforms such as rules and ways of monitoring user activity all include sanctions for 'bad' user behaviour. Normative elements such as enabling users to evaluate and react to others and their content, and to create virtual social lives underpin the organisational structure and policies that govern the platforms. The regulatory and normative elements converge together to determine the institutional order which underlies the basic business operations (Scott, 2008) of companies such as Facebook or Twitter and YouTube. So, the smooth operation of these organisations relies on rational conditions and rules to govern transactions on the platforms, and that also function to constrain users' behaviour (Arndt, 1981). Constraints on user behaviour are then reflected in the platforms' community standards.

Adults living in cultural contexts where practices such as underage and child marriage prevail (e.g. many African states) are still part of the rapidly growing social media economy. Economic and social transactions are easy for adults to achieve using their Facebook networks; a recent example showed the use of Facebook by male members of the Becheve Clan from rural Obanliku in southern Nigeria to advertise child brides to their user networks[2] (also verified by the BBC at this link:

https://youtu.be/Eu9A6ONxnCU). Clan members posted images of young girls available for "money marriage" onto their own pages, alerting their networks of the opportunity to obtain a girl bride which helps reduce the family debt; and at the same time providing Facebook with valuable data about young girls in an African cultural context. Responses from Facebook to accusations of underage marriage transactions occurring on the platform in 2019 were limited to taking the accounts down as soon as the platform was notified.

Young girls' wellbeing and their quality of life is negatively affected by such money marriage transactions. Community activists (https://www.girlsnotbrides.org/) confirm that the money marriage tradition prevents girls from going to school and allows the trading of girls between husbands in the event that the first husband dies. Girls involved in such child marriage transactions lack basic rights (Scott, Williams, Baker, Brace-Govan, Downey, Hakstian, Henderson, Loroz, and Webb, 2011) and as stakeholders in their own lives also lack access to social justice.

Service businesses (e.g. social media platforms) operating in societies where harmful cultural and social practices prevail such as child marriage, and where such transactions are easily facilitated on their service platforms, could refocus resources in the service towards greater protection of children's basic rights. All social media platforms rely upon the collection of all data about all users because all user data represents value to the businesses and can be rented (Fumagalli, Lucarelli, et al., 2018). In cultural contexts where girls' bodies are used in what Kumar (2010; pg.82) calls "visual commerce," such transactional data represents a rich source of information about local culture that could be rented to interested advertisers.

Facebook's community standards are said to operate to protect vulnerable users from exploitation, and give rise to the operating procedures for platform administrators to monitor content and remove material that violates the standards; details found at this link: https://www.facebook.com/communitystandards/safety

New platform community standards are intended to be specific to markets with deeply-held, historical perceptions about the socio-cultural space that girls can occupy (Kumar, 2010), and that perpetuate and enforce gender relations that lead to girls' subordination (Kumar, 2010). Children represent a special stakeholder group in economies and girl children occupy the most neglected social category in many societies (Croll, 2006). Young consumer well-being and quality of life, especially that of girls, is influenced by their interactions with business. Service businesses such as Facebook and other platform economy participants are profiting from data generated by interactions on their platforms involving the commodification of girls. Such activities are implicated in perpetuating harmful social and cultural practices against a group of the most exploited and vulnerable young consumers.

References

Alber, E., Haberlein, T., and Martin, J. (2010). Changing Webs of Kinship: Spotlights on West Africa. *Africa Spectrum*, 45 (3), continuities, Dislocations and Transformations: 50 Years of Independence in Africa. pp. 43-67.

Croll, E.J. (2006). From the Girl Child to Girls' Rights. Third World Quarterly, 27 (7): 1285-1297.

Kumar, K. (2010). Culture, State and Girls: An Educational Perspective. *Economic and Political Weekly*, 45 (17): 75-84.

- Scott, W.R. (2008). Approaching Adulthood: The Maturing of Institutional Theory. *Theory and Society*, 37 (5): 427-442.
- Scott, L., Williams, J.D., Baker, S.M., Brace-Govan, J., Downey, H., Hakstian, A-M., Henderson, G.R., Loroz, P.S., and Webb, D. (2011). Beyond Poverty: Social Justice in a Global Marketplace. *Journal of Public Policy & Marketing*, 30 (1): 39-46.

FOOD MARKETING Claudia Dumitrescu, Central Washington University, USA Renée Shaw Hughner, Arizona State University, USA



Food Markets and Marketing in Developing Countries: Issues and Implications

Irfan Ahmed, Sam Houston State University, USA

Subashis Ray, Xavier Institute of Management, India

The most basic and durable of human needs is that for food; yet, the consumption and marketing of food has changed over the millennia. At the macro level, the efficient and fair operation of food markets is critical to the well-being of a country's citizens, and should be, along with issues of food security, of paramount concern to policy makers. The purpose of this paper is to identify issues in the ongoing transformation of food markets of developing countries (and business and marketing practices therein) that are of potential importance to businesses, consumers and other stakeholders, and policy makers.

The twentieth century saw the industrialization of food, with the emergence of large scale production, increasing dominance of transnational corporations in both food production and food-service, and an apparent rise in the homogenization of food consumption preferences in the U.S. and subsequently, across other developed country markets. Even as industrial food is facing increasing scrutiny in developed countries, its expansion continues in emerging markets and developing countries. The changing nature of food consumption, markets and marketing brings up numerous issues and concerns.

The existence of generally well-funded regulatory agencies in the United States and Europe, and of vigorous tort-law prosecution are often seen as adequate assurances of quality. However, in developing countries, quality cannot be assumed, due to a lack of trust in the system, and the absence or inadequacy of legal statutes and their implementation. In addition to negligence, malfeasance in the food trade is a real and widely prevalent phenomenon in developing countries. A second area of concern and potential inquiry involves food security for the nation, and the development and maintenance of the food supply chain. With the increase in market power of global commodities traders and food producers, the sovereignty over food policy traditionally exercised by nations continues to decline. While market mechanisms are supposed to lead to the most efficient allocation of resources and to bring about price equilibria, the dangers of inequity of distribution in food and the implications for national public health cannot be overstated.

Considering multiple stakeholders, we develop an agenda for research, focusing attention on several key issues. Among these are:

Does industrialization of the food sector (throughout the supply chain and including food-service) benefit the consumer? Does it necessarily offer benefits of superior quality, absence of adulteration, lower cost and better value?

Can competitive advantage be obtained by firms choosing to adopt the industrial model of food production and marketing in developing countries? What are the sources of this advantage?

What are the intended and unintended effects of the adoption of industrial food production on other stakeholders through the value chain? How can the benefits of the industrial model be distributed to include these stakeholders, and the potentially negative effects be minimized?

What are the implications of the industrial model of food production on market competitiveness and consumer welfare in developing countries?

What are the implications of the industrial model of food production on food security for a developing country?

In conclusion, considering the critical role of food markets, there are several issues that need to be addressed as these markets evolve. Managerial, academic and policy attention needs to be focused on identifying these issues, drawing out their implications on multiple stakeholders, and studying their impacts on markets and societies.

O2O: Friend or Foe for Society?

Sylvain Charlebois, Dalhousie University, Canada Janet Music, Dalhousie University, Canada

According to Fisk (1967), a marketing system operates through exchanges of ownership, risk, information, finance, and possession. Food distribution channels are becoming increasingly complex, trying to adapt to a changing market, looking for convenience. Food delivery applications, also known as Online to Offline (O2O) models, are becoming increasingly popular in the Western World, and Canada. According to a recent survey, 39 percent of all Canadians have tried a food delivery app at least once. Sixty seven percent of Canadians under 34 have used a food delivery app, versus 15 percent for Canadians who are 55 and older. As Canadians look for convenience in food delivery apps, other macromarketing factors ought to be considered. The consequences of modern food marketing practices on vulnerable consumer segments can be significant. In this paper, risks of new marketing food delivery practices, which might create unforeseen or even unforeseeable health risks for food consumers, are evaluated. This overview of the impact of food delivery apps on society, combined with an evaluation of alternative public policy and marketing strategies, are considered.

Culture and Communication for a Wellbeing-Oriented Food

Marketing Strategy

Leonardo Riaño Hernández, Universidad de los Andes, Bogotá, Colombia

Felipe Reinoso-Carvalho, Universidad de los Andes, Bogotá, Colombia

Raffaele Campo, University of Bari, Italy

Andrés Barrios-Fajardo, Universidad de los Andes, Bogotá, Colombia

Altering current food consumption patterns is one of the greatest society challenges in the quest for countervail individual (e.g., obesity; Witkowski, 2007) or societal (e.g., environmental degradation; Sitarz, 1994) problems. Most marketing studies concerning this topic have either focused on individual consumers decision making (Lee et al., 2010), or on the macro-structural level factor that could shape such decision-making process (Thøgersen, 2010), separately. This study aims to link these two levels by analyzing how individuals' macro-cultural factors can affect a consumer's individual micro-hedonic and sensory ones, and thus, the intention to consume a particular product. To better understand how culture and marketing framing can influence consumers' hedonic and sensory food perceptions, we started by hypothesizing that a cultural traditional food product can be perceived differently between local vs foreign consumers, and this is based on their cultural differences and/or knowledge on the local product/culture itself (H1. Local consumers hold hedonic and sensory aspects of a local/traditional snack in higher regard, when compared to foreigners). In this study, we also asked ourselves how marketing communication can frame a consumers' hedonic and sensory perception on traditional food product, according to individual's cultural value system (H2. A well-informed local consumer hold the same local/traditional product in higher regard, when compared to a not so well-informed - but similar type of - local consumer). In summary, we believe that both hypotheses combined prove that, a generally wellinformed consumer will have a more guided, less uncertain and, therefore, a better food experience.

Two experiments were designed. In the first experiment, a comparison between local/Colombians (A), and foreign consumers (B) was conducted, in order to identify differences in the way each group of consumers judge specific characteristics of a local food product. Achira, a Colombian and traditional biscuit/snack was the selected product due to its strong cultural tradition embedded around the country, while not being necessarily associated to any specific brand. Based on a focus group it was uncovered that local Colombian consumers know Achira, consume it regularly, but are not aware of the tradition and formulations behind Achira. Hence, the second experiment was conducted in order to compare the behavior of local 'uninformed' consumers (as those in A) vs. local 'well-informed' ones (local consumers under the influence of a propaganda stimulus, which was produced with the objective of better communicating the traditional elements and formula of Achira; namely C). The methodology was similar in both experiments (controlled pre/post tasting Likert-based evaluative self-report on Achira and packaging relevant hedonic, sensory and purchasing attributes). In total, 245 participants were part of this study (43% women, mean age of 21 years; and 57% men, average age of 22 years; SD=3 for both).

Approximately 80% of the sample were Colombian locals, and the rest foreigners ($N_A = 97$; NB = 51; Nc = 97).

In general, the preliminary results suggest that local culture and communication positively condition the customer evaluative process, while diminishing the uncertainty about a product's features. First, there were several significant differences in the way a local and foreigner evaluated Achira in Experiment 1, while comparing the individual before-and-after ratings, and when comparing the ratings across both group of participants (locals vs foreigners). Second, Experiment 2 suggests that communication further improved the hedonic and satisfaction evaluations of local Colombian consumers, with particularly surprising effects concerning the changes in willingness to pay. Overall, we see a progressive improvement of the customer's experience across both experiments, where the worst experience is reported by the foreigners in Experiment 1 (least informed and unfamiliar with local culture, and the product itself), and the best experience is reported by the well-informed local consumers in Experiment 2.

These results also have interesting and practical implication on healthy promotion choices, as tradition tend to increase perceived quality/satisfaction. In fact, a well-informed consumer (C) seems to have perceived saltiness differently when compared to a least informed one – A, and salt can have an impact on blood pressure. In addition, well-informed local participants () in Experiment 2 were willing to pay around 300 Colombian pesos (COP) more for the same product, when compared to the local uniformed participants (A). Considering the average street-market price of a 17g package of Achira (around \$1000 COP), a striking difference of approximately 30% in price judgment was detected between the local participants that were influenced by the propaganda, and those who weren't. Finally, Achira does not seem to have strong marketing associated to its value proposition, yet. As a matter of fact, the effectiveness of the propaganda that was here provided to one part of the local consumers (C), shows the potential to be explored concerning marketing strategies for Achira (cf. Riaño & Reinoso-Carvalho, forthcoming, where a similar case was assessed with a Colombian chocolate cake). Actually, this report tells us much about how marketing is key while building differences among consumers with, e.g., similar profiles. Marketing, therefore, is a key element in order to communicate and build culture, which then may be useful to differentiate consumers.

References

- Lee J.Y., Kim K.J., Park Y.H., Kim H.R. (2010). Preference and Perception of Korean Foods of Foreign Consumers by Nationality, *Journal of the Korean Society of Food Culture*, 25(1), 9-16.
- Sitarz, D. (1993). Agenda 21: The Earth Summit Strategy To Save Our Planet. New York, USA: Nova Science Publishers.

Riaño, L., & Reinoso-Carvalho, F. (forthcoming) The role of culture in the experience of traditional food products. II encuentro internacional de experiencias empresariales y de investigación en ciencias administrativas de la Universidad del Rosario. 17/18 September, 2020. Bogotá, Colombia.

- Thøgersen, J. (2010). Country differences in sustainable consumption: The case of organic food. *Journal* of Macromarketing, 30(2), 171-185.
- Witkowski, T. H. (2007). Food marketing and obesity in developing countries: analysis, ethics, and public policy. *Journal of Macromarketing*, 27(2), 126-137.

Policy Efforts to Encourage Healthy Food Purchases: Looking More Closely at SNAP Incentives

Renée Shaw Hughner, Arizona State University, USA

Claudia Dumitrescu, Central Washington University, USA

Ashok Mishra, Arizona State University, USA

Recent United States Department of Agriculture (USDA) reports show that almost 37 million Americans (and more than 11 million children) face hunger; additionally, low income consumers do not have consistent access to nutrient-rich foods such as fruits and vegetables (Gretchen Swanson Center for Nutrition 2017). The Gus Schumacher Nutrition Incentive Program (GusNIP) is a federal program, expanded in the 2018 Farm Bill that has made funding available to low-income individuals and households to help them afford, and incent them to buy, fresh fruits and vegetables. GusNIP is a supplemental program that is available in three forms: 1) Supplemental Nutrition Assistance Program (SNAP) Incentives, which uses incentives at the point-of-sale to help SNAP recipients purchase fresh fruits and vegetables at locations such as farmers markets and grocers; 2) Produce Prescription Programs, which are doctor-provided "prescriptions" to low-income individuals for fresh produce in cases to prevent or treat diet-related health conditions; and 3) Centers, which are used to establish education, training and support, and to develop more efficient reporting and evaluations processes in high-need areas. This research examines one instance of the SNAP Incentives form of funding.

GusNIP is jointly administered by the USDA's National Institute of Food and Agriculture (NIFA) and Food and Nutrition Service. The GusNIP program, whose goal is to increase the consumption of fresh fruits and vegetables, among low income individuals, has a plethora of beneficial outcomes at the individual and societal levels. More consumption of fresh produce increases the intake of vitamins, minerals, fiber and other nutrients essential for good health (USDA 2020), as well as potentially replaces empty calories with beneficial ones; better health has been linked with reduced absenteeism and increased worker productivity for adults (Fitzgerald, Kirby, Murphy and Geaney 2016), and increased focus and attention, with better learning outcomes, for children (Pan, Sherry, Park and Blanck 2013). Ultimately, the GusNIP program focuses on preventative health care with a host of positive outcomes.

The acceptance of the SNAP, as well as participation in a GusNIP program, are both done on a voluntary basis. SNAP Incentive funding is awarded on a grant basis to not-for-profit or government agencies; food retailers do not receive funding directly. In this study, the GusNIP grant was received and administered by Produce Perks Midwest, a regional nonprofit whose mission is to increase access to healthy food in under-served communities. The grocer, Louis' Grocery Store (a pseudonym) has elected to accept both the SNAP form of payment and to participate in the Produce Perks Midwest program. Louis' is an employee-owned grocery chain with 13 stores located across a mid-western state. Louis' began its involvement in the Produce Perks program in 2018, expanding the number of participating stores in 2019. The Produce Perks program enables SNAP consumers, who shop at Louis', the ability to double their purchasing power when buying fresh produce. SNAP consumers use their Electronic Benefits Transfer (EBT) card for payment, and a separate electronic digital coupon is automatically printed at the end of the order. There are two available voucher values: for the purchase of fresh produce between \$5

and \$9.99, a voucher of \$5 is printed, and for purchase of fresh produce \$10 or more, a voucher of \$10 is printed. These vouchers can be redeemed only at Louis' and merely for fresh fruits and vegetables. They also have a rolling expiration date with approximately a five-week redemption window. In 2019, Louis' had approximately half of their stores participating in the program, with the goal of getting all of their stores on board.

Upon implementing the program, there were a number of challenges that arose. They included: communicating and educating SNAP recipient consumers about the program, an especially challenging task among a population who tends to have lower rates of literacy and is distrustful of programs, which seem "too good to be true"; educating this market on how to prepare fresh produce; and educating store personnel (e.g., cashiers) on proper responses to inquiry from shoppers (especially challenging, given the high rate of staff turnover). Ultimately, these challenges played out in the coupon redemption rates across the six stores; in 2019, Louis' issued 7,079 coupons, with 2,727 redeemed, translating to a 38.52 percent redemption rate. The monetary value of the coupons issued was \$55,070, with \$22,173 redeemed. This resulted in a monetary value of \$32,897 of free produce that went unclaimed.

Taste, Looks, and Idealization: An Examination of Consumer Ideology in Shanghai's "Celebrity Restaurants"

Jie G. Fowler, Valdosta State University, USA

Rongwei Chu, Fudan University, P.R. China

Ann Veeck, Western Michigan University, USA

China has experienced remarkable economic growth in recent decades, leading to widespread changes in food consumption patterns (Zhou, et al. 2014). Notable trends include higher demand for food diversity and growing consumption of food away from home. Dining out has become a common consumption practice. Restaurants serve as a public space for socialization, to exhibit manners and customs (Finkelstien 1989). The postmodern taste has also become subject to media and cultural construction, interweaving Chinese traditional cuisine with global elements. Local cuisine, American fast food, Japanese sushi, and Korean Barbecue are now all readily available in urban China. Restaurants have become a part of system of social codes providing resources to explore the social meaning of consumption (Gusfield 1997).

A need exists to examine the how the many newly opening (and frequently closing) restaurants in Chinese cities serve to bolster consumer ideology. The meaning of fast food restaurants in China has received some scholarly attention (e.g. Yan 1996; Gao 2014). For example, based upon the examination of McDonald in Beijing, Gao (2014) concluded that, while Chinese society increasingly embraces pluralism, the brand's meaning will continue to be burdened with fragmentation and controversies. However, few studies focus upon the growing diversity of dining establishments opening in China and what they reveal about consumption ideology. Thus, this research focuses on food consumption and consumer ideology in local establishments. To so, we take a netnographic approach to analyzing food consumption patterns and cultural meanings.

The objective of this study is to expand our understanding how food-related activities serve to signal status and nurture consumer ideology in rapidly developing economies (Bourdieu 1994; Gusfield 1997). Through the examination of reviews of Shanghai's top 20 trendy restaurants on popular online sites, we examine patrons' own words to understand how they interpret their relationships with these restaurants. Ultimately, we hope the findings from this research can guide macromarketers in understanding how people negotiate rapid changes through their consumption activities in transitional marketplaces.

References can be provided upon request.

A Conceptual Introduction to an AI-Based Food Marketing System: Navigating Assortment Expansion from Farm to Fork

Priyanka Jayashankar, Iowa State University, USA

Wesley Johnston, Georgia State University, USA

Sree Nilakanta, Iowa State University, USA

Technology has a transformative impact on production and consumption processes with advent of real-time tracking of product flows, RFIDs and customer relationship management tools (Dholakia, Zwigg and Denegri-Knott, 2010.) Technological platforms are changing the way in which producers, consumers and marketers interact and create value in commodity-intensive sectors such as food agriculture.

In recent times, technological disruptions are rapidly transforming the food industry and more agricultural practitioners and food marketers are turning to data science and artificial intelligence for enhancing efficiency, scale and sustainability outcomes (Intel, 2019.) Artificial intelligence, which is a continual endeavor to enhance machine intelligence, currently has several applications across food value chains, spanning ecological stewardship and yield maximization for farmers, food sorting through machine learning capabilities, food safety and product monitoring, product innovation and consumer data analytics (Jayashankar et al, 2018, Charlebois, 2017. Garver, 2018 & Stone et al, 2016.) As a result, assortments of goods, services, experiences and ideas are expanding across the food industry through the advent of AI technology (Layton, 2011).

In view of the rapid developments in digital agriculture and AI applications in the food industry, more scholastic research is needed to determine how AI tools are impacting marketing theory and practice. In this conceptual paper, the authors build on the extant marketing literature by developing a marketing system, which maps out how assortments are expanded and how value creation is transformed from the farm-level (point of production) to the fork-level (final consumption) through the deployment of AI tools. The following research questions are addressed through this study:

1) How does the deployment of AI technology expand assortments for food marketing system actors?

2) How does the expansion of assortments transform the value creation process in an AI-based food marketing system?

References

Charlebois, Sylvain, May 3, 2017, From farm to fork brought to you by artificial intelligence, https://troymedia.com/business/farm-to-fork-artificial-intelligence/

- Dholakia, N., Zwick, D., & Denegri-Knott, J. (2010). Technology, consumers, and marketing theory. Marketing Theory, 1. https://windsorstar.com/opinion/letters/charlebois-column-delivering-ondelivery
- Garver, Krista, April 11, 2018, Six examples of artificial intelligence in the food industry. https://foodindustryexecutive.com/2018/04/6-examples-of-artificial-intelligence-in-the-foodindustry/ https://www.intel.com/content/www/us/en/big-data/lessons-from-the-field.html
- Jayashankar, P., Nilakanta, S., Johnston, W. J., Gill, P., & Burres, R. (2018). IoT adoption in agriculture: the role of trust, perceived value and risk. *Journal of Business & Industrial Marketing*, 33(6), 804-821.
- Layton, R. A. (2011). Towards a theory of marketing systems. *European Journal of Marketing*, 45(1/2), 259-276.
- Stone, P., Brooks, R., Brynjolfsson, E., Calo, R., Etzioni, O., Hager, G., ... & Leyton-Brown, K. AT (2016). *Artificial Intelligence and Life In*, 2030, 2015-2016.

Eating Insects: Acquiring Taste and Shaping Food Desirability

Emily M. Moscato, Saint Joseph's University, USA

Interest in alternative proteins sources as means for supporting food security, protecting the food supply chain, and promoting environmental sustainability, has increased the consideration, evaluation, and exploration of insects as food. Edible insects (approximately 2111 such species have been identified (Jongema 2017) have the advantage of being a source of high-quality protein with lower cholesterol and favorable fatty ratios (Hartmann and Siegrist 2017). Additionally, insects as 'minilivestock' provide scalable production, fewer greenhouse emissions, and the capability to be less resource intensive than traditional proteins through farming in controlled conditions (Huis et al. 2013).

For edible insects to become a viable food sector, agricultural, food policy, regulatory, and marketing support is required from industry, academia, and governments. Research in Europe has been supported by country-level government initiatives and in the United States, to a smaller extent, through the USDA which is encouraging a systems approach "to addressing the interacting elements of agricultural production including genetics, environment, management and post-harvest/socioeconomic factors as a whole, and not just as a collection of parts" (Mason et al. 2018). From a macromarketing perspective, an understanding of the social mechanisms at play for the acceptance and integration of edible insects is critical in order to influence acceptance across society (Layton 2015).

The negative biases towards insects—and importantly those who eat insects—influences policy, access, and positioning of edible insects, their production, and the possible integration of this protein source into "Western" diets (nations and regions with large European ethnic presence, including Europe, United States, Canada, and Australia). Using an exploratory mix method design, this research examines how consumers categorize those who eat insects in contrast to more traditional foods. In so doing, it seeks to understand the macro, meso, and micro barriers persisting in Western cultures against consuming insects and to determine ways of positioning edible insects for end consumers and for food system decision makers.

Preliminary findings demonstrate an antithetical 'meat paradox.' That is, unlike traditional animal protein sources where consumers separate the animal from the meat consumers eat (creating the 'meat paradox'; Loughnan, Haslam, and Bastian 2010), participants imagine eating insects whole and often imagining them alive. This disruptive image for many is transferred to the insect-eater who is described as flouting norms, in stigmatizing and othering terms, and as having qualities that are insect-like (such as fidgety, wild, thick skinned) when contrasted with conventional diet and vegan diet. Possible consequences of these findings on market systems and social acceptance of insects as food is discussed along with further findings.

References

Hartmann, Christina and Michael Siegrist (2017), "Consumer perception and behaviour regarding sustainable protein consumption: A systematic review," *Trends in Food Science & Technology*, 61, 11–25.

- Huis, A. van, J. Van Itterbeeck, H. Klunder, E. Mertens, A. Halloran, G. Muir, and P. Vantomme (2013), "Edible insects: future prospects for food and feed security," Rome: Food and Agriculture Organization of the United Nations.
- Jongema, Yde (2017), "List of edible insects of the world (April 1, 2017)," Wageningen University & Research, (accessed February 16, 2020), [available at https://www.wur.nl/en/Research-Results/Chair-groups/Plant-Sciences/Laboratory-of-Entomology/Edible-insects/Worldwide-species-list.htm].
- Layton, Roger A. (2015), "Formation, Growth, and Adaptive Change in Marketing Systems," *Journal of Macromarketing*, 35 (3), 302–19.
- Loughnan, Steve, Nick Haslam, and Brock Bastian (2010), "The role of meat consumption in the denial of moral status and mind to meat animals," *Appetite*, 55 (1), 156–59.
- Mason, Joel B., Richard Black, Sarah L. Booth, Andrew Brentano, Bill Broadbent, Peggy Connolly, John Finley, Jarrod Goldin, Tim Griffin, Kelly Hagen, Julie Lesnik, Gabi Lewis, Zhongli Pan, Juan Morales Ramos, Mark Ranalli, Guadalupe Rojas, Marianne Shockley, Valerie J. Stull, and Dariusz Swietlik (2018), "Fostering Strategies to Expand the Consumption of Edible Insects: The Value of a Tripartite Coalition between Academia, Industry, and Government," *Current Developments in Nutrition*, 2 (8). doi:10.1093/cdn/nzy056

Top Macromarketing Lessons of the COVID-19 Outbreak

Hong Zhu, Northeast Normal University, Changchun, China

Hu Xie, Western Michigan University, USA

Ann Veeck, Western Michigan University, USA

Widespread epidemics and pandemics have occurred throughout history, with severe human, economic, and social consequences. Recent worldwide epidemics have included Severe Acute Respiratory Syndrome (SARS) (2003), H5N1 (Avian Flu) (2004), Western African Ebola virus (2013-2016), and the Zika virus (2015). In 2020, the novel coronavirus (COVID-19) is the most dangerous health emergency in recent history, with the World Health Organization (WHO) announcing on March 11 that COVID-19 is officially a pandemic. Epidemics and pandemics, particularly ones requiring quarantines, not only cause widespread illness and death but can lead to acute interruption of economic systems and everyday consumption activities. While, at least, a limited amount of consumer research focuses on disasters, both natural (e.g. tornadoes, hurricanes, and tsunamis) (Baker et al. 2007; Klein and Huang 2007; Leonard and Scammon 2007) and man-made (e.g. wars) (Schultz et al. 2005), almost no consumer research can be found related to epidemics.

The purpose of this study is to examine the dynamics of protective behavior in an emergency, through an investigation of changes in food consumption behavior during a wide-spread, deadly epidemic. Specifically, this research aims to understand how people's sense of agency affects alterations in food consumption patterns in an emergency. Bandura (2009, p.1175) defines human agency as the human capability "to effect change in themselves and their situations through their own efforts." Applying human agency to consumption behavior, consumer agency might be defined as "the human capability to effect change in themselves and their situations through consumption activities." With agency, humans are not just a product of their life circumstances but an active influencer of their world (Bandura 2006). Consumer agency references the situated capacity that people have at their disposal to exercise control over events via consumption practices, depending on the opportunities and constraints of the historical moments through which individuals live. Due to the interruptions of traditional marketing channels, often accompanied by emergence of alternative marketing channels, an epidemic provides a natural environment by which to study how sense of agency affects what types of coping strategies are employed to exercise control in chaotic environments.

Specifically, the objectives of this research are to determine alterations in food consumption patterns during an epidemic, including:

- 1. What market alternatives for provisioning food emerge, and how enduring are these options?
- 2. What is the nature of food hoarding behavior in an emergency and does this behavior have lasting consequences?
- 3. What types of food gain favor or disfavor in an epidemic--e.g. comfort food, health food, snacks, fast food, etc.? Why?

- 4. What types of food consumption behavior that are perceived to be preventative or protective emerge?
- 5. What types of food consumption behavior increase individuals' sense of control?
- 6. How does food consumption behavior differ according to basic demographics--i.e. gender, profession, age, income, urban/rural status, and household composition?
- 7. How do food consumption patterns of people vary according to the geographical and relational closeness of infected victims?

To explore how sense of agency affects food consumption patterns in an epidemic, a team of American and Chinese researchers conducted a survey of adult consumers in China at the height of the Coronavirus (19-CONVID) from February 15 to February 23, 2020. Using snowball sampling, the survey was administered throughout Mainland China, but, to allow a geographical comparison, four areas were oversampled: Beijing, Jilin, Fujian, and Hubei. The survey yielded over 1,000 high quality responses, including over 150 from Hubei Province (the site of the initial breakout of the virus). The survey asks a number of questions related to how food consumption behaviors have been altered during the epidemic, including changes in food shopping, preparation, and consumption practices. Topics includes scales that examine the risk profile of consumers, including sense of agency, coping strategies, and anxiety levels, both at the general and the food-focused level. Standard demographics are part of the questionnaire, such as age, occupation, income, and household composition. Respondents were also asked how relationally and physically close they are to known virus-infected patients. The survey included eight open-ended questions related to how eating and shopping patterns have changed during the epidemic.

Based on the survey results, including both quantitative and qualitative data, the presentation will highlight the most important macromarketing lessons learned from the coronavirus epidemic. The results from our study has the potential to assist government officials, health authorities, and manufacturers and retailers in anticipating how consumers will react in epidemics, allowing improved preparation and response in subsequent epidemics. Recommendations will be made related to the nature and structure of marketing systems that can be designed and mobilized in an emergency, and, potentially, on a more permanent basis. In addition, this research aims to extend a theory of consumer agency by examining the dynamics of agency during an emergency.

References

- Baker, Stacey Menzel, David M. Hunt, and Terri L. Rittenburg (2007), "Consumer vulnerability as a shared experience: Tornado recovery process in Wright, Wyoming," *Journal of Public Policy & Marketing*, 26 (1), 6-19.
- Bandura, Albert (2006), "Toward a Psychology of Human Agency," *Perspectives on Psychological Science*, 1(2), 164-180.
- Klein, Jill G., and Laura Huang (2007), "After All Is Lost: Meeting the Material Needs of Adolescent Disaster Survivors," *Journal of Public Policy & Marketing*, 26, (1), 54-59.
- Leonard, Hillary A., and Debra L. Scammon (2007), "No Pet Left Behind: Accommodating Pets In Emergency Planning," *Journal of Public Policy & Marketing*, 26 (1), 49-53.

- Nuwer, Rachel (2018). "What If a Deadly Influenza Pandemic Broke Out Today?" BBC Future, November 22, https://www.bbc.com/future/article/20181120-what-if-a-deadly-influenza-pandemicbroke-out-today, accessed on February 23, 2020.
- Shultz, Clifford J., Timothy J. Burkink, Bruno Grbac, and Nataša Renko (2005), "When Policies and Marketing Systems Explode: An Assessment of Food Marketing in the War-Ravaged Balkans and Implications for Recovery, Sustainable Peace, and Prosperity," *Journal of Public Policy & Marketing*, 24 (1), 24-37.

Peers' and Siblings' Influences on Teenagers' Preferences for Brand Name Food Products

Hongli Zhang, Jilin University, China

Ruiqin Li, Jilin University, China

Ann Veeck, Western Michigan University, USA

This study tests the relationships among eating with peers, peer identity, and preference for brand name food products for Chinese teenagers. The findings are based on a survey of 834 urban Chinese teenagers, divided among 8th, 10th, and 12th graders and among three different tiers of schools (top, lower, suburban). A mediated moderation model was tested. The results show that eating with peers is positively related to preference for brand name food products, with the relationship mediated positively by peer identity. The non-only-child or only-child status of teenagers has no significant influence on the relationships. These results reinforce the need to strongly consider the role of social identity for understanding the development of long-term eating habits. In addition, the results from this study challenge the received wisdom that growing up as only children has affected the behavior of an entire generation of Chinese consumers. Rather, what may be much more important are the dramatic social and economic changes that have been experienced in recent years by all consumers—with or without siblings.

Health Promotion and Welfare in the Context of Urban Agriculture in a Brazilian City: An Approach on Food Desert under Lens of Practice Theory

Breno Giordane dos Santos Costa, Pontifical Catholic University of Minas Gerais, Brazil

Marcelo de Rezende Pinto, Pontifical Catholic University of Minas Gerais, Brazil

Bruno Medeiros Ássimos, Pontifical Catholic University of Minas Gerais, Brazil

Vulnerable consumers who face difficulties in accessing quality food may live in a kind of food desert. To address these difficulties, community urban gardens, as initiatives related to urban agriculture activities, may emerge as solutions. It is a practice to understand how individuals involved in the production and consumption of urban community gardens can have their lives transformed through the emergence of a new social practice. For this, an exploratory research and qualitative methodological strategy was carried out in the community garden of Betim, Minas Gerais, Brazil. The results were divided into two categories of analysis, which were: a) health as a tangible benefit of the practice and b) well-being as an intangible benefit of the practice. That is, the individuals who were involved with the practice of urban agriculture in the studied context had positive changes in their lives with regard to health and the feeling of general well-being.

The Vulnerability of the Young Adult Consumer to Food Consumption and its Relationship with Nutritional Interest

Bruno Medeiros Ássimos, Pontifical Catholic University of Minas Gerais, Brazil

Marcelo de Rezende Pinto, Pontifical Catholic University of Minas Gerais, Brazil

Adriana Ventola Marra, Federal University of Viçosa, Brazil

One of the major dietary problems in Brazil refers to being overweight, which in a survey conducted by the Brazilian Institute of Geography and Statistics, affects about 25.4% of adolescents and 53.8% of adults. One of the factors that aggravate this situation is the vulnerability that the consumer may face, especially certain groups. Thus, this work sought to measure the vulnerability of young adults between 18 and 24 years old using the vulnerability scale proposed by Chi et al. (2017), relating it to the scale of nutritional interest of Balasubramanian & Cole (2002), obtaining n = 564. It was possible to identify more evidence of significance between product knowledge and nutritional interest, reinforcing the importance of information for the satisfactory evaluation of consumers and the reduction of their vulnerability.

FORCIBLY DISPLACED COMMUNITIES & MARKETING SYSTEMS Stefanie Beninger, IE University, Spain Beatriz de Quero Navarro, Universidad Loyola Andalucía, Spain Marcos Ferreira Santos, Universidad de La Sabana, Colombia



The Role of Aid-Agencies in Stimulating the Food Retail Market in the Time of Social Conflicts: The Case of Syrian Refugees in Lebanon

Hossein Eslami, Lebanese American University, Lebanon

The influx of Syrian refugees has had a major impact on the Lebanese economy including on its food retail market. In this study, we empirically investigate the impact of the influx of refugees on the food retailers' strategies in Lebanon. We statistically compare the retailing mix (Gauri et al. 2008) of the supermarkets in two regions of Lebanon. The results show that the supermarkets in the regions with refugee concentration have adapted their retailing strategies in response to the refugee influx. The role of international aid-agencies in stimulating the food retail sector via market-based solutions is shown to be significant with benefits for the refugees as well as the local communities. The findings of this study would have implications for the retail managers in adapting to the social conflicts as well for the policy makers and international aid-agencies in coming up with policy packages incorporating business and marketing lenses.

References

Gauri, Dinesh Kumar, Minakshi Trivedi, and Dhruv Grewal (2008), "Understanding the Determinants of Retail Strategy: An Empirical Analysis," *Journal of Retailing*, 84(3), 256-267.

Integration of Skilled Immigrants (SIs) in Finland: Examining the "Business Lead" Program through the Lenses of Acculturation

Helena Hinke Dobrochinski Candido, University of Helsinki, Finland

Pia Polsa, Hanken School of Economics, Finland

James Anyan, University of Helsinki, Finland

Sanne Bor, Hanken School of Economics, Finland

Maria Sääksjärvi, Delft University of Technology, the Netherlands

After the influx of migrants in 2015 to EU different policies and programs facilitate immigrant's integration to the Finnish society and workforce. This article investigates the integration of skilled immigrants (SIs) into the labor market in Finland, focusing on the role of a pre-employment support program. We rely on an interdisciplinary study to examine the acculturation strategies of SIs who participated in the "Business Lead" Integration Program, following a mixed-methods approach. "Business Lead" program is an award winning program for asylum seekers and immigrants in Finland (https://www.hankensse.fi/programmes/integration-program-business-lead). Our findings indicate that the "Business Lead" program influenced participants' acculturation strategies, whereas the length of stay in Finland positively correlates to coping strategies. Additionally, we identified three main obstacles to the full integration of SIs in Finland: the language barrier, the discriminatory attitudes and cultural identity conflicts or plural cultural identities. While the program itself is a success among the participants macro issues in Finnish society prevent the acculturation and integration of immigrant and refugees alike. Our study offers valuable contribution to the literature on migration research from the macro perspective, aiming to provide subsidies for policymaking and practice concerning the integration of SIs.

The Economic Lives and Marketing Systems of Refugees in Settlements: A Systematic Literature Review and Future Research Trajectory

Stefanie Beninger, IE University, Spain

An important avenue for research for macromarketing is furthering understanding of the lives of refugees (Shultz et al. 2020). Many refugees find themselves in refugee settlements, also known as camps or hosting areas, in other countries. Despite some emerging work, not much is known about the economic lives of refugees in these settlements. Understanding their economic lives is important as it can inform development approaches and solutions to create sustainable economic opportunities for displaced peoples (Betts et al., 2014). Towards this end, this present work conducts and presents a systematic literature review, drawing upon academic work from a myriad of disciplines, as well as practitioner-based work, to do so. Understanding marketing systems within refugee camps is essential to provide the first steps towards a future research trajectory into these largely previously unexplored marketing system sites.

References

- Betts, Alexander, Louise Bloom, Josiah David Kaplan, and Naohiko Omata (2014), *Refugee Economies: Rethinking Popular Assumptions*, Oxford: University of Oxford, Refugee Studies Centre.
- Shultz, Clifford, Andres Barrios, Alexander V. Krasnikov, Ingrid Becker, Aronté M. Bennett, Renu Emile, Maria Hokkinen, Julia R. Pennington, Marcos Santos, and Jaime Sierra (2020), "The Global Refugee Crisis: Pathway for a More Humanitarian Solution," *Journal of Macromarketing*, https://doi.org/10.1177/0276146719896390

From Behavioral Micro-Choices to Macro Decision-Making: Macromarketing Implications of Consumer Animosity for the Inclusion of Refugees in Lebanon

Beatriz de Quero Navarro, Universidad Loyola Andalucía, Spain

Karine Aoun Barakat, Université Saint Joseph de Beyrouth, Lebanon

Clifford J. Shultz, II, Loyola University Chicago, USA

Rafael Araque Padilla, Universidad Loyola Andalucía, Spain

María José Montero Simó, Universidad Loyola Andalucía, Spain

Lebanon is a dynamic and distressed macromarketing context. After becoming the country with the highest number of refugees per capita (UNHCR 2019), a systemic study will enable us to understand its complexity beyond dyadic commercial exchange between refugee employees and local customers (e.g., Layton 2019; Shultz et al. 2020). Building upon the authors' earlier work (DeQuero-Navarro et al. 2019), the main objective of this phase is to understand better the complexity of micro-marketing results from a Lebanese consumer behavior model tested, and ultimately to discover solutions that could result in the integration of refugees in the Lebanese marketing systems, in ways acceptable to many stakeholders. Such discovery has implications for decision-making by NGOs, businesses and governments – i.e., key catalytic institutions (e.g., Shultz, Rahtz, and Sirgy 2017) -- that are indispensable to affect prosocial inclusion of the Syrian refugees in Lebanon, in ways expedient and humanitarian in the short run, to the greatest possible benefit of all stakeholders in the longer run.

References

- DeQuero-Navarro, Beatriz, Karine Aoun Barakat, Clifford J. Shultz, Rafael Araque Padilla, and Maria Jose Montero Simo (2019), "How Do Consumers Behave during Intercultural Service Encounters in Lebanon? The Case of Syrian Refugee Employees," 44thAnnual Macromarketing Conference, T. Facca-Miess, N. Santos & A. Kennedy, eds., John Carroll University & the Macromarketing Society, 271-76.
- Layton, Roger A. (2019), "Marketing Systems. Looking Backward, Sizing up and Thinking Ahead," Journal of Macromarketing, 20 (10), 1-17.
- Shultz, Clifford J., Don R. Rahtz, and M. Joseph Sirgy (2017), "Distinguishing flourishing from distressed communities: Vulnerability, resilience and a systemic framework to facilitate wellbeing." In: Phillips R, Wong C (ed.). *The handbook of community well-being*. Springer, Dordrecht, pp.403-22.

- Shultz, Clifford J., Andres Barrios, Alexander V. Krasnikov, Ingrid Becker, Aronte M. Bennett, Renu Emile, Maria Hokkinen, Julia R. Pennington, Marcos Santos, and Jaime Sierra (2020), "The Global Refugee Crisis: Pathway for a More Humanitarian Solution," *Journal of Macromarketing*, 1-16.
- UNHCR (2019), "Syria Regional Refugee Response," Operational Portal, Refugee Situation. New York, USA.

Venezuelan Refugee Crisis and Humanitarian Marketing Systems on Colombia

Marcos Ferreira Santos, Universidad de La Sabana, Colombia.

This article proposes an application of the concept of humanitarian marketing systems applied to the Venezuelan refugee crisis on Latin America, analyzing the Colombian case. By means of a presentation of the Venezuelan crisis and a discussion of the concept of marketing systems, an example of application of the humanitarian marketing system for Venezuelans on Colombia is presented and discussed. By analyzing the aspect of stakeholders on Colombia that form a humanitarian marketing system responding to the Venezuelan refugee crisis this article aims to present an application to investigation of humanitarian marketing systems.

GENDER AND INTERSECTIONALITIES: ADVANCING MACROMARKETING TOPICS AND THEORETICAL PERSPECTIVES Laurel Steinfield, Bentley University, USA Nacima Ourahmoune, KEDGE Business School, France Pilar Rojas Gaviria, University of Birmingham, UK



«New Fathers» Reshaping the Marketplace: A Focus on Single-Fathers Families

Martin Chour, EDHEC Business School, France

Marie-Hélène Fosse-Gomez, Université de Lille, France

Nowadays, a record number of households are run by single fathers in most Western countries. In France, where one family over five is a single-parent family, 25% of minor children are living with their fathers in permanent residence or shared custody, according to the French ministry of justice (2018). Whereas some brands, such as Soupline and P&G, have lately started taking into consideration the emergence of single fathers' households in their communication strategies, and representing the nurturing role of fathering in their advertising, a research gap still exists in marketing and consumer behavior on this type of families and on the multiple identities of fatherhood. This research aims to explore how single fathers manage family consumption without a feminine presence within their families and how the emergence of new ways of fathering are reshaping the marketplace. In a French cultural context, our study investigates the transforming meanings of fatherhood. We explore how consumption practices contribute to the construction of fatherhood. We identify as well the role of retailers in the acculturation of fathers in the domestic sphere, a field traditionally perceived as feminine.

"No Pain, no Gain": Consumption and Masculinities in Road Cycling

Ronan Torres Quintão, Instituto Federal de Educação e Tecnologia de São Paulo, Brazil

Severino Joaquim Nunes Pereira, Federal Rural University of Rio de Janeiro - UFRRJ, Brazil

In the last decades, studies about the intersection between consumption and masculinity have increased in the Marketing field. A variety of studies in consumer culture theory and Macromarketing fields have looked at masculinity as socially constructed, following a critical political line in gender research. Examining masculine representation in advertising, Gentry & Harrison (2010) and Ostergard (2010) show, for example, how the Harley Davidson subculture enacts hegemonic values of masculinity, such as machismo (Schouten & McAlexander, 1995) or Groups of men negotiate their masculine consumer identities in social interaction (Hein et al., 2016).

In the new era, men constantly have their masculinity challenged by socioeconomic changes and react demonstrating their masculinity in extreme ways such as compensatory consumption. Witkowski (2020) analyzes compensatory consumption in the United States from a historical perspective. The research illustrates many categories of compensatory consumption associated with hegemonic masculinity. Kidd (2013) informs that activities as violent or high stands sports have remained decidedly masculine.

Research Method and Context

We address the research question through five years of ethnography in the road cycling context in Brazil. Increasingly popular in this country, this practice brings men from different walks of life on a regular basis into contact. During the week, they are white-collar professionals with responsible jobs, families and mortgages to pay. Come the weekend, they transform into Lycra-clad super heroes (MAMIL: Middle-Aged Men In Lycra), road warriors on expensive carbon framed bikes racing in bunches and competing with other men for dominance in the group. O'Connor and Brown (2007) called the cyclists who take part in such bunch rides "weekend warriors".

In bunches, cyclists ride on public roads in tight formation, typically in rows of one (if the road is narrow) or two (when there is a road shoulder). While bunches may be informally organized, operating outside the formal structures and hierarchies of the sport, they respond as a collective. O'Connor and Brown (2007) inform that cyclist informally 'compete' when they ride in a bunch. To study this context, the first author joined different road cycling groups, totalizing 1.600 hours of participant observation and about 40,000 kms (27.96 miles) of cycling. During the rides, which take from 1 to 5 hours, he took extensive field notes and engaged in casual conversations with different members of the community. The strong rapport created with informants, who are mainly men, gave the first author access to private conversations among cyclists in social media platforms such as Strava, Facebook, and WhatsApp. Throughout the data collection, the second author regularly interacted with the first author, and they jointly identified patterns in the emergent data by using a hermeneutic approach (Thompson 1997).

Analysis and Discussion

Road cycling is a socially constructed and contested activity intertwined with the cycling industry and a site of competing meanings, interpretations, and social hierarchies. Male cyclists compete against each other for domination over other men by showing superior physical abilities. The values of the road cycling subculture are competition, suffering, and the naturalization of accidents and physical risks. Cyclists who want to be part of the high performance bunch must incorporate the tribe symbols: they shave legs, they wear trademark team lycra as worn by professionals as the uniform of choice, they use bike equipment and objects used by the peloton riders as much as possible, they ride (pilotage) as the bunch does, and they keep training to avoid getting dropped from the bunch they use to ride with. Embedded in a patriarchal and chauvinistic society, these values reproduce the dominant ideology of hegemonic masculinity where man must be competitive and stronger than others. Road cyclists compete with each other on the roads to develop their hegemonic masculinity projects: (1) becoming a hero and (2) super hero. The masculinity projects are built and constructed together, collectively. Men invested in these two distinct projects often depend on each other, for example, when they jointly take on specific formations (bunch) to improve one another's performances, when they take turns in leading the group to break wind resistance (super hero), or when they stay behind the front wheel saving energy because of the slipstream (becoming a hero).

This research contributes to the marketing field by highlighting the strategies used by consumers in collective consumer experiences (bunch of cyclists) to develop specific masculinity projects (becoming a hero and being super hero). By exploring the interplay between these two projects of masculinity in the same consumption experience, we have shed further light on the relational character of the construction of masculinity.

References

- Gentry, J., & Harrison, R. (2010). Is advertising a barrier to male movement toward gender change? *Marketing Theory*, 10(1), 74–96.
- Hein, Wendy; Steinfield, Laurel; Ourahmoune, Nacima; Coleman, Catherine A.; Zayer, Linda Tuncay and Littlefield, Jon (2016). Gender Justice and the Market: A Transformative Consumer Research Perspective. *Journal of Public Policy & Marketing*, 35(2), 223-236.
- B. Kidd (2013). Sports and masculinity. Journal of Sport in Society. 16 (4), 553-564.
- O'Connor, J. P., & Brown, T. D. (2007). Real cyclists don't race. International Review for the Sociology of Sport, 42, 83-97.
- Schouton, M. and Alexander, J. (1995). Subcultures of Consumption: An Ethnographic of the New Bikers. *Journal of Consumer Research*. 22, 43-61.
- Thompson, C. J. (1997). Interpreting consumers: a hermeneutical framework for deriving insights from the texts of consumers' consumption stories. *Journal of Marketing Research*, 34 (1997), 438–55.
- Witkowski, T. (2020), Male Compensatory Consumption in American History. 3 (January), 1-18.

Where Agism and the Feminization of Poverty Meet: A South American Perspective

Laurel Steinfield, Bentley University, USA

James W. Gentry, University of Nebraska-Lincoln, USA

Poverty affects the lives of many consumers in the world. This manuscript is an extension of Gentry and Steinfield (2017), which attempted to put a face on poverty. There is a great deal of marketing literature on poverty, but most of this marketing-related literature neglects important intersectional identities or market segmentation factors. This is despite a rich stream of literature outside of marketing that finds that there are far more poor women than men. Given that not all women are poor, there is a need to delve deeper into this category of 'women.' Gentry and Steinfield (2017) made initial efforts in this vein by trying to put a more-specific face on poverty. While the 'face' in the US does include single mothers, when we look globally, the face in some emerging and developing economies (particularly those with inadequate social safety nets) is more likely to belong to an older female. The purpose of this paper is to develop the argument further, and investigate the context of South American elderly women in general and Colombian women when data are available.

Measures

Measuring the level of poverty is not a straightforward task. Data accuracy deficiencies are rampant in the international context, and income data are especially questionable. There is also the issue of accuracy, as there is evidence that incomes are underreported. For example, DeVos and Zaidi (1997) found that, in five member states of the EU, that total average income as reported in the Household Budget Surveys is lower than the average total expenditures, suggesting a considerable degree of underreporting of income in those member states.

Additionally, a significant cause of inaccurate data related to global poverty is the presence of informal economies in every country. As inferred above, given that income is taxed and that one of the few global generalities is that people wish to avoid paying taxes, income is underreported. In the developed world, sizable informal economies from illegal activities dealing with drugs and prostitution exist and are part of the informal economy; these are also due to house painters being paid in cash which they do not report or with an accountant trading tax work for the household's dental work. The informal economies in the developing world are much larger, as one or more of a person's jobs is (are) often not documented. Thus, poverty measures based solely on reported income may be very inaccurate.

These problems with measuring 'poverty,' in turn, affect the findings of this manuscript. It is a limitation we raise so that readers may be aware that what we report below may be affected by data accuracy, comparability, and incompleteness (e.g., the fact that most countries do not break down the data by both gender and age).

Given that we draw from a variety of datasets that are not always commensurate, we caution readers to be aware of the 'cutoffs' we report as, depending on the (limited) dataset used, "elderly" has different age cutoffs. In general, the UN uses 60 or older, whereas more developed countries with older retirement ages (such as the US) report data on those 65 or older.

The Global Perspective

We will begin with a global overview of the status of the elderly and of women, and summarize some of the contributing factors to their heightened risks of living in poverty before we delve in to the nuances of poverty among older women in South American countries.

Starting with demographic trends, we note that part of the higher levels of poverty among older women is because women, on average, have a greater life expectancy than men. The majority of people over 60 are female. They account for 55% of those over 60 in India, 59% in China, 63-66% in the US and Europe, 70% in Korea, and 76% in Russia. Of those living alone in Africa, 68% are female while 57% of those living alone in Latin America are female (United Nations 2018). In developing countries, female life expectancy is closer to that of males because the lower status of women results in inadequate nutrition and lack of access to health care (Zahidi 2012). The trend of an increasing aging population, although often viewed as a developed country phenomenon, stands to affect emerging and developing economies severely, perpetuating poverty levels among the elderly. Many countries with emerging economies are graying more rapidly than the US, Europe, and even Japan. This aging of the world is, in part, explained by two key factors: longer life expectancy and lower fertility rates. Until the 20th century, the average life expectancy globally was 30 (Williams and Krakauer 2012). Advances in medicine and public health have lengthened life expectancy in both developed and developing nations. Between 1950-55 and 2005-10, average life expectancy in developed nations increased from 66.0 to 77.8 years; in developing nations it was even more dramatic, rising from 51.7 to 67.7 (Romay and Sandberg 2012).

Both older men and women may encounter physical, mental, and income-related challenges as they age, but older women also face the cumulative effects of gender discrimination throughout their lives, including lower earnings and valuation of 'women's' work, less control over financial matters, lower levels of financial literacy, lower pensions, and less access to resources such as education, health services and limited rights to land ownership. These effects are what others have noted as the lifetime effects of a 'feminization of poverty' (e.g., Chant 2012; Gentry and Steinfield 2017).

While accessibility to education for females is improving globally, education opportunities were not available for many of today's elderly women, resulting in an under-development of their skill sets. Consequentially, the historical and ongoing effects of inequalities and misrecognition of women's work can put women, particularly elderly women, at risk for poverty if their male companions pass away or fail to provide.

The South American Context

Literacy is not a major problem in South American, as most countries there have literacy rates over 90% for both men and women. In four countries (Argentina, Brazil, Uruguay, and Venezuela), the female literacy rate is slightly higher than the male one (UNESCO 2015). On the other hand, most of the world's illiteracy is female, but it is largely limited to Sub-Saharan Africa and South Asia.

While education efforts in the continent are evident, poverty issues are also evident, especially for older women. Over the next 15 years, the number of people over 60 is expected to grow fastest in Latin America and the Caribbean with a projected increase of 71% (United Nations 2015). Progress has been made in women's inclusion in non-contributory pension programs in the region, leading to the inclusion of differences in patterns of women's and men's paid and unpaid work in the calculation of state pensions (United Nations 2015). However, the female benefits are typically of lower amounts and do not allow women to overcome situations of poverty (ECLAC 2019). Colombia is not a leader in the provision of pensions to the elderly, though its pensions are distributed more equitably than by most of its neighbors.

However, when we investigate the composition of those in extreme poverty using the Femininity Index (the ratio of women to men), we note that any sense of equity in Colombia appears to be disappearing, as extreme poverty in Colombia is increasingly becoming female and urban. While the education levels of younger females indicate that progress is being made in terms of gender equity in South America, evidence is lacking to conclude that older women are facing good situations.

What's Being Done

The Gender Equality Observatory for Latin America and the Caribbean was established in 2008 with the goal of making Latin American women more autonomous. The first actions taken to tackle gender inequity in Latin America took the form of equal opportunity policies. However, the disparate starting point facing women did not make opportunities equal, as women entering the public sphere did so without shedding their responsibilities in the private sphere (ECLAC 2017). The second set of actions involved mainstreaming, a gender perspective emphasizing the assessment of the implications for women and men of any planned action. For example, law #1450, article 177 passed in Colombia in 2011 declared that the will of the government is to adopt a national policy for gender equity. The country has a quota establishing that 30% of administrative positions are to be filled by women. In 2014, 60% of the administrative bodies countrywide were found to have met that requirement. While these steps have been impressive in Latin America in terms of the education of women and the provision of child care, the coverage of efforts to reduce poverty did not mention the elderly (ECLAC 2017).

One very positive policy recommendation would be for governments to adopt the practice of gender budgeting advocated by the World Bank and the IMF. Gender budgeting attempts to quantify how policies can affect men and women differently (Economist 2017a). A 2016 report from the British House of Commons Library, estimated that, in 2010-2015, British women bore 85% of the costs introduced by government's austerity measures and its attempt to "save" funds in the British Treasury (Economist 2017b). The cuts in welfare benefits and in direct taxes disproportionately affected women as they earn less, rely more on welfare benefits, and are much more likely than men to be single parents. Instead of being gender-neutral, such government policies have been referred to as "gender ignorant" (Economist 2017b) or "gender blind" (Elson 2002). The current Covid-19 pandemic has resulted in a great loss of service-related jobs, which are held primarily by women.

The logic behind gender budgeting should appeal greatly to macromarketers. Short-term budget fixes that generate more serious problems in the future are to be avoided. More than 90 nations have tried some version of gender budgeting, with somewhat mixed results (Downes et al. 2017). Where the efforts were led by non-government entities (Australia, South Africa, and Tanzania), the efforts proved futile when changes in governments took policy in different directions. At the same time, there have been some promising successes (Austria, the state of Kerala in India, Mexico, the Philippines, South Korea, Sweden, and Uganda). One of the most challenging problems faced, as we mentioned earlier, is the unavailability of gender-disaggregated data (only Sweden provided significant availability (Downes et al. 2017)). As macromarketers, we need to identify the face of poverty and then advocate for gender budgeting policies that deal specifically with that segment of society. We advocate the use of gender budgeting so that the policies developed will be more beneficial to those actually in poverty. The most common face in poverty globally is that of an older woman.

References

Chant, Sylvia (2012). "Feminization of Poverty," In *The Wiley-Blackwell Encyclopedia of Globalization*. John Wiley & Sons, Ltd. Available at:

http://onlinelibrary.wiley.com/doi/10.1002/9780470670590.wbeog202/abstract (accessed 11 January 2017).

- DeVos, K and M.A. Zaidi (1997), "Equivalence Scale Sensitivity of Poverty Statistics for the Member States of the European Community," *Review of Income and Wealth*, 43(3): 319–333.
- Downes, Ronnie, Lisa von Trapp, and Scherie Nicol (2017), "Gender Budgeting in OECD Countries," http://www.oecd.org/gender/Gender-Budgeting-in-OECD-countries.pdf
- ECLAC (Economic Commission for Latin America and the Caribbean) (2017), "Gender Equality Plans in Latin America and the Caribbean: Road Maps for Development," United Nations, Santiago.
- ECLAC (2019), "Women in the Pension Systems of the Region," United Nations, Santiago.
- Economist (2017a), "Gender Budgeting: Making the Women Count," February 25, 12.

Economist (2017b), "Gender Budgeting: The Final Mystique," February 25, 65.

- Elson, Diane (2002), "Integrating Gender into Government Budgets with a Context of Economic Reform," in Debbie Budlender, Diane Elson, Guy Hewitt, and Tanni Mukhopadbyacey (Eds.), *Gender Budgets Make Cents: Understanding Gender-Response Budgets*, London: Commonwealth Secretariat, 23-47.
- Gentry, James W. and Laurel Steinfield (2017), "The Feminization of Poverty: Recognizing the Intersection of Age and Gender Among the Global Poor," *Proceedings of the 42nd Macromarketing Conference*.
- UNESCO (2015), "Adult Literacy Rate, Population 15+ Years (Both Sexes, Female, Male)," UIS Data Centrelaudiae.
- United Nations (2015), *World Population, Ageing*, New York, United Nations, Department of Economics and Social Affairs, Population Divison.
- Williams, Ronald and Randall Krakauer (2012), "The Challenge of Non-Communicable Diseases and Geriatric Conditions," in *Global Population Aging: Peril or Promise*, World Economic Forum, 78-81.
- Zahidi, Saadia (2012), "Women and Aging," in *Global Population Aging: Peril or Promise*, World Economic Forum 21-24.

Strategic Ideological Filtering as a Framework for Understanding Female Recreational Athletes' Critiques of Fitness Advertising

Carly Drake, North Central College, USA

Scott K. Radford, University of Calgary, Canada

Extant research indicates that advertisements shape gender-related identities through images of the body. Images and text in fitness publications, specifically, often trivialize women's athletics and sexualize female athletes. Given advertising's roots as consumer education, fitness advertising therefore is identified as a "biopedagogy" that illustrates what an "ideal" body looks like and offers implicit and explicit instructions on how to attain one. To build on this literature, in this study, we aim to understand individuals' fitness-related consumption stories in relation to advertising's biopedagogy. Drawing on interviews with 26 female recreational endurance runners, we introduce the concept of strategic ideological filtering to theorize how women relate to advertising's ideal sporting bodies. This concept maps how female athletes take up elements of advertising's composition – from models' poses to advertisers' use of Photoshop – in their bodies' "becoming." The findings have implications for our understanding of advertising as an institution and medium.

If You Like Then You Better Put a Name On It: Gender Fluidity, Artificial Intelligence, and the Parsing of LGBTQ+ Identities

Gillian W. Oakenfull, Miami University, USA

Over the past decade, the explosion of online social and e-commerce platforms has led to a respatialization of the LGBT marketplace, where brick and mortar businesses that served as the focus of identity formation and social action have been replaced by social media groups and online dating platforms. At the same time, and perhaps not coincidentally, LGBTQ+ consumers are fast approaching a majority in U.S. society, especially among the younger population. However, as societal acceptance of gender as a fluid construct increases, the need to label gender and sexual identities seems to have grown with a proliferation of new labels and terms. This paper examines the connection between LGBTQ+ identity formation and the role of artificial intelligence that shapes the digital consumer marketplace. Specifically, we attempt to identify characteristics of social media and online dating platforms that have promoted gender and sexual fluidity and/or necessitated labelling and specificity within that ecosystem of identity fluidity.

GLOBALIZATION, (NEO) COLONIALISM, AND MARKETING

Olga Kravets, Royal Holloway, University of London Marcus Wilcox Hemais, Pontifical Catholic University of Rio de Janeiro



Three Historical Narratives on Advertising Self-Control and the Origin of Conar: When Consumer Rights turn into Business Rights

Laís Rodrigues de Oliveira, IAG / PUC-Rio, Brazil

Alessandra de Sá Mello da Costa, IAG / PUC-Rio, Brazil

Marcus Wilcox Hemais, IAG / PUC-Rio, Brazil

The purpose of this paper was to analyze how the National Council for Advertising Self-Regulation (Conar) uses its past to build an official history concerning its origins that legitimates advertising self-control as a hegemonic narrative. To this end, we carried out an analysis of the organizational history of Conar (official and unofficial versions), under a historical rhetorical perspective and the "uses of the past approach", in particular the context that allowed the creation of the Brazilian System of Advertising Self-Regulation (SBAP). After a thematic analysis of the documentary sources, we grouped the narratives on Conar's origins, and the self-control process, into three versions: (a) 1976/1980: the narrative under the military regime; (b) 1981/1991: the narrative during the process of redemocratization of the country; and (c) from 2005 onwards: the contemporary narrative. Each of these narratives brought a different interpretation about the context of creation and justification for advertising self-control.

The Darker Side of Advertising Self-Regulation: Imperialism and Eurocentric Consumerism in the Third World

Laís Rodrigues de Oliveira, IAG / PUC-Rio, Brazil

Marcus Wilcox Hemais, IAG / PUC-Rio, Brazil

As a rule, the marketing literature that discusses consumerism ignores geopolitical issues related to its activism. Taking such geopolitical issues into consideration, the purpose of this paper is to analyze, through a decolonial perspective that aims to unveils a darker side of history (Mignolo, 2011), an alternative critical perspective associated to the creation of the Advertising SelfRegulation System. For this, an analysis of the International Chamber of Commerce and the International Advertising Association was done showing an alternative history of how both organizations developed and pushed globally the aforementioned system. By adopting the three forms of colonialism - of power, of knowledge and of Being -, we uncovered a "forgotten" side of history associated to both ICC and IAA that unveiled how both of these organizations sought to help the Eurocentric world to establish itself as the main reference of development in the world, particularly in Latin America.

Emancipation Alternatives in Neocolonial Global Food Markets

Marlon Dalmoro, University of Vale do Taquari (Univates), Lajeado, RS, Brazil

This study explores the notions of food emancipation and market systems in peripheral regions. We describe the food market as a political arena in which emancipatory food system emerges as counterforce to the hegemonic and neocolonial global food system. Following the agroecology as an alternative to the global food system, we aim to analyze how agroecological practices reshape the market system and promote the emancipation of different peripheral market actors. Results bridge macromarketing and rural sociology knowledge emphasizing the role of rural producers in building alternative food market systems emancipated from the hegemonic food system and concerned about the imminent domination of the global food system. Finally, we discuss the neocolonial position imposed by the global food system and the capacity of agroecological theoretical and practical concepts to support alternative and emancipatory market networks.

Genderless fashion discourse in Vogue International

Camilla Pinto Luna, Unigranrio, Rio de Janeiro, RJ, Brazil

Denise Franca Barros, Unigranrio, Rio de Janeiro, RJ, Brazil

Luís Alexandre Grubits de Paula Pessôa, Pontifical Catholic University of Rio de Janeiro, RJ, Brazil

The fashion industry is very relevant in the global economy, valued at more than 3 trillion dollars and representing 2% of the world's GDP (Fashionunited, 2016). Being a country, it would be the seventh largest economy in the world, with a Gross Domestic Product (GDP) of approximately 2.4 trillion dollars (McKinsey 2017). In Brazil, this industry is about 200 years old (Abit 2017) and is the fourth largest in the world, at 63 billion dollars. Also, this sector is currently considered the second largest pollutant after the oil sector (Alternet 2015). Fashion also affects cultural issues when understood as an instrument for transferring a certain cultural meaning to objects in a consumer culture society (McCracken 1986). In view of such environmental, economic and cultural motives, it is understood how widespread is the discourse that derives from this industry and, therefore, how relevant it is to observe it and unveil ideologies instilled in it. A product or service provided by the fashion industry is often accompanied by speeches that underlie many of its actions, such as conscious, sustainable, plus size, geek and genderless fashion.

The discourse of genderless fashion assumed greater notoriety as of 2016. This characterization of fashion, which occurs globally, when directed to a fashion that is called genderless, ends up reaching (and characterizing) the understanding of the concept of gender itself. For the purposes of this analysis, the present article seeks, from the perspective of French discursive semiotics (Greimas and Courtés 1983), to analyze the discourse on genderless fashion in Vogue magazine websites in different countries and how it affects the understanding of the gender concept.

From a methodological point of view, the concept of semiotic square will be used in particular (Greimas and Courtés 1983). The semiotic square can be defined as the visual representation of the logical articulation of any semantic category (Greimas and Courtés 1983). In the tradition of Saussure's structural linguistics, the terms of an elementary category (S1, S2) maintain a relationship of opposition by contrast, within the same semantic axis, and can each project, by a negation operation , a new term, its contradictory (non-S1, non-S2). Then, relations of contrarity, contradiction and complementarity arise.

Vogue is a magazine that has an international publication, so we have selected for the analysis of this study some of the websites of countries that are known for being traditional fashion centers and that can adopt different narratives to describe genderless fashion. With that, we look at Vogue Brazil (vogue.globo.com), Vogue Spain (www.vogue.es), Vogue France (www.vogue.fr) and Vogue Italy (www.vogue.it). We selected the publications, within the period of 1 year from January 2016 (the year in which this genderless fashion assumed great notoriety), that dealt with the theme of this study and, of which, we obtained a total of 188 collected images to be analyzed.

In the Vogue publications analyzed in this study, we recognize two paths of significance. In the first, more common (about 70% of the images), genderless fashion is presented through stereotyped images from fashion editorials that can be framed in the positive (male and nonfemale) or negative

(female or non- male) of the semiotic square. The second, rarer route (about 30% of the images) is characterized by messages that combine opposite terms from the semiotic square (Male / Female; Non – male / Non-female). Such conjunctions, classified as mythical discourses, construct the concepts of hermaphrodite (a being both male and female) or angel (a being both non-male and non-female).

The term "genderless" itself, which gives an idea of the absence of gender (suffix "-less"), does not portray or approximate what is disclosed by Vogue. The genderless fashion portrayed in Vogue is closer to the idea of dual-gender or multigender. Thus, based on the gender categories presented in the semiotic square, the idea of genderless fashion, which would resemble the concept of "angel", ends up materializing references to the concept of "hermaphrodite" or the androgynous. Although the images related to the physical aspects of the models generally refer to female figures, the clothes refer to male stereotypes.

References

- Abit (2017), "Perfil do Setor", (accessed March 13, 2017), [available at <u>http://www.abit.org.br/cont/perfil-do-setor</u>].
- Alternet (2015), "It's the Second Dirtiest Thing in the World—And You're Wearing It", (accessed March 13, 2017), [available at <u>www.alternet.org/environment/its-second-dirtiest-thingworld-and-youre-wearing-it]</u>.
- Fashionunited (2016), "Global fashion industry statistics International apparel", (accessed March 13, 2017), [available at <u>https://fashionunited.com/global-fashion-industrystatistics</u>].
- Greimas, A. & Courtés, J. (1983), *Semiotics and Language: An Analytical Dictionary*, Bloomington, IN: IU Press.
- Luna, C. P. & Barros, D. F. (2019), "Genderless Fashion: A (Still) Binary Market", Latin American Business Review, 20 (3), 269-294.
- McCracken, Grant (1986), "Culture and consumption: a theoretical account of the structure and movement of the cultural meaning of consumer goods", *Journal of Consumer Research*, 71-84.
- McKinsey (2017), The state of fashion, (accessed February 9, 2018), [available at https://www.mckinsey.com/~/media/McKinsey/Industries/Retail/Our%20Insights/The%20state%20of%20fashion/The-state-of-fashion-2017-McK-BoF-report.ashx].

Markets, Marketing Systems and Quality of Life: An analysis departing from the Andean worldview of *Buen Vivir*

Klaus Pereira da Silva, Ibmec – Instituto Brasileiro de Mercado de Capitais/RJ Centro Universitário IBMR/RJ PPGA/ECSA/UNIGRANRIO – Universidade do Grande Rio/RJ, Brazil

João Felipe Rammelt Sauerbronn, PPGA/ECSA/UNIGRANRIO – Universidade do Grande Rio/RJ, Brazil

A marketing system is a complex social mechanism that coordinates the decisions in a market's production chain and it is under the influence of other social and cultural systems (Dixon, 1984). Whether it is Global, Regional or Local, a marketing system arises out of the exchanges among agents who seek to serve their own interests. Each agent assumes its own role in the social matrix which is governed by specific rules that organize and standardize operations that supply the society with goods and services. Its main goal is economic growth, quality of life and a welfare state (Layton, 2007; 2008).

The concept of Buen Vivir (roughly translated as 'good living') may offer alternative understanding and explanation of the world which serves to criticize the rationality of economic growth, market-centered societies and progress and challenges its universality. It acknowledges the mutual links of everything that is vital for a good, balanced, and harmonic life in society, without disregarding its political, economic, cultural and social components (Gudynas, 2011; Mamani, 2010). The main components of Buen Vivir are relationality, complementarity, correspondence, reciprocity and cyclicality (Estermann, 2013) as we present next.

Relationality is part of a philosophy that is opposed to substantiality, according to the Andean worldview. Relationality has cosmic, anthropological, economic and religions representations (Estermann, 2013). Correspondence is a consequence of relationality, which means that the macro view of the cosmos reflects the micro view of it, therefore a worldview must take into consideration the everyday life of the human beings and other creatures. Cosmic balance on Earth must lead to a similar balance in culture, sociability and economy. Complementarity has a female and a male representation, and must be put together to produce, reproduce and conserve life and expresses itself through the production of goods and services, the organization of work, and habits. Reciprocity is, generally speaking, expressed by cosmic justice, balance in interactions, and exchange of knowledge, wisdom, goods, services, money, and duties. An expression of social ethics that involves reciprocity is the Andean ethics trilogy: not to be a thief, not to be a liar, not to be idle. The principle of cyclicality is opposed to time linearity. According to Andean wisdom, utopia is retrospective, thus the human beings walk with their backs pointing to the future and with their eyes cast over the past, as a guiding spot. Cycles change and always go back to the same point, i.e., cycles must restore balance and harmony on Earth (Estermann, 2013).

As the concepts of correspondence, complementarity and reciprocity state, society and market must take a share of responsibility for the provision of balance and harmony, which are vital to the quality of life and a welfare state according to Buen Vivir. Based on the concept of correspondence, ideas such as global business expansion (globalization); production of wealth (GDP); self-regulatory markets; local economy subordinate to global economy; and direct cause and effect relationships concerning capital, quality of life and welfare are doctrines that can be perceived in practical terms, in corporate environments, in constant pressing to maximize profits, regardless of the external impact it all can have on individuals and society.

Based on Layton's (2009) representation, the linearity of the marketing systems, according to the concept of cyclicality, does not end up producing quality of life and welfare, if one is to take into account the balance and harmony between human beings and nature. As Layton (2009) describes a marketing system, the specialization/division of labor and the agents' roles can find a correspondence in Buen Vivir's concept of complementarity. However, the division of labor in marketing systems distances itself from balance and harmony when it comes to the production of surplus. According to Buen Vivir, the main goal of production is to meet the needs of a group or community, and the principal production guideline must be the number of members.

This paper does not view the concept of Buen Vivir as a result of a marketing system, of a development model or an equivalent of a welfare state or quality of life. Regarded here as an ontology, Buen Vivir must act on the marketing systems, welfare and quality of life as a potential and inspirational source of new practices for their agents. In addition, it must help reconfigure the linearity of the system and produce individual quality of life and a welfare state, based on balance and harmony between humans and nature and the respect and welcoming of differences. Thus, it is believed that one must question the way one perceives development, marketing systems and markets, instead of simply rethinking the practices or the structures of the system. This work proposes a balanced and harmonic worldview, which unites humans and nature, as opposed to a harmful machine-oriented utilitarian rationality.

In fact, a multitude of development models can coexist, as long as they respect the local realities, regarding their cultural, social, natural and economic components. Thus, the types of marketing systems (Layton, 2009) are not stages of a progressing path of systems and are not necessarily considered mature or advanced for being well structured. A reconfiguration of the marketing systems, according to Buen Vivir, will provide societies with fulfillment, without necessarily going all the way up the surplus production scale and the practices of compensation between means of production and nature.

Pondering Buen Vivir, this paper seeks to extract its intrinsic wisdom, which has been highly neglected in research on global development. It is also possible to claim that by establishing a relationship between traditional local knowledge and marketing systems/markets, one can deepen a debate that so far revolves around the idea that the State must foster development. Thus, one can view marketing systems through a different perspective, especially one that links market and nature and goes beyond the notion of exploitation of resources.

References

- Estermann, J. Ecosofía andina: un paradigma alternativo de convivencia cósmica y de vivir bien (Andean eco-philosophy: an alternative paradigm of cosmic coexistence and living well). *FAIA*, 2I(9-10), 1-21.
- Gudynas, E. (2011). Buen Vivir: Germinando alternativas al desarrollo (Buen Vivir: Germinating alternatives to development). *América Latina en Movimiento, ALAI*, 462, 1-20.
- Layton, R. A. (2007). Marketing systems a core Macromarketing concept. *Journal of Macromarketing*, 27(3), 227-242.

- Layton, R. A. (2008). The search for a dominant logic: a macromarketing perspective. *Journal of Macromarketing*, 28(3), 215-227.
- Layton, R. A. (2009). Marketing systems, macromarketing and the quality of life. In: P.
- Mamani, F. (2010). Buen Vivir / Vivir Bien. Filosofia, políticas, estrategias y experiencias regionales andinas (Good Living / Living Well. Andean regional philosophy, policies, strategies and experiences). *CAOI*.

Civil Society Participation in the Organic Products Market Formation

Daniel de Oliveira Barata Merabet, Unigranrio, Rio de Janeiro, Brazil

Denise Franca Barros, Unigranrio, Rio de Janeiro, Brazil

The convergence of macromarketing and post-colonial perspective allows the recognition of other epistemologies relevant to the understanding of markets in developing countries. In these contexts, it is possible to identify practices of resistance in the face of neoliberal ideology disseminated by economic globalization. Based on this argument this paper aims to describe how the governmental and civil society participation in the Commission of Organic Production contributed to shape specific agencies in the organic family farming market in Rio de Janeiro state, Brazil. Using an ethnographic approach, we witnessed the formulation of the State Policy for Agroecology and Organic Production throughout a period of 22 months. Non-market oriented agendas - such as hunger, social justice and assistance to family farmers - played an important role in the design of a system for marketing organic products.

HISTORICAL RESEARCH IN MARKETING

Francisco Conejo, University of Colorado Denver, USA Terrence H. Witkowski, California State University-Long Beach,USA



Emergence and Decline of the Rural Pulpería: An Important Institution in Costa Rica's Early Marketing System

Francisco Conejo, University of Colorado - Denver, USA

"José Arcadio tore it [the counter] from its place, lifted it above his head, and placed it on the street. Eleven men were needed to put it back inside [the pulpería]." (García Márquez 1967, p. 84) One Hundred Years of Solitude

Much literature addresses retailing's evolution. However, historical research in this area overemphasizes larger, more-prominent settings. This has led to somewhat one-sided portrayals in the literature (Witkowski 2009), exacerbated by a focus on advanced economies. Marketing's historical understanding of small retailers in developing countries thus remains lacking.

In line with the 2020 Colombia conference location, this paper addresses how rural Costa Rican pulperías, the traditional small neighborhood grocers, evolved between 1950 and 2010. The above is done from a historical perspective, its periodization reflecting major socio-economic trends, e.g. Hollander et al. (2005).

Interviews may yield detailed insights on distribution channel members, e.g. Harrison et al. (1974). Thirty pulpería owners, clients, and suppliers were thus interviewed in-depth. Data was then analyzed through the lenses of the Institutional, Commodities, and Functional Schools of marketing thought, e.g. Shaw and Jones (2005) or Sheth et al. (1988). Doing so provided a more-comprehensive picture of pulperías and their environments.

While pulperías differed, their fundamental features and operation remained consistent. Products sold were generally convenience goods, e.g. Copeland (1925). Though products evolved, mirroring socioeconomic trends. Finally, pulperías executed both retail and supply activities. Retail functions comprised storing, rearranging, promoting, selling, and financing. Supply functions encompassed assembling, grading, transporting, and risk-bearing. Though activities were not distinct, but all part of an integrated provisioning system.

Pulperías might seem unremarkable. However, they were an important institution within Costa Rica's early marketing system. By addressing their evolution, the development of retailing in this and other emerging economies might be better understood.

References

Copeland, Melvin T. (1925), Principles of Merchandising. Chicago, IL: A.W. Shaw & Co.

- García Márquez, Gabriel (1967), Cien Años de Soledad (One Hundred Years of Solitude). Buenos Aires, ARG: Editorial Sudamericana.
- Harrison, Kelly, Donald Henley, Harold Riley and James Shaffer (1974), *Improving Food Marketing Systems in Developing Countries: Experiences from Latin America*. East Lansing, MI, Latin American Studies Center Michigan State University.
- Hollander, Stanley C., Kathleen M. Rassuli, D. G. Brian Jones and Laura Farlow Dix (2005), "Periodization in Marketing History," *Journal of Macromarketing*, 25 (1), 32-41.
- Shaw, Eric H. and D.G. Brian Jones (2005), "A history of schools of marketing thought," *Marketing Theory*, 5 (3), 239-281.
- Sheth, Jagdish N., David M. Gardner and Dennis E. Garrett (1988), *Marketing Theory: Evolution and Evaluation*. New York: John Wiley and Sons, Inc.
- Witkowski, Terrence H. (2009), "General Book Store in Chicago, 1938-1947: linking neighborhood to nation," *Journal of Historical Research in Marketing*, 1 (1), 93-121.

Markets as Narrative Constructions: Analysis of the Narratives for the Creation of Public Cemeteries

Rosana Oliveira da Silva, PPGA/Unigranrio – Universidade do Grande Rio, Brazil

Denise Franca Barros, PPGA/Unigranrio - Universidade do Grande Rio, Brazil

Alessandra de Sá Mello da Costa, IAG/PUC Rio - Pontificia Universidade Católica do Rio de Janeiro, Brazil

This work aims to identify historical narratives about the creation and management of public cemeteries and to investigate how these narratives express and legitimize these new market practices. The concept of market practices, strongly guided by the Actor-Network Theory (ANT), and Narrative analysis were used to achieve this objective. This research understands market shaping as a process that embeds practices acting together as an assembled, coherent and logic construction. This structure permits to make sense of the actors' actions granting the entrance of new practices into the market. We draw on historical documentary sources, such as newspapers and trade magazines to examine narratives from 19th century actors related to death management secularization in the city of Rio de Janeiro - Brazil, in order to understand the creation of this new market. Thus, the present research highlights the importance of history for the studies on the construction of performative markets. Our analysis showed that representational and normalizing practices were the most evident in all phases of the ANT. Interessement and mobilization were the most complex stages in view of the difficulty of the focal actors to mobilize other actors for the proposed changes, even after legal provisions were taken. However, it can be said that the efforts expended in the narratives of actors contributed to the configuration of the market. The work contributes to discussions on market shaping through narratives.

Tale of Two Bazaars: Indian Bazaar-Market Systems from a Microhistorical Perspective (1958-2017)

Kumar Shreshtha, IIM Calcutta, India

Himadri Roy Chaudhary, Xavier School of Management, Jamshedpur, India

Ramendra Singh, IIM Calcutta, India

This paper proffers to take a look at the consumer and market systems as a South Asian nation experience events with indelible and irreversible effects on consumption and markets. We contend here that no market system can escape the impact and influence of major historical events. Thus, in the present study, we look at the tryst of two bazaar systems with historical events like riots and the contribution of the individual microhistories of respondents and their version of the microhistory of the bazaar market, in building up an understanding of an informal retail space. The research bases itself on two research questions; a) What memories of the bazaar do the members of a market system retain? b) Do important historical milestones of a nation cause significant change in the demography or consumption of a market system?

The paper uses oral history technique to ascertain the transformation in the behaviour of consumer respondents and the overall structure of the governance in bazar in 60 years. We probed senior market actors and recorded their decadal experiences. The paper seeks to capture the testimonies of ordinary retailers and consumers and put on record the undocumented from two bazaar-market systems with a different history of evolution.

Finally, we argue that the retailers in the bazaar-markets had historically organized them as a political society to insulate them against any perils of the state politics while inside the market the economic transactions are embedded in the social transactions. The paper contributes to a better understanding of a system of informal bazaar-markets, their operations, and the role of historical milestones in its transformation.

Firearms Provisioning and the Historical Roots of Gun Violence in Latin America

Terrence H. Witkowski, California State University, Long Beach, USA

Latin American nations have been plagued by some of the highest rates of gun violence in the world. A number of long-standing economic, social, and cultural tensions provide plausible explanations for this regional phenomenon. Stressful conditions have included poverty, high male unemployment rates, social inequality, poor school retention, unfettered urbanization, the drug trade, fierce criminal gangs, and compromised law enforcement.

However, gun violence also has depended upon having a ready supply of firearms made available to people through public and private provisioning systems. Two basic research questions about this firearms provisioning need to be addressed: (1) How did the current system come about and (2) how has it facilitated gun violence? This paper offers answers through an account and analysis of Latin American firearms history, from the time of European discovery and conquest until the present day. The narrative is divided into four periods with each including a summary of relevant political, economic, and social contexts.

The research draws from a combination of primary and secondary data sources. Original materials include paintings, posters, advertisements, and corporate documents available online. The literature consulted consists of works by historians and, for more recent periods, reports in the media and in policy-oriented publications. Historical research, a key component of the macromarketing domain, provides gun violence researchers and policy-makers with a broader understanding of firearms and the gun cultures in which they are deployed.

MACROMARKETING AND PEDAGOGY IN IBERO AMERICA: TOWARDS A CRITICAL PEDAGOGY IN MACROMARKETING

Ray Benton, Loyola University Chicago, USA Amy Kyhos, Loyola University Chicago, USA Jaime Sierra, Pontifica Universidad Javeriana, Colombia



Macromarketing and Pedagogy in Ibero America: Towards a Critical Pedagogy

Héctor Godoy, Universidad de los Andes, Colombia

The foundations of the Institutions of Higher Education – HEIs, are in teaching, research and social projection. However, in the proposal of academics such as (Calzonetti et al., 2012; Clifford and Petrescu, 2012; Gunasekara, 2006; Huggins et al., 2012), they increasingly urge HEIs to consider the ways in which their activities intentionally impact on innovation, entrepreneurship, and economic and social outcomes in the region.

HEIs are recognized as key actors in the development of society, their dynamics of interaction with other institutions is permanent, which allows them to contribute to the solution of the problems of the environment in which they are located. Likewise, new forms of relationship between communities or groups of individuals, located in different territories, are stimulated, which facilitates the process of reflection within the HEIs, in view of the role they have been developing. Following (Goldstein & Renault, 2004), modern universities contribute outputs such as: knowledge, human capital, know-how transfer, technological innovation, provision of regional leadership, co-production of infrastructure for knowledge and contribution to the regional environment.

HEIs are increasingly proactive in their commitment to regional development. Uyarra (2010) distinguishes competing models of the regional functions of modern HEIs, from the relatively distant and conventional "knowledge factory" to the "committed" regional developer and the "systemic" archetype that generates networks and spans borders.

HEIs assume an outstanding responsibility to integrally train future professionals, who are immersed in an increasingly diverse society. A society marked by social, economic, ethnic and cultural differences. This is why the University must face the challenge of training its students within the framework of this diversity. It must recognize and face the heterogeneity of its academic community, as opposed to the homogeneity of other eras.

HEIs are called upon to make significant changes in their teaching models, where the heterogeneity of both their academic community and their environment of influence is addressed. In this process, the division between educator/learner must be overcome, unidirectional relationships must be disseminated, in order to stimulate and promote bidirectional ones that contribute to an integral formation of both (teachers - students) since both have elements to contribute to the process. Freire, P. (2012).

The pedagogical and methodological proposals must be renewed to respond to the new demands and requirements that the context defines. In this context, it is necessary to train professionals who are capable, through practice, of building their reality, of reflecting on and analyzing the world in which they live. Where they are capable of becoming aware of the reality in which they are living. By resorting to dialogue with their community, to understand their context, their reality, their needs, their challenges and problems. Freire, P. (2012). In such a way that later, through problematic education these elements are combined to generate knowledge and generate positive transformations through practice and constant interaction between teachers/students/community.

This is why HEIs must adjust their training models, affiliated to a comprehensive, critical education, strongly linked to the community, which recognizes the rooting of its history, values and customs. That permanently motivates its students to recognize themselves as inconclusive and aware of their inconclusiveness that motivates them in their permanent search of being more, to direct our society in a more just and solidary way.

From the regional perspective, the lack of flexibility in the supply of education and training is palpable, it reflects its disconnection with demand, technological progress and the needs of the region, which brings with it adverse effects for regional development reflected in economy little dynamic and little diversified, among others. With low investment and excessive protection. Growing gaps with respect to the national average. It is because of the previously mentioned, that it is common to find that the evaluation of University extension programs has focused mainly on inputs or outputs, but more specifically, special emphasis is placed on the resources used by the program or what the program does.

For the above considerations, the University of Ibagué decided to structure an extension program that would allow it to establish a direct link with the municipalities of the region, the program Paz y Región – P&R. One of the purposes of P&R is to contribute to the determinants of quality of life, employment and sustainable development in the department of Tolima. In the design of this program, innovation appears as a central concept, in which the relationships between research, development and innovation are multi-directional and complex, and in which regional priorities must be set from "bottom to top" and not from "top to bottom". As Caracostas and Muldur (1998: 21) point out: "Industrial competitiveness will no longer be an objective in itself, but a means of increasing the contribution of science and technology to growth, employment and the diffusion of innovation".

Large scale solutions will be difficult to come without a comprehensive understanding of what works and what doesn't in P&R, and robust impact measurement systems are critical to this. The challenges of today's world affect everyone and are too complex to be solved by any one organization or sector alone (Universities, producer associations, governments or civil society). Collaborative and articulated work is therefore essential. That is why, in an impact evaluation, besides wanting to know if a problem improves or worsens, this study would be interested in understanding if the university intervention had something to do with it. In other words, it is a question of establishing whether or not (and to what extent) the cause of the change in the problem, especially in the solutions, can be attributed to the intervention of the University, through the program P&R.

References

- Calzonetti f. J., Miller d. M. and Reid N. (2012) Building both technology-intensive and technologylimited clusters by emerging research universities: The Toledo example, *Applied Geography* 34, 265–273.
- Caracostas, P. y Muldur, U. (1998): Society, the Endless Frontier, Luxemburgo, Office for Official publications of the European Commission.
- Clifford D. and Petrescu C. (2012) The keys to university-community engagement sustainability, Nonprofit Management and Leadership 23, 77–91.

- Freire, P. (2012). *Pedagogía del oprimido* (1ª ed. en Editorial Biblioteca Nueva, Ser. Biblioteca clásica). Biblioteca Nueva.
- Goldstein H. A., G. Maier and Luger M. I. (1995) The university as an instrument for economic and business development: U.S. and European comparisons, in DILL D. D. and SPORN B. (Eds) *Emerging Patterns of Social Demand and University Reform: Through a Glass Darkly*, pp. 105– 133. Pergamon, Oxford.
- Gunasekara C. (2006) Reframing the role of universities in the development of regional innovation systems, *Journal of Technology Transfer* 31, 101–113.
- Huggins R., A. Johnston and C. Stride (2012), Knowledge networks and universities: locational and organisational aspects of knowledge transfer interactions, *Entrepreneurship and Regional Development* 24, 475–502.
- Uyarra E. (2010) Conceptualizing the regional roles of universities, implications and contradictions, *European Planning Studies* 18, 1227–1246.

Appropriations of Macromarketing Pedagogy: from Teaching to Pedagogical Practice from a Freirean Perspective

Valcir Farias, Pontificia Universidade Católica de Minas Gerais, Brazil.

Vanina Dias, Pontificia Universidade Católica de Minas Gerais, Brazil.

Ione Neto, Pontifícia Universidade Católica de Minas Gerais, Brazil.

Ramon Silva Leite, Pontifícia Universidade Católica de Minas Gerais, Brazil.

The academic curricula of the marketing courses do not follow a systemic view, as state Radford, Hunt & Andrus (2015), for they separately deal with topics such as environment, ecology, population growth problems, air pollution, vulnerable groups, recycling and marketing strategy, what highlights the fragmentation which seems to prevail in the current line of thought related to marketing studies (Wilkie & Moore, 2003).

Discussions about ethics, the moral, political and social contexts surrounding marketing, and sustainability are part of the syllabus of business management courses (Catterall, Maclaran & Stevens, 2002; Kilbourne & Carlson, 2008; Brennen et al., 2010). However, such themes are not dealt with in a systemic way when it comes to the syllabus geared to marketing studies. Such syllabus should offer students an overview of what is possible to be done in a shared social context (Wood, 1988), with benchmarks on both freedom and liberation (McLaren, 1994), as well as a real commitment to respecting cultural differences, for they are key to the very notions of education and citizenship (Aronowitz & Giroux, 1993).

From a dialogical standpoint, the contents in the syllabus should provide the students with the understanding that, from a critical thinking of their own existence in the world, the world around them shall be seen as a process subject to ongoing changes (Freire, 1987). Thus, the aim of this paper is to discuss how the pedagogy of macromarketing can help the professors develop in their pupils the necessary skills for the understanding of the meanings of cultural objects, as resulting from the cultural industry, according to Paulo Freire's pedagogical framework.

In order to fulfill this goal, we first offer a discussion on how to develop the syllabus, highlighting its conceptual bases, and then we discuss where the knowledge about marketing in that syllabus is to be developed. This sequence is justified for it deals with the elements of macromarketing pedagogy itself.

Through the understanding of macromarketing as the study of marketing systems and their impacts and consequences on society, one can expect this pedagogical action to be developed from the syllabus proposal itself. In this sense, the general foundations of the curriculum field will be presented following Freire's pedagogy, establishing a relationship between it and the integral human formation. This aims at identifying aspects of macromarketing underlying both undergraduate and graduate studies in the field of marketing, as well as the influence it plays upon professors and students who experience a pedagogical relationship influenced by such pedagogy.

Freire's pedagogy has been studied in several fields, but a proposition for studies of marketing syllabus based on it seems to be lacking. Discussing this theoretical gap under the light of macromarketing is justifiable since the concepts proposed both by macromarketing and Freire's pedagogy focus on the impacts suffered by society. This theoretical study seeks to propose defragmenting marketing studies following a challenging view of education in this field following Freire's pedagogy.

References

- Aronowitz, S. & Giroux, H.A. (1993), *Education Still Under Siege*. Westport, Connecticut: Bergin and Garvey.
- Brennen, R.; Eagle, L.; Ellis, N. & Higgins, M. (2010), "Of a Complex Sensitivity in Marketing Ethics Education," *Journal of Marketing Management*, 26 (13-14), 1165-80.
- Catterall, M., P. Maclaran & L. Stevens (2002), "Critical Reflection in the Marketing Curriculum," *Journal of Marketing Education*, 24 (3), 184-92.
- Freire, P. (1987), Pedagogia do oprimido, 17th ed. Rio de Janeiro: Paz e Terra.
- Kilbourne, W. E. & L. Carlson (2008), "The Dominant Social Paradigm, Consumption, and Environmental Attitudes: Can Macromarketing Education Help?" *Journal of Macromarketing*, 28 (2), 106-21.
- McLaren, Peter (1994), Life in Schools: An Introduction to Critical Pedagogy in the Foundations of Education, 2nd ed. New York: Longman.
- Radford, S. K., D.M. Hunt & D. Andrus (2015), "Experiential Learning Projects," *Journal of Macromarketing*, 35(4), 466–472. doi:10.1177/0276146715573834-472.
- Wilkie, W. L. & E.S. Moore (2003), "Scholarly Research in Marketing: Exploring The '4 Eras' of Thought Development," *Journal of Public Policy & Marketing*, 22 (2), 116-46.
- Wood, D. (1988), How Children Think and Learn. Oxford: Basil Blackwell.

MACROMARKETING MINDSET: EDUCATION IN THE CLASSROOM AND BEYOND

Emily Moscato, St. Joseph's University, USA Joya Kemper, University of Auckland, USA



Transitioning to low carbon research and teaching: Supporting necessary change through participative inquiry

Victoria J. Little, Monash University Malaysia, Malaysia

Sabrina Helm, University of Arizona, USA

Joya Kemper, University of Auckland, USA

This abstract captures the next steps of an ambitious project initiated at the 44th Macromarketing conference in 2019, responding to the climate emergency, and to a recent AACSB call for business schools to 'step up' to address the damage done by unquestioned privileging of profit over planet (Bach 2019). Most agree that we must transition our systems, structures, politics and practices to a net zero carbon normal urgently if we are to avoid worst case outcomes for humanity (IPCC 2018). However, the business school continues to draw on logics from an industrial past - consumption growth, competition, profit, and individual choice – ideas incompatible with human survival. Macromarketers are well positioned to offer leadership in transitioning to a low carbon future. Therefore, how can marketers join colleagues in the humanities and the sciences as part of the solution rather than part of the problem? This paper outlines a project that provides a structure in pursuit of that goal.

The project will make four important contributions: (1) Introducing action research (AR) to macromarketing research and education. While AR approaches are congruent with social change, to our knowledge they have as yet not been deployed in macromarketing; (2) Providing empirical evidence about systems change from reflective practitioners, adding to the literature on transformative processes in marketing systems; (3) Supporting change by creating informed, open and receptive minds in the current environment of fear, suspicion and division; (4) Providing hope for those of us who are finding it difficult to maintain a stance of 'intelligent optimism' about an increasingly worrying future. Overall we want to create a structure from within which we can all constructively confront the issue of climate change, supporting each other, and contributing towards the university's social charter.

References

- Bach, David (2019), The World That We Created. In *BizEd International*, AACSB International. (accessed 8 January 2020, https://bized.aacsb.edu/articles/2019/september/the-world-that-we-created?_ga=2.202934481.1165431831.1578425527-1601745707.1578425527).
- Helm, Sabrina, Vicki J Little, and Joya Kemper. "Rearranging Deck Chairs or Righting the Course? Exploring the Role of Marketers in Climate Change Adaptation " In 2020 AMA Winter conference, edited by Bryan Lukas and Thomas Hult. San Diego, CA: American Marketing Association, 2020.
- IPCC 2018, "Summary for Policy Makers." In Global Warming of 1.5°C. An Ipcc Special Report on the Impacts of Global Warming of 1.5°C above Pre-Industrial Levels and Related Global Greenhouse Gas Emission Pathways, in the Context of Strengthening the Global Response to the Threat of Climate Change, Sustainable Development, and Efforts to Eradicate Poverty. Kemper, Joya A, Paul W Ballantine, and C. Michael Hall (2018), "Global Warming and Sustainability: Understanding the Beliefs of Marketing Faculty," Journal of Public Affairs, 18 (4), e.1664.

Inserting Biology into the Genome of Marketing: Interdisciplinary Lessons for Exploring Societal Problems

Emily M. Moscato, Saint Joseph's University, USA

Ernest Baskin, Saint Joseph's University, USA

Brian M. Forster, Saint Joseph's University, USA

The dangers of "marketing myopia" are well established for practitioners and marketing instruction (Smith, Drumwright, and Gentile 2010). Focusing on narrowly-defined and immediate consumer product needs has resulted in the relative neglect of larger, strategic questions that link marketing activities to the long-term welfare of stakeholders (Lemon and Seiders 2006). Significant societal issues, including the climate crisis, inequality, and pandemics, and the pervasiveness of sensational falsifications on social media have compounded this problem (Fischhoff 2019; Pennycook, Cannon, and Rand 2018). We endorse the practice of interdisciplinary lessons to help marketing students broaden their perspectives and embrace a macromarketing lens. This approach requires students to perform systematic analyze of taken-for-granted beliefs, allows for better understanding stakeholders, and encourages critical thought.

Our project examines the potential of interdisciplinary marketing instruction in accomplishing these objectives. Elements of Freiren's learning and problem-based approaches are adapted to design meaningful activities for students that draw on their experiences, require active engagement, and stimulates meta-cognition to extrapolate beyond the problem at hand (Freire 2018; Hmelo-Silver 2004). The work employs a synergistic science and marketing lesson for marketing students that promotes the scientific literacy and reinforces the use of evidence-based scientific methods in the exploration of topical macromarketing issues. Using a biology-based lesson and applying the scientific method requires students to pivot their understanding of an issue, interpret new data, and see consumer and supply chain matters in a new light.

References

- Fischhoff, Baruch (2019), "Evaluating science communication," *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences*, 116 (16), 7670–75.
- Freire, Paulo (2018), Pedagogy of the Oppressed, (M. B. Ramos, tran.), Bloomsbury Publishing.
- Hmelo-Silver, Cindy E. (2004), "Problem-Based Learning: What and How Do Students Learn?," *Educational Psychology Review*, 16 (3), 235–66.
- Lemon, Katherine N. and Kathleen Seiders (2006), "Making Marketing Accountable: A Broader View," in *Does Marketing Need Reform?: Fresh Perspectives on the Future*, R. S. Sisodia and J. N. Sheth, eds., M.E. Sharpe, 201–8.
- Pennycook, Gordon, Tyrone D. Cannon, and David G. Rand (2018), "Prior exposure increases perceived accuracy of fake news," *Journal of experimental psychology. General*, 147 (12), 1865–80.

Smith, N. Craig, Minette E. Drumwright, and Mary C. Gentile (2010), "The New Marketing Myopia," Journal of Public Policy & Marketing, 29 (1), 4–11.

MARGINALIZATION, STIGMA AND MISREPRESENTATION IN THE MARKETPLACE: ADVANCING A MACROMARKETING VIEW OF DESTIGMATIZATION AND MARKETPLACE INCLUSION.

Flavia Cardoso, Universidad Adolfo Ibáñez, chile Benjamin Rosentha, Fundação Getulio Vargas, brazil Carla Abdalla, Faculdade Armando Alvares Penteado, brazil



Exploring the Dialectics of Marketplace Exclusion: A Systematic Literature Review and Research Agenda

Joseph Robert Daniel, University of Liverpool, UK

Elizabeth Parsons, University of Liverpool, UK

Cathy McGouran, University of Liverpool, UK

Understanding the causes and effects of human suffering in a complex and dynamic system of exchanges is a one prominent concern in macromarketing. This concern has led researchers to develop the concept marketplace exclusion, and recently called for innovative approaches in the study of how marketing practices perpetuate exclusion in the society. This study responds to this call and conducts a systematic review of the studies relevant to marketplace exclusion in marketing and consumer research literature, in order to map the existing understandings and design potential avenues for future study on the topic. Based on a review of 63 articles, insights related to the representations and responses to marketplace exclusion have been gained to inform future studies on the topic.

On-line Sports Betting and Consumer's Vulnerability

Francisco Claudio Freitas Silva, Pontifical Catholic University of Minas Gerais, Brazil

Bruna Scoralick Queiroz, Pontifical Catholic University of Minas Gerais, Brazil

Ramon Silva Leite, Pontifical Catholic University of Minas Gerais, Brazil

The terrain of sports bets encompasses not only fun and excitement, and the consequences of the negative effects of sports gambling reach large proportions. This study aimed at shedding light on the aspects related to the on line sports bettings, under the perspective of the consumer's vulnerability, in a way that the multidimensional aspects that influence uncontrolled gambling and the condition of vulnerability were analysed. This way, ten semi-structured interviews were carried out with regular Brazilian participants of communities connected to sports bettings. The results demonstrate that the uncontrolled bettors may be considered examples of vulnerable consumers, for they develop behaviours in which they are not capable of assess the losses caused by the game. The connection of the bets with the digital and sports aspects has established new particularities to this market. These elements are present in uncontrolled gambling and may influence the state of vulnerability of the consumers.

MARKETING SYSTEMS -MACROMARKETING

Deborah DeLong, Chatham University,USA Christine Domegan, Natl. U. of Ireland, Ireland Don R. Rahtz, William and Mary, USA



Evolving Structures and Systems: Tourism Development in Ninh Binh, Vietnam

Nguyen Thi Tuyet Mai, National Economics University, Vietnam

Don R. Rahtz, The College of William and Mary, USA Clifford J. Shultz, II, Loyola University Chicago, USA Nguyen Hoang Linh, SKEMA Business School, France Nguyen Loc, The College of William and Mary, USA

This paper is part of a series of studies conducted by the authors over the past several years focusing on the impact of Tourism Development on the Community Quality of Life. In previous work Nguyen, Rahtz, and Shultz (2014) examined the impact of tourism on the Ha Long Bay region of Vietnam. In this current work those authors (along with others) expand their examination of tourism development in Vietnam to a different region: Ninh Binh. The interviews in this study were conducted in Trang An Landscape Complex and in Bai Dinh Pagoda Complex on the outskirt of Ninh Binh province.

Trang An is a spectacular landscape of limestone massif, surrounded by mostly rice paddy. Most of the area is uninhabited and is preserved in its natural state Trang An features a large network of limestone karst caves, many of which are accessible via subterranean waterways. This area has been long known for its beautiful and tranquil landscape. Bai Dinh Pagoda is the largest of its kind in Southeast Asia. Located within Gia Sinh Commune, it is to be distinguished with another smaller temple of the same name on the slopes of Dinh Mountain. The large pagoda has multiple temples and more than 500 Buddha statues, with the largest being made of bronze and 10 meters tall. This complex attracts a huge crowd of both devoted Buddhists paying their respects as well as tourists. Both destinations have been heavily promoted by the local authorities and travel agencies as the highlight of the province's tourism.

Macromarketers have long recognized the importance of examining communities within the framework of an interconnected network of the community and the larger environmental, social, and political systems in which it exists. Shultz (2007, 2015) has long argued that marketing and marketers can contribute to the well-being of communities through the development, nurturing, and promoting of broader markets for the betterment of those who make up the community. It is these markets and their mechanisms that contribute to sustainable social, political, and economic growth and well-being for the members and interested stakeholders in the community. As Shultz, Rahtz, and Sirgy (2017) point out, the well-being of the community is a variable state existing on a continuum between flourishing and distressed. A community is never stable and must strive to build and protect a variety of systems that can provide resiliency in the face of any number of natural, political, social and economic threats.

The purpose of this research is to examine the role of tourism in this region of Vietnam, and compare and contrast it with other regions the authors have assessed via field studies. The methodology employed is similar to the research administered by the authors in their earlier examination of the Ha

Long region. It includes "range capture," which seeks to measure respondents' assessments of Quality of Life (QOL) across a range of the past, present, and future (Nguyen, et. al. 2014). As such, collected data compared the local people's QOL between different timelines, from before tourism was introduced in the province to the current time and the future. Here, tourism was regarded as the catalyst to improve the local OOL. The change in Ninh Binh was to transition from an almost exclusive focus on agriculture, to a more diversified economy emphasizing tourism, which offers more stable and higher income. Notably, unlike Nguyen et al. (2014) and Rahtz and Shultz (2008), where outside forces intervene to drive the process, the leading role of a private local tourism company, Xuan Truong, contributes to a strong local focus in providing more employment. This enhancement, of course, is not without concern for the rising cost of living. Surprisingly, when compared to previous work by the authors, few respondents ever mention the negative impact of tourism on the natural environment. Instead, there is a strong confidence regarding the preservation of the natural environment. This is due, in part, to the role of Xuan Truong to enforce environmental protections through various activities. In fact, since farmers have been all been directed to use their land for tourism purposes, many of them see little choice but to cooperate with Xuan Truong and to work in the tourism industry. Findings, similarly to discoveries by Nguyen et al. (2014), suggest many informants believe the authorities and Xuan Truong help to improve the lives and QOL of the local people in Ninh Binh. However, most informants say Xuan Truong has important role in further developing and managing tourism in Ninh Binh, including for example, providing jobs, training local people how to serve tourists and keeping the environment healthy.

References

- Nguyen, T. T. Mai, Don R. Rahtz, and Clifford Shultz (2014), Tourism as Catalyst for Quality of Life in Transitioning Subsistence Marketplaces: Perspectives from Ha Long, Vietnam. *Journal of Macromarketing*, 34(1), 28–44.
- Rahtz, Don R. and Clifford J. Shultz (2008), "Community Quality of Life: Evaluation and Expectations in a Developing Community," in *Proceedings of the 32rd Annual Macromarketing Conference*, John Mittelstaedt, ed. Clemson, SC: Macromarketing Society, 296-299
- Shultz, Clifford (2007), "Marketing as Constructive Engagement," *Journal of Public Policy & Marketing*, 26 (2), 293-301.
- Shultz, Clifford (2015), "The Ethical Imperative of Constructive Engagement in a World Confounded by the Commons Dilemma, Social Traps, and Geopolitical Conflicts," in *Handbook on Ethics in Marketing*, Alexander Nill, ed., Northampton, MA: Edward Elgar, 188-219.
- Shultz, Clifford, Don R. Rahtz, and M. Joseph Sirgy (2017) "Distinguishing Flourishing from Distressed Communities: Vulnerability, Resilience and a Systemic Framework to Facilitate Well-Being," (2017) in *Handbook of Community Well-Being*, Rhonda Phillips ed. Dordrecht, Netherlands: Springer pp. 403-421.

Transition Markets – an Example of Systems of Transport in Brazil

Sebastiao Aleixo De Souza Filho Pontifical Catholic University of Minas Gerais, Brazil

Ramon Silva Leite Pontifical Catholic University of Minas Gerais, Brazil

This article presents a qualitative research carried out in Brazil, in which it aimed to understand and analyze the existing distance between Uber and taxi, from the company's entrance in the Brazilian city of Belo Horizonte. It was the need for transportation that inspired the idea of creating Uber, an application that spread worldwide and extended throughout Brazil (in Belo Horizonte more specifically) starting in 2014. This has changed the *status quo* enjoyed by the taxi drivers then. The presence of Uber in the market has brought along new possibilities, for both the users of taxis and those people who could not afford to enjoy the commodity of the system and were therefore excluded from it. Uber took advantage of the economic situation of the country to attract thousands of drivers, who saw the app as a quicker form of reinstating themselves in the job market.

Taking into consideration the changes experienced by the marketing system under analysis, both drivers and users were inquired about three possible future scenarios at that moment: 1) the exit of Uber from the market, 2) its permanence without regulation, and 3) its permanence under regulation. The summary of the scenario results is seen in the table below.

Subject	Taxi drivers' view	Uberists view	User`s view
Uber exiting the market	Return to the former status <i>quo</i> (ideal scenario); Users return to public transportation.	Taxi drivers recover their former status quoUberistsmass unemployment;Users return to transportationpublic	Return to public transportation as majority alternative for transport, with occasional use of taxis.
Non - regulation of Uber	Maintenance of the chaotic situation experienced by taxi drivers, which may result in bankruptcy of the system; Excess of Uber vehicles, causing reduction in the quality of the Uber's service	Taxi drivers revolt against the situation; Struggle amongst the uberists because of the excessive number of vehicles, which can generate cannibalism;	Continuity in the use of Uber, even without regulation; Maintenance of the fidelity to the taxi system because of the non- regulation of Uber.

View of the Social Actors on the Possible Future Scenario

	and cannibalism amongst the Uberists; Continuity in the use of Uber services by clients,	Continuity in the use of Uber services by clients,	
Regulation of Uber	Market dispute would be fairer, with reduction in the number of Uber vehicles and price matching; Mass unemployment of Uberists, caused by the reduction in the number of vehicles; Client's dissatisfaction with a possible rise in prices of Uber's rides	taxis, with limitation of vehicles and possible intermediate fare;Uberists may abandon the activity in mass, depending on the terms of the regulation;Reduced use of Uber, and	taxis – 'taxification' of the Uber services;Reduction in the use of uber by passengers (some of them will return to the

To understand the behavior of social actors directly involved in the situation, in-depth interviews with taxi drivers, Uber drivers and users of both services were used as the main source of data collection. Subsequently, in the light of macromarketing and marketing systems, an analysis of the impacts that this new situation had on these social actors was carried out. The analysis of the data showed that there were great impacts in the two studied marketing systems, since: (a) the Uberists had the possibility to reinsert themselves in the job market; (b) taxi drivers had their status quo shaken; and (c) the users started to enjoy a new option of locomotion in the transport segment studied. Thus, the research shows the existence of transformations that occurred in the transport systems (taxi and Uber) studied.

METHODS AND MEASUREMENT

Benjamin Wooliscroft, Auckland University of Technology, NZ Anthony Samuel , Cardiff University, UK



Caravaggio: Painting a Macromarketing Framework in early 1600 Naples

Anthony Samuel, Cardiff University Business School, Wales, UK

This abstract looks to inspire macromarketers to seek out novel conceptual frameworks from outside our traditional academic domains. It is suggested that this could help our community ignite macromarketings potential towards solving wicked problems (Kennedy 2015), improving our quality of life (Ganglmair- Wooliscroft and Wooliscroft 2019) and making the world fairer, safer, cleaner, greener and more just (Oyewole 2001). This paper subsequently presents a working example of this process by drawing upon the much-celebrated Renaissance work of art 'The Seven Acts of Mercy' painted by Michelangelo Merisi Caravaggio (Caravaggio) in 1607, (see Image 1: *The Seven Acts of Mercy*).



Image 1: The Seven Acts of Mercy

The painting is still proudly displayed in its original setting for all to experience; the high altar of the Church of the Pio Monte, Naples, Italy. Following a pilgrimage to see this work, I was taken by surprise to see a strong connection between the paintings subjects and the research conducted by many macromarketers. My macromarketing interpretation was reaffirmed upon reading the art historian Graham-Dixon's (2011. 344) passionate and definitively macro interpretation of the painting:

"The Seven Acts of Mercy is a picture that collapses time and space, drawing the whole world and all the world's histories into its dark centre. Classical antiquity, the Old Testament, the New Testament, the Middle Ages and the present day-every- every epoch is symbolically represented in the different episodes that crowed the canvas. 'Naples is the whole world,' Capaccio wrote, and in Caravaggio's painting a corner of the city has been transformed into precisely that."

As can be seen in image 1, the painting depicts a Neapolitan street scene in the early 1600s. The painting through a biblical interpretation that follows the gospel, according to Matthew (25:36-7) shows seven acts of mercy taking place in one dark corner of the Naples, these being.

- 1. Feeding of the hungry
- 2. Providing water to thirsty
- 3. Clothing the naked
- 4. Housing the stranger/traveller
- 5. Visiting the sick
- 6. Visiting prisoners
- 7. Burial of the dead

This paper posits that each of the seven act of mercy and indeed, the macro place-based lens of Naples has contemporary value and an ability to influence and frame exciting new areas of macromarketing research. Indeed, each of the Seven Acts of Mercy has concreate and abstract relevance to many of the wicked problems and the fall out of aggressive neo-liberal economics that macromarketers seek to unpack and resolve. While Caravaggio's Naples can also become a macromarketing canvas for us to support the need for empirical work in the meso level systems (Peterson 2016) and economics of the places we occupy, construct and conform too (Samuel and Peattie 2015).

While Caravaggio's painting the 'Seven acts of Mercy' can act as both an inspiration and framework for future maromarketing studies. It is hoped this short paper will in some small way allow us to consider the potential for macromarketing inspiration and frameworks to emerge from beyond our typical academic community and perhaps embrace such areas as contemporary music, modern art, movies, novels, architecture etc, to help advance the field.

References

Ganglmair-Wooliscroft, Alexandra., and Wooliscroft, Ben (2019), "Well-Being and Everyday Ethical Consumption," *Journal of Happiness Studies*, 20(1), 141-163.

Graham-Dixon, Andrew (2011), "Caravaggio A Life Sacred and Profane", London, Penguin.

Kennedy, Ann-Marie (2015), "Macro-social Marketing," Journal of Macromarketing, 36(3),354-365. Oyewole, PhilenMarketing," *Journal of Business Ethics*, 29, 239-251.ssociated with the Practice of Green

Peterson, Mark (2016), "Think Macro," Journal of Macromarketing, 36(2), 124-125.

Samuel, Anthony and Ken Peattie (2016), "Grounded theory as a macromarketing methodology:

critical insights from researching the marketing dynamics of Fairtrade Towns," *Journal of Macromarketing*, 36(1), 11-26.

Macromarketing and the Systems Imperative: Systems and the Macromarketing Imperative

Ben Wooliscroft, Auckland University of Technology, New Zealand

Macromarketing is definitionally concerned with systems — marketing, markets and society — and their interactions. This research lays out a case for systems research in macromarketing, the use of methods designed to study systems. In doing so, it highlights the limitations of much micro-marketing research. Early marketing thought was based in an understanding of systems. The Ford Foundation and Carnegie Corportation reports into business education (1959) had a fundamental impact on the direction of marketing education and research – towards reductionist studies. Macromarketing and the *Journal of Macromarketing* is the home of systems research in marketing. Macromarketing scholars need to increase our use of systems research methodologies. Systems must not live in our discipline and journal alone, all social sciences need the insights of systems research and systems research needs the insights of macromarketing.

Reflexive Thematic Analysis: understanding interactions between markets and society (Favourite and Desired clothing as Exemplar)

Bernadette Samau, University of Otago, New Zealand

Consumers buy possessions not only for their functional qualities but also for the symbolic meanings they present (Belk, 1988; Levy, 1959). In the context of favourite and desired clothing, this study investigated the macromarketing phenomena culture, as it relates to possession meanings and the extended self of female, male and transgendered participants aged 18-35 in New Zealand and Samoa. Using Reflexive Thematic Analysis (RTA) to analyse the data set, this study shows how RTA, a micro analysis technique can be applied to study macromarketing phenomena.

Despite some limitations in the flexibility of RTA, this study illustrates, the 6-phase approach to RTA (Familiarising, Generating initial codes, Searching for themes, Reviewing potential themes, Defining and naming themes, Producing the report), provided a coherent, rich interpretation of the data set that offered an in-depth understanding of culture as it relates to expressions of self. From a qualitative approach to research, the main advantage of RTA is that it is theoretically flexible and can be used across inductive vs deductive, experiential vs critical orientation to data, and essentialist vs constructionist theoretical perspectives (Braun & Clarke, 2012).

This study demonstrated that RTA is a useful, flexible data analysis tool to understanding markets, market systems and macromarketing variables as it is not tied to a particular theoretical framework. This means, compared to research methodologies that are attached to theory and fixed research frameworks, there are no methodological conditions for sampling, collecting data and coding in RTA. Data analysis can be conducted in an inductive, deductive, semantic, latent, realist and a constructionist way (Braun et al., 2019).

References

Belk, R. (1988). Possessions and the Extended Self. Journal of Consumer Research, 15(2), 139-168.

- Braun, V., & Clarke, V. (2012). Thematic Analysis. In H. Cooper, P. Camic, M., D. Long, L., A. Panter, T., D. Rindskopf, & K. Sher, J (Eds.), APA handbook of research methods in psychology, Vol. 2. Research designs: Quantitative, qualitative, neuropsychological, and biological (Vol. 2, pp. 57-71). Washington, DC: American Psychological Association.
- Braun, V., Clarke, V., Hayfield, N., & Terry, G. (2019). Thematic Analysis. In P. Liamputtong (Ed.), Handbook of Research Methods in Health Social Sciences (pp. 843-860). Singapore: Springer Singapore.

Levy, S. (1959). Symbols for Sale. Harvard Business Review, 37(4), 117.

Dynamic Meanings in Marketing Systems

Shoaib M. Farooq Padela, Auckland University of Technology, New Zealand Ben Wooliscroft, Auckland University of Technology, New Zealand Alexandra Ganglmair-Wooliscroft, Massey University, New Zealand

Marketing systems are dynamic (Layton 2007; 2011). Recognising the meaning infrastructures is imperative for understanding dynamism in marketing systems (Kadirov and Varey 2011), considering the ubiquity of signs and systems (Venkatesh 1999). This paper considers findings from semiotics and macromarketing. It establishes the origin and reciprocity of product assortment meanings and conceptualises brand assortments. Marketing systems are characterised with the individual and shared meanings that emerge, evolve, and flow across the system through individual idiosyncrasies and social interactions (Eckhardt and Bengtsson 2015; Kadirov and Varey 2011). Meanings are dynamic; stakeholders form and reform subjective meanings from personal and social experience (Tharp and Scott 1990). Conejo and Wooliscroft (2015) noted that brands emerge from processes where stakeholders cocreate and share meanings within a marketing system. Brand assortments are proposed to emerge from an amalgamation of meanings with product assortments through social interactions. They create meanings through symbolic unfolding (Kadirov and Varey 2011) that indicates the reorganization and reassembling of existing meaning structures into new patterns. Meanings create assortment discrepancies leading to change in assortment diversity over time (Layton and Duan 2015). Brand assortments produce another feedback loop through brand externalities. Brand externalities are meaning-led discrepancies and symbolic spill-overs in a marketing system (Padela, Wooliscroft and Ganglmair-Wooliscroft 2019). The feedback loops of brand externalities and meanings generate new meanings and assortments, changing the holistic character of the marketing system over time. This phenomenon is sketched as a Model of Dynamic Meanings. This model indicates the positive and negative forces at play within a marketing system. It allows the scholars to comprehend how the marketing system changes in response to these forces. Understanding the feedback loops from brand assortments potentially contributes to address concerns of sustainability and distributive justice and improve the quality of life (Ferrell and Ferrell 2008; Peterson 2012).

References

- Conejo, F., & Wooliscroft, B. (2015). Brands Defined as Semiotic Marketing Systems. Journal of Macromarketing, 35(3), 287-301.
- Eckhardt, G. M., & Bengtsson, A. (2015). Brand Meaning Rigidity in China. *Journal of Macromarketing*, 35(2), 218-228.
- Ferrell, O. C., & Ferrell, L. (2008). A Macromarketing Ethics Framework: Stakeholder Orientation and Distributive Justice. *Journal of Macromarketing*, 28(1), 24-32.
- Kadirov, D., & Varey, R. J. (2011). Symbolism in Marketing Systems. *Journal of Macromarketing*, 31(2), 160-171.

- Layton, R. A. (2007). Marketing Systems—A Core Macromarketing Concept. *Journal of Macromarketing*, 27(3), 227-242.
- Layton, R. A. (2011). Towards a theory of marketing systems. *European Journal of Marketing*, 45(1/2), 259-276.
- Layton, R. A., & Duan, Z. (2015). Diversity in Marketing System Assortments. Journal of Macromarketing, 35(3), 320-333.
- Layton, R. A., & Duan, Z. (2015). Diversity in Marketing System Assortments. Journal of Macromarketing, 35(3), 320-333.
- Padela, S. M. F., Wooliscroft, B., & Ganglmair-Wooliscroft, A. (2019). Brand Externalities: A Taxonomy. In T. Facca-Miess, A.-M. Kennedy, & N. Santos (Eds.), *Proceedings of the Macromarketing Conference 2019* (pp. 279-314). Laramie, Wyoming, USA: Macromarketing Society Inc.
- Peterson, M. (2012). *Sustainable Enterprise: A Macromarketing Approach*. Thousand Oaks, California: Sage Publications.
- Tharp, M., & Scott, L. M. (1990). The Role of Marketing Processes in Creating Cultural Meaning. Journal of Macromarketing, 10(2), 47-60.
- Venkatesh, A. (1999). Postmodernism Perspectives for Macromarketing: An Inquiry into the Global Information and Sign Economy. *Journal of Macromarketing*, 19(2), 153-169.

POLICY AND MACROMARKETING Les Carlson, University of Nebraska-Lincoln



Alternative Banking Services: A Consumers' Perspective on the Banking System

Heather Patterson, Iowa State University, USA

Samantha Cross, Iowa State University, USA

The traditional banking system is designed to serve consumers who have an adequate level of financial resources. Restrictions, such as high fees for bounced checks and fees for not maintaining a minimum account balance, can make maintaining a checking or savings account expensive for consumers living paycheck to paycheck (Hill 2012). Many consumers turn to alternative banking services as a way to replace or supplement traditional banking institutions from which they feel excluded (Barr 2004). While this study was conducted using US participants, financial exclusion is a global issue (Solo 2008). The number of people with a bank account is growing, but there are still many people both in the US and worldwide without this resource. In the US, 6.5% of households have no bank account (Sweet 2018) and 18% of households are underbanked; these percentages are even higher in minority communities (Apaam et al. 2017). World-wide, approximately 31% of households report not having a bank account (Demirguc-Kunt, Klapper, Singer, Ansar and Hess 2018). For those without a traditional bank account or who are underbanked, alternative banking services provide needed options. In the US, these alternative services include payday loans, check cashing services, and apps like Earnin. However, many of these alternative banking services often come with high interest rates.

Payday loans are small, short-term, high interest loans that borrowers can obtain without collateral (Schwartz and Robinson 2018). Twelve million consumers use payday loans each year (Bennett 2019) with an average loan of \$375 (Bourke, Horowitz and Roche 2012). The interest rate on a typical payday loan, when fees are included, can exceed 400% (Bourke et al. 2012). Paying such high interest rates for a small short-term loan has a negative impact on the future finances for the borrower (Bronson and Smith 2016). This, in turn, has implications for the consumer's future ability to participate in a marketing system and, ultimately, for overall income inequality and financial well-being (Pressman and Scott 2009). Given their high interest rates and a customer base with limited options, alternative banking services, such as payday loan businesses, are generally viewed as predatory lenders who are taking advantage of vulnerable consumers (Bhutta, Goldin, and Homonoff 2016). Policies in sixteen states in the US have banned high interest payday loans, while others have limited the interest rates that can be charged (Leonhardt 2018).

Access to alternative banking options can simultaneously have both positive short-term and negative long-term effects. The access to a loan may facilitate a consumers' ability to make needed purchases and affect their present quality of life, as these loans provide a safety net at a difficult time (Bhutta et al. 2016). Yet, they also put consumers in a precarious position when they need to repay these loans (Skiba and Tobacman 2008). Thus, the decision to take out payday loans is not simply an isolated decision by ill-informed consumers, but needs to be understood in light of the consumer's perception of his or her available options; past, present and anticipated decisions; and as part of a larger system of societal inequities and constraints that lead consumers to believe that they are making the right, or seemingly only viable, choice at that moment. In addition to the practical financial implications that come

from financial constraints, there are emotional and psychological implications for those who feel excluded from the mainstream system.

This research uses depth interviews in the context of payday loans and other alternative banking services to better understand how consumers with limited resources navigate the financial services industry and the role of alternative banking services in the wider system. Preliminary data reveal several findings. First, some borrowers have had negative interactions with banks that have reduced their trust in traditional banks yet left them open to trusting alternative lenders. Second, borrowers feel shame from being constrained to alternative banking options that have negative stereotypes. Shame is an emotion associated with feelings of inferiority and unworthiness and is linked to subsequent low self-efficacy (Sadeghein 2019). Third, borrowers are simultaneously frustrated with the high cost of payday loans and appreciative that the loan was available. Participants reported feeling taken advantage of but also that they would recommend a payday loan to a friend in a similar situation. Thus, these alternative banking services are almost seen as a necessary evil, with consumers feeling both gratitude and frustration, given their limited options.

While this research was conducted in a US context, financial inclusion is a global issue and the insights drawn from this research correlate with those seen in Latin America. For instance, Solo (2008) found that unbanked households in both Mexico City and Bogotá reported high charges and lack of trust as reasons for being unbanked. Alternative banking services in these Latin American cities had similarly high interest rates of more than 400% (Solo 2008). Whether in US cities or in Columbian cities like Bogota, financial exclusion is costly to consumers and makes it more difficult for them to progress financially (Solo 2008).

A better understanding of the circumstances under which borrowers choose an alternative banking service, and the value they derive from these services, will help to inform policies geared towards financial institutions in general, and in particular, alternative banking services (Cook and Sadeghein 2018). Policy has the power to increase financial inclusion and, as such, it is important for policy makers to create policies not just to protect vulnerable consumers, but also to focus on inclusion, giving consumers options that work for their particular circumstances.

References

Apaam, Gerald, Susan Burhouse, Karyen Chu, Keith Ernst, Kathryn Fritzdixon, Ryan Goodstein, and J Weinstein (2017), "FDIC national survey of unbanked and underbanked households." *Federal Deposit Insurance Corporation*, 994-1006.

Barr, Michael S. (2004), "Banking the Poor." Yale Journal on Regulation, 21 (1), 121-238.

Bennett, Jeannette N. (2019), "Fast Cash and Payday Loans," Page One Economics, (April).

- Bhutta, Neil, Jacob Goldin, and Tatiana Homonoff (2016), "Consumer Borrowing after Payday Loan Bans." *The Journal of Law and Economics*, 59 (1), 225-259.
- Bourke, Nick, Alex Horowitz, and Tara Roche (2012), "Payday Lending in America: Who Borrows, Where They Borrow, and Why," Washington, DC: Pew Charitable Trusts.

- Bronson, Christy, and Daniel J Smith (2018), "Swindled or Served?: A Survey of Payday Lending Customers in Southeast Alabama: A Survey of Payday Lending Customers in Southeast Alabama," *Southern Business and Economics Journal*, 40 (1), 16-32.
- Cook, Laurel Aynne, and Raika Sadeghein (2018), "Effects of perceived scarcity on financial decision making," *Journal of Public Policy and Marketing*, 37 (1), 68-87.
- Demirguc-Kunt, Asli, Leora Klapper, Dorothe Singer, Saniya Ansar, and Jake Hess (2018), "The Global Findex Database 2017: Measuring financial inclusion and the fintech revolution," The World Bank.
- Hill, Julie Andersen (2012), "Transaction Account Fees: Do the Poor Really Pay More than the Rich," University of Pennsylvania Journal of Business Law, 15(1), 65-132.
- Leonhardt, Megan (2018), "This map shows the states where payday loans charge nearly 700 percent interest," (accessed February 9, 2020), [available at https://www.cnbc.com/2018/08/03/states-with-the-highest-payday-loan-rates.html].
- Pressman, Steven, and Robert Scott (2009), "Consumer Debt and the Measurement of Poverty and Inequality in the US," *Review of Social Economy*, 67 (2), 127-148.
- Sadeghein, Raika (2019), "Shame and Guilt: The Good, the Bad, and the Ugly," Graduate Theses, Dissertations, and Problem Reports, [available at https://researchrepository.wvu.edu/etd/3767].
- Schwartz, Mark S, and Chris Robinson (2018), "A corporate social responsibility analysis of payday lending," *Business and Society Review*, 123 (3), 387-413.
- Skiba, Paige Marta, and Jeremy Tobacman (2008), "Payday loans, uncertainty and discounting: explaining patterns of borrowing, repayment, and default," *Vanderbilt Law and Economics Research Paper*, 08-33.
- Solo, Tova María (2008), "Financial exclusion in Latin America—or the social costs of not banking the urban poor," *Environment and Urbanization*, 20 (1), 47-66.
- Sweet, Ken (2018), "Americans who don't have a bank account at lowest level ever," (accessed March 13, 2020), [available at https://apnews.com/8b2b93d4e9474c418853e0f20e79aaa8].

A Global Phenomenal in a Sports Fanatic Country: Reality and Policy Challenges of Sports Betting in Brazil

Ramon Silva Leite, Pontifical Catholic University of Minas Gerais, Brazil

Francisco Cláudio Freitas Silva, Pontificia Universidade Católica de Minas Gerais, Brazil

Public authorities' efforts to legalize sports betting have recently emerged in Brazil. In December 2018, the Federal Government enacted Law 13.756/2018 (Daroit, 2019), which began a two-year period for the Ministry of Economy to establish the regulations concerning the sector. In September 2019, the proposed decree that will guide the regulation of sports betting in the country was officially published (Ministerio da Economia, 2019).

By combining sporting events and betting - a billionaire market that has been strengthened in recent years by the evolution of new technologies and the improvement of online betting - the debates on the legalization of sports betting attract special attention from government and society, given the possibility of unwanted externalities that their consumption can cause - both for consumers of the product and for different social actors.

Given that, from a macromarketing perspective, the regulatory intention should focus on the balance in exchange relations, aiming at the fundamental interest of society in general, it is evident, however, that the procedures of the public power before the regularization of the activity in the country are limited, inconsistent and clearly underestimate the complex implications that the operation of this market brings to society.

Therefore, this article uses the perspective of macromarketing to analyze the proclaimed conjuncture, bringing to light the main topics pertinent to the subject through a holistic approach in order to evaluate the challenges, benefits and costs - even if complex - inherent to the regulation of this activity in Brazilian society, thus being the main objective of the study.

To this end, this study first elucidates how the sports betting market operates. Subsequently, the role of the state in the regulation of sports betting is discussed, regarding the main dimensions related to the phenomenon under analysis, which are: economic perspective, public health, legality/illegality, sports integrity, and advertising. Next, these five issues are examined in the Brazilian context, taking into account the current position of the public power before this market.

When significant economic and social consequences are linked to marketing activities, it is up to the public authorities to implement well defined policies that ensure the full functioning of the marketing system, in order to converge it, above all, to the general needs of society (Ho, 2005). Nonetheless, in the case of sports betting in Brazil, for the time being, this is not the case.

Brazil has the largest economy in Latin America and one of the ten largest in the world. It has the sixth largest sports aficionado population in the world - mainly team sports, such as soccer - and with gradual access to the Internet, principally through smartphones. Despite recent regularization efforts, it is a fact that the market and the demand for sports betting already exist here, and they are in full swing, even

on the fringes of the law. It is estimated that there are already more than 500 sites offering this kind of bets to Brazilians, moving figures over \$1 billion per year (Daroit, 2019). This scenario indicates that the Brazilian sports betting market is not only a reality, but also presents great potential for growth from the respective regularization.

Nevertheless, Brazilians' coexistence with the practice of sports betting has only emerged after the recent boom in sports betting sites, and the Brazilian legal betting market is historically managed by a federal government agency, which holds almost the total monopoly of the sector. This situation has given rise to the fact that not only the public authorities are unfamiliar with the subject, but also society as a whole.

Thus, analyzing the role of the state in the face of the potential negative social effects of the expansion and regularization of sports betting proves to be a current and relevant action not only for Brazil, but also for several countries unfamiliar with this market, especially online – a phenomenon of increasingly global and borderless strain.

References

Daroit, G. (2019). *Brasil, o bilhete da vez nas apostas esportivas. Jornal do Comércio.* 22/04/2019. Retrieved from <u>https://www.jornaldocomercio.com/_conteudo/cadernos/empresas_e_negocios/2019/04/679514-</u> brasil-o-bilhete-da-vez-nas-apostas-esportivas.html

Ho, S. C. (2005). Evolution versus tradition in marketing systems: the Hong Kong food-retailing experience. *Journal of Public Policy & Marketing*, 24(1), 90-99.

Ministerio da Economia. (2019). *Minuta*. Retrieved from <u>http://www.economia.gov.br/acesso-a-informacao/participacao-social/consultas-publicas/arquivos/cp-02_minuta-de-decreto.docx</u>.

QUALITY OF LIFE

Alexandra Ganglmair-Wooliscroft, University of Otago New Zealand Ahmet Ekici, Bilkent University, Turkey



Consumers' Perceptions of the Role of the Marketing System in Subjective Well-Being

Farias, Valcir. M., Pontificia Universidade Católica de Minas Gerais, Brasil.

Leite, Ramon Silva, Pontifical Catholic University of Minas Gerais, Brazil

Happiness is a term colloquially used to refer to subjective well-being (Kuykendall, Tay & NG, 2015), therefore, in this article they shall be used interchangeably. Subjective well-being refers to a myriad of positive results in areas such as better social relationships, healthcare and success at work (Lyubomirsky, King, & Diener, 2005; Diener & Chan, 2011), being it, therefore, an important indicator of social progress (Diener & Seligman, 2004).

Indeed, it must be considered that the report issued by UNO about the levels of happiness in society throughout 2018 (Rojas, 2018), shows that in Latin America, including Brazil, the level of happiness is high, despite poverty, insecurity, corruption and poor income distribution.

Based on Rojas' studies (2018), it can be noted that whenever marketing systems had their performance compromised as a result of different issues, it led to shrinkage of the levels of happiness, showing that marketing systems do affect individuals' and society's subjective well-being. Rojas (2018) showed us that the index of happiness in Brazil has decreased whenever the population's access to consumption diminished, and that whenever marketing systems played a role to increase consumption, the levels of happiness also grew. Such perceptions seem to have been corroborated by the data gathered from IBGE (Brazilian Institute of Geography and Statistics) in 2018 regarding family budget in Brazil, as well as data from other Latin American countries.

Most studies about the influence of marketing systems upon subjective well-being focus on mature markets. More recently, studies on developing markets such as Turkey have been presented (see Peterson, M., and Ekici, A., 2007; Ekici, A., and Peterson, M., 2009; Peterson, M., Ekici A., and Hunt D., 2010). There is a lack of research about it regarding Latin American markets, perhaps due to a historical process. These cultures have to struggle with important issues, such as corruption, violence and crime rates, economic distress, an average per capita income, public goods which are reasonably available to all, and an average provision of healthcare and education services in most countries, whilst aiming at generating high levels of happiness. Therefore, this theoretical gap justifies the undertaking of writing this article.

The aim of this study is to describe the influence of the marketing system upon the subjective well-being of Brazilian consumers. In order to do so, 15 semi- structured interviews in the mid area of the state of Minas Gerais have been conducted and for their analyses Bardin's content approach (2011) has been used.

It was found that for consumers in cities of different sizes and levels of economic development, in general, subjective well-being can be guaranteed by accessing products, experiences, services and ideas provided by marketing systems.

The article contributes to a possible expansion of this field of knowledge taking into account the different consumption patterns provided by the marketing system in each city. From the theoretical point

of view, it presents a range of options to be studied, both positive contributions such as consumerism and socio-environmental responsibility, as well as the negative aspects of marketing, that is, consumerism, unethical issues, the negative between relationships marketing and the environment.

Making Macromarketing Meaningful: A Eudaimonic View of Quality of Life and Consumer Well-being

Aditya Gupta, Illinois State University, USA

James Gentry, University of Nebraska-Lincoln, USA

While Quality of Life (QOL) and Consumer Well-Being (CWB) continue to be the focus of much macromarketing research (e.g., Lee et al. 2002; Sirgy and Lee 2006; Sirgy, Lee, and Rahtz 2007), we believe that a significant theoretical gap exists in terms of how well-being is defined. Consequently, we argue that adopting a eudaimonic approach to CWB can usefully extend this stream of research.

When it comes to macromarketing and well-being, the conceptualization and empirical validation of CWB by Sirgy and Lee (2006; see also Sirgy et al. 2008) represents a major theoretical advance that adopts a broader perspective on quality of life to focus on six consumer processes: acquisition, possession, preparation, consumption, maintenance, and disposition. Well-being, however, is a complex construct that continues to be studied in a variety of ways (see Lambert et al. 2015). Consequently, as our collective understanding of well-being evolves, so should the macromarketing view of well-being. In this regard, a potential way forward in expanding the ambit of macromarketing research lies in the increasingly popular concept of eudaimonia or meaningful happiness.

Dating back to Aristotle's writings in *Nicomachean Ethics* (4th Century B.C.E./1985), the eudaimonic perspective has recently emerged as a robust alternative to the more popular hedonic perspective in the study of well-being (Ryan and Deci 2001; Sirgy 2012; Sirgy et al. 2016). While hedonia is linked to pleasure, positive affect and/or the absence of negative affect, eudaimonia encompasses a much broader range of factors that include, among others, meaningfulness, full-functioning, and self-realization (Ryff 1989; Vittersø 2016; Waterman 1993). Given this background, we feel that a key limitation of Sirgy et al. (2008)'s processual approach to measuring CWB is its central focus on consumer satisfaction as a proxy for well-being. While satisfaction is often linked to well-being, it is still unable to encompass several factors that are inextricably linked to consumer experiences (see Hirschman and Holbrook 1982; Holbrook and Hirschman 1982) or account for the multi-dimensional nature of meaningful happiness (Ryff 1989). Consequently, we propose a conceptual expansion of CWB research within macromarketing by introducing a six-dimension framework of eudaimonia within the existing processual framework of CWB.

Ryff's (1989) framework specifies six dimensions of eudaimonic well-being: autonomy, environmental mastery, personal growth, positive relationships, purpose, and self-acceptance. Briefly, autonomy refers to the importance of being independent in guiding one's actions; environmental mastery refers to the sense of control people feel with regard to internal and external factors in order to create a conducive environment for themselves; personal growth encompasses feelings of personal development by facing new challenges; positive relationships comprise the sense of relatedness and empathy people feel in terms of their social relationships; purpose refers to a person's sense of direction; and selfacceptance indicates the degree to which the person likes and accepts the person she/he is in totality. In line with this, we propose a 6x6 framework for looking at eudaimonic consumer well-being (ECWB). Specifically, we recommend that each stage of the consumption process should be looked at in terms of each dimension of eudaimonic well-being to analyze the extent to which that stage has one or more of the eudaimonic dimensions associated with it. For instance, during the acquisition stage consumers might experience autonomy (if they are not resource-constrained), environmental mastery (if they are expert buyers), and positive relationships (if they are with close family members). Naturally, while all dimensions may not be equally relevant for all stages, such a detailed analytical exercise can provide a much more nuanced approach for marketers looking to positively impact well-being across all stages of the consumption experience.

A framework for ECWB, therefore, has the potential to enrich macromarketing discourse by enabling a more detailed look at how: (a) consumers experience well-being in the market; (b) marketers can impact such experiences of well-being; and (c) other stakeholders such as policy makers impact such provision and experience of well-being. By doing so, the macromarketing domain can not only keep pace with the changing landscape of well-being research but also provide a useful contribution to extant academic understanding of marketers' role in promoting well-being among consumers through the marketplace.

References

Aristotle (4th Century B.C.E./1985), Nicomachean Ethics, Trans. T. Irwin, Indianapolis, IN: Hackett.

- Hirschman, Elizabeth C. and Morris B. Holbrook (1982), "Hedonic Consumption: Emerging Concepts, Methods and Propositions," *Journal of Marketing*, 46 (Summer), 92-101.
- Holbrook, Morris B. and Elizabeth C. Hirschman (1982), "The Experiential Aspects of Consumption: Consumer Fantasies, Feelings, and Fun," *Journal of Consumer Research*, 9 (2), 132-40.
- Lambert, Louise, Holli-Anne Passmore, and Mark D. Holder (2015), "Foundational Frameworks of Positive Psychology: Mapping Well-Being Orientations," *Canadian Psychology/Psychologie Canadienne*, 56 (3), 311-21.
- Lee, Dong-Jin, M. Joseph Sirgy, Val Larsen, and Newell D. Wright (2002), "Developing a Subjective Measure of Consumer Well-Being," *Journal of Macromarketing*, 22 (2), 158-69.
- Ryan, Richard M. and Edward L. Deci (2001), "On Happiness and Human Potentials: A Review of Research on Hedonic and Eudaimonic Well-Being," *Annual Review of Psychology*, 52 (1), 141-66.
- Ryff, Carol D. (1989), "Happiness Is Everything, Or Is It? Explorations on the Meaning of Psychological Well-Being," *Journal of Personality and Social Psychology*, 57 (6), 1069-81.
- Sirgy, Joseph M. (2012). The psychology of quality of life: Hedonic well-being, life satisfaction, and eudaimonia (Vol. 50). Springer Science & Business Media.
- Sirgy, M. Joseph and Dong-Jin Lee (2006), "Macro Measures of Consumer Well-Being (CWB): A Critical Analysis and a Research Agenda," *Journal of Macromarketing*, 26 (1), 27-44.
- Sirgy, M. Joseph, Dong-Jin Lee, and Don Rahtz (2007), "Research on Consumer Well-Being (CWB): Overview of the Field and Introduction to the Special Issue," *Journal of Macromarketing*, 27 (4), 341-49.

- Sirgy, M. Joseph, Dong-Jin Lee, Stephan Grzeskowiak, Jean-Charles Chebat, J. S. Johar, Andreas Hermann, Salah Hassan, Ibrahim Hegazy, Ahmet Ekici, Dave Webb, Chenting Su, and Jordi Montana (2008), "An Extension and Further Validation of a Community-Based Consumer Well-Being Measure," *Journal of Macromarketing*, 28 (3), 243-57.
- Sirgy, M. Joseph, Dong-Jin Lee, B. Yu Grace, Eda Gurel-Atay, John Tidwell, and Ahmet Ekici (2016), "Self-Expressiveness in Shopping," *Journal of Retailing and Consumer Services*, 30, 292-99.
- Vittersø, Joar (2016), Handbook of Eudaimonic Well-Being, Cham: Springer International Publishing.
- Waterman, Alan S. (1993), "Two Conceptions of Happiness: Contrasts of Personal Expressiveness (Eudaimonia) and Hedonic Enjoyment," *Journal of Personality and Social Psychology*, 64 (4), 678-91.

How Does Economic Inequality Impact Consumer Well-being: A Case in China

Yimin Huang, Department of Marketing, Macquarie University, Australia

Jie Meng, Institute for Digital Technologies, Loughborough University, UK

Rongwei Chu, School of Marketing, Fudan University, China

Jian Yang, Department of Computer Science, Macquarie University, Australia

Economic inequality may intensify directly or indirectly the cognitive dissonance, increases affective disorder, and deepen social divisions, hence, leading to salient differences in social standing (Kerbo 2011, Wilkinson and Pickett 2010). More inequality arises and becomes a force for social divergence (Piketty 2014). In light of this, economic inequality is not just a term about financial capitals, but the interpretation of its consequences should be annotated with far-reaching social impact.

This paper investigates via a qualitative study the social impact of economic inequality and its effect on CWB. CWB is best informed by economic-based notions such as income and wealth. A generally positive association between economic indicators and CWB has been reported in the literature, however, only weak relationship has been identified (Diener et al. 2003, Ahuvia and Friedman 1998, Clark et al. 2008). This is largely because most research has focused on the direct effects of income on CWB and neglected the social, institutional and cultural context where economic inequality exists (Huang et al. 2019). It is likely that there are potentially unobserved indirect or interactional effects of economic indicators, leading to a lack of certainty on causality.

With a focus on China as a developing country struggling with a high level of economic inequality, this research aims to answer how economic inequality affects consumer well-being through indirect and interactive effects. We take a qualitative approach using multiple-case design (Eisenhardt 1989). Following the theoretical sampling principles (Pettigrew 1990), 12 rural-urban migrant workers in Shanghai, China were recruited for case studies who work as cooks, cleaners, factory workers, truck drivers, secretaries for small businesses and street venders. Their annual incomes are far below the average annual salary in Shanghai (National Bureau of Statistics of China 2014) and none of them have been granted local household registration in Shanghai (Hukou), which denies their access to the urban social welfare system such as housing loans, health care, education and insurance.

The findings reveal that low-income earners would have a high level of life satisfaction. Economic inequality interacts with social, cultural and institutional environment to influence individuals' cognitive, emotional and behavioral choices that lead to variances of consumer well-being. This provides new evidence that the correlation between income and life satisfaction is not linear. Life satisfaction results from meeting innate needs rather than meeting desires not related to needs (Diener et al. 2003). The fulfilment of valued needs influences how satisfied people feel with their lives. The effects of economic inequality on life satisfaction take place through its impact on what are valued needs and how they are fulfilled. This paper fills the knowledge gap to reveal the indirect and interactive effects of economic inequality on consumer well-being. It renders important implications for practitioners and policy makers as well. When economic inequality cannot be removed easily, efforts to reduce social and institutional inequality are essential to mitigate the detrimental effect of economic inequality on consumer well-being in the long run.

References

- Ahuvia, A. C. & Friedman, D. C. 1998. 'Income, Consumption, and Subjective Well-being: Toward a Composite Macromarketing Model.' *Journal of Macromarketing*, 18:2, 153-68.
- Clark, A., Frijters, P. & Shields, M. A. 2008. 'A Survey of the Income Happiness Gradient.' *Journal of Economic Literature*, 46:1, 95-144.
- Diener, E., Oishi, S. & Lucas, R. E. 2003. 'Personality, Culture, and Subjective Well-being: Emotional and Cognitive Evaluation of Life.' *Annual Review of Psychology*, 54, 403-25.
- Huang, Y., Chu, R. & Cheng, J. 2019. 'Exploring Life Satisfaction among Subsistence Migrant Consumers: A Case in China.' *Journal of Public Policy and Marketing*, 38:1, 96-109.
- Kerbo, H. R. 2011. The Persistence of Cambodian Poverty: From the Killing Fields to Today. McFarland.

Piketty, T. 2014. Capital in the Twenty-First Century. Harvard University Press.

Wilkinson, R. & Pickett, K. 2010. The Spirit Level: Why Equality is Better for Everyone. Penguin.

Macromarketing Metrics of Consumer Well-Being: An Update

M. Joseph Sirgy, Virginia Polytechnic Institute & State University, USA

This presentation serves to provide an update of the research related to the various constructs and metrics of consumer well-being. Specifically, I'll review the research to date concerning several conceptualizations and metrics of consumer well-being from both public and academic sectors (see Table 1). Public sector metrics include Cost of Living, Total Consumption Expenditure, Consumer Complaint, and Quality. Selected contributions to consumer well-being metrics from the academic sector include Shopping Satisfaction, Shopping Well-Being, Possession Satisfaction, Acquisition/Possession Satisfaction, Consumption Life Cycle, Community, Need Satisfaction, Perceived Value in Life, and Bottom-up Spillover. I'll then provide some thoughts about how these metrics can be improved and ideas that may spur future research. In doing so, I'll address issues related to construct validity to public sector metrics by demonstrating association with newly established constructs of well-being (e.g., eudaimonia, social well-being) and introducing moderating effects of individual differences (e.g., consumer involvement, consumer lifestyle) as well as product-related differences (e.g., experiential versus material consumption; marketplace activities related to luxury versus nonluxury goods and services; and products beneficial to society versus "sin" products).

Metrics from the Public Sector	Metrics from the Academic Sector
 Cost of Living Index Total Consumption Expenditure Index Consumer Complaint Quality 	 Shopping Satisfaction Shopping Well-Being Possession Satisfaction Acquisition/Possession Satisfaction Consumption Life Cycle Community Need Satisfaction Perceived Value in Life Bottom-up Spillover

TABLE 1: Various Conceptualizations and Metrics of Consumer Well-Being

RETAILING AND DISTRIBUTION Charles Ingene, University of Oklahoma, USA



Household Expenditures at Food and Beverage Retailers in Japan

Si Chen

Charles Ingene, University of Oklahoma, USA

Our presentation assesses the determinants of household expenditure patterns at off-premise food and beverage (F&B) retailers in Japan using data from the most recent (2012) business census. We have data for 786 cities that collectively house 91% of Japan's population. We offer three basic contributions. First, we determine how expenditures by a city's daytime population (residents plus non-residents) affects F&B expenditures. Second, we show how intra-type and intertype competition affect a city's expenditure levels. Third, we use two managerially controlled mediators between expenditures and our determinant variables. We find expenditures at F&B retailers to be (1) positively associated with daytime population; (2) negatively associated with intra-type competition (i.e., supercenters); and (3) positively associated with intertype competition (i.e., restaurants). Our managerial control variables (product assortment and customer service) mediate the effects of independent variables on household expenditures.

SOCIAL CONFLICT

Andrés Barrios, Universidad de los Andes, Colombia Cliff Shultz, Loyola University Chicago, US



(Dis) trust effect on entrepreneurial development: the case of a stigmatized community-based enterprise

Andres Barrios, Universidad de los Andes, Colombia

Alan Wagenberg, Universidad Externado, Colombia

Entrepreneurship can be used as a tool to promote social change. It can contribute to finding solutions to social problems, such as health, poverty, and education; and helps to fill the gap when governments or large businesses are absent, or there is a market failure (Miles, Crispin, and Kasouf 2011). For example, entrepreneurs' social interaction, bedrock of the local marketing system, promotes the community and enhances social capital and resilience (Viswanathan, Echambadi, Venugopal, & Sridharan 2014). Recent research has shown how in post-conflict settings, entrepreneurship could be an effective alternative to introduce demobilized combatants to civil society as they provide models for economic survival (Tobias, Mair, & Barbosa-Leiker, 2013), cooperation (Abdelnour & Branzei, 2010), and serves as a vehicle for societal reintegration (Barrios et al. 2019).

One of the key elements for starting and growing a business is trust (Höhmann and Welter, 2005). Previous studies have observed how trust is a crucial ingredient in different types of organizations such as family business (Fink, 2010), or franchises (Davies et al., 2011). Studies have also analyzes the trust role in entrepreneurs relation with funders such as business angels, venture capitalists (Maxwell and Lévesque, 2011), and banks (Howorth and Moro, 2006), also in processes such as buyer–supplier relationships (Şengün and Nazli Wasti, 2009), and in internationalization of small business (Fink and Kessler, 2010).

Despite the previous advancements studies have focused only on the relational aspects of trust on a single level and with non-stigmatized groups. However, trust is a complex construct that operates differently across personal, collective, or institutional level (Höhmann and Malieva, 2005), and in connection to the micro, meso and macro spaces where it occurs (Humphrey and Schmitz, 1998). The three dimensions are dynamically bounded by temporal, social, spatial and institutional contexts. That is, trust level varies as social interactions evolves, and according to the context one trust type level is highlighted while others do not. This study analyzes how these different levels of trust operate and relate to each other, and how they influence entrepreneurial development.

To do this, a review of literature pertaining to trust at a macro, meso, and micro levels, and its impact on entrepreneurship is developed. Then we present a case study analyzing how trust, or the lack of it, has impacted the entrepreneurial development of a stigmatized community-based enterprise (CBE) formed by ex-combatants of a communist oriented guerrilla group in Colombia. Data was collected through one year and involves, observation, casual conversations, and long interviews about the development and business dynamic of this CBE.

Preliminary findings reveal different trust dynamics and tensions across levels. a) At a macro level, ex-combatants' distrust in the capitalist system limits their access to market and use of legal instruments b) At the meso level, ex-combatants' lack of trust from and towards other organizations, army and banks

respectively increases the transactional costs, and increases their isolation c) At a micro level, excombatants trust other individuals (e.g. soldiers) despite the lack of trust of related institutions at the macro and meso levels, but also are affected by greater uncertainty.

These findings are further discussed in terms of the processes by which trust is developed from different cultural contexts, and how this contributes to the Macromarketing and entrepreneurship literature. The paper ends describing different recommendations to promote multilevel trust in different cultural contexts.

References

- Abdelnour, S., & Branzei, O. (2010). Fuel-efficient stoves for Darfur: The social construction of subsistence marketplaces in post-conflict settings. *Journal of Business Research*, 63(6), 617-629.
- Barrios, A., Shultz, C., & Joya, J. C. M. (2019). Entrepreneurship as Boundary Object: Toward Reintegration of Colombia's Ex-Militants into Civil Society. *Journal of Macromarketing*, 39(4), 368-384.
- Davies, M. A., Lassar, W., Manolis, C., Prince, M., & Winsor, R. D. (2011). A model of trust and compliance in franchise relationships. *Journal of Business Venturing*, *26*(3), 321-340.
- Fink, M. (2010). Trust-based cooperation relationships between SMEs-are family firms any different?. *International Journal of Entrepreneurial Venturing*, *1*(4), 382-397.
- Fink, M., & Kessler, A. (2010). Cooperation, trust and performance–empirical results from three countries. *British Journal of Management*, 21(2), 469-483.
- Höhmann, H. H., & Welter, F. (Eds.). (2005). *Trust and entrepreneurship: A West-East perspective*. Edward Elgar Publishing.
- Höhmann, H. H., & Malieva, E. (2005). The concept of trust: Some notes on definitions, forms and sources. *Trust and Entrepreneurship*, 7-23.
- Howorth, C., & Moro, A. (2006). Trust within entrepreneur bank relationships: Insights from Italy. *Entrepreneurship Theory and Practice*, *30*(4), 495-517.
- Humphrey, J., & Schmitz, H. (1998). Trust and inter-firm relations in developing and transition economies. *The Journal of Development Studies*, *34*(4), 32-61.
- Maxwell, A. L., Jeffrey, S. A., & Lévesque, M. (2011). Business angel early stage decision making. *Journal of Business Venturing*, 26(2), 212-225.
- Morrish, S., Miles, M. P., Crispin, S., & Kasouf, C. J. (2011). Entrepreneurship's relevance to marketing. *Journal of Research in Marketing and Entrepreneurship*.
- Şengün, A. E., & Nazli Wasti, S. (2009). Revisiting trust and control: Effects on perceived relationship

performance. International Small Business Journal, 27(1), 39-69.

- Tobias, J. M., Mair, J., & Barbosa-Leiker, C. (2013). Toward a theory of transformative entrepreneuring: Poverty reduction and conflict resolution in Rwanda's entrepreneurial coffee sector. *Journal of Business Venturing*, 28(6), 728-742.
- Viswanathan, M., Echambadi, R., Venugopal, S., & Sridharan, S. (2014). Subsistence entrepreneurship, value creation, and community exchange systems: A social capital explanation. *Journal of Macromarketing*, *34*(2), 213-226.

Re-examining beneficiary value: Conflict and impact of development interventions in local communities

Johanna Arantola-Hattab, Hanken School of Economics, Finland

Mikko Laamanen, Royal Holloway University of London, UK

Pia Polsa, Hanken School of Economics, Finland

There is an urgent need to have a closer look at the social conflicts and impact arising from Western development interventions in less developed countries. Such interventions generally aim to provide methods and resources for self-sufficiency and improving local social and economic conditions. Yet, rarely the final value is taken into consideration in assessment of impact.

In marketing and management studies, critiques focus on importing the Western / Eurocentric / developed perspectives to developing countries which in effect extends paternalism (neocolonialism) and excludes the non-Western experience, particularly that of women (e.g. Bonsu and Polsa, 2011; Ellis et al., 2011; Maclaran and Kravets, 2018; Varman, 2018) and measure solely impact. In this context, our research focuses on value and its creation for beneficiaries and other actors. In recent developments of marketing theory, the original neutral version of the beneficiary discourse (Vargo and Lusch, 2004) has been challenged as discounting potential negative impacts of well-intended value propositions (Díaz-Méndez and Saren, 2019; Prior and Marcos-Cuevas, 2016) as well as the structural position and agency of the beneficiaries (e.g. Laamanen and Skålén, 2015). Our study focusses on international (service/aid) provider (e.g. intergovernmental institutions, NGOs and business organizations) interventions in local communities in Global South. In particular, we focus on the experience of value in the everyday practices of the aimed beneficiaries who are the targets and users of the proposed interventions and improvements.

Our analysis rests on considerations of existing programmes and looking at:

- How and to which extend do well-intended development programmes create value adding change in practices in focus communities?
- How are equal opportunities to participate in these programmes maintained and when do new ways of collaborating (e.g. governing, working and consuming in cooperatives) required?
- How are potential negative impacts, such as widening inequalities and disruptive behaviours amongst the beneficiaries, anticipated and considered in interventions?

We draw our finding from three sites and ethnographic studies:

- India: since 2008, data including 36 interviews with 8 NGO and 38 artisans, observations including 1180 photos and circa 200 pages of field notes, and secondary data such as newspaper and magazine articles
- Cambodia: since 2018, data including 16 focus groups among smallholders, 12 interviews with buyers, six workshops with local field teams
- Uganda: since 2019 data including five farm visits with observations

Our initial analysis shows that in addition to economic and other well-being impact, the development programmes we studied created both positive and negative unintentional value for beneficiaries. For example, in the Indian case of artisans, beyond economic benefits the beneficiaries reported also entertainment value of the development project. The same project created also apparent conflicts in the small community particularly when larger financial aid was received. In this very project, the beneficiaries received aid from several sources and had learned to relay on stipends rather than salary or profits from their own projects. Therefore, beneficiaries needed to re- or de-learn that their work (bamboo products that were redone as design products) had value as such and that instead of financial aid they were able to produce their own livelihood. Thus, one of the non-material and non-financial types of values was transformed (professional) identity. In contrast to previous literature this identity is not created through brands or consumption but by empowerment and tangible cues of identity, like bank accounts and identity cards. In practical terms, these findings demonstrate that impact such as employment is not sufficient measure of a program but multifaced value should be investigated in order to find out what value impact creates for different actors. Such requires long lasting collaborative commitment rather than exit after the impact has been achieved.

The Cambodian study among the smallholders within agriculture demonstrates the need for continuous planning based on the daily needs of the beneficiaries. The first study in 2018 indicated how collaboration among the smallholders is required to offer higher production volumes. These higher volumes provided economic value for the farmers. The group, rather than the individual farmer, becomes an interesting partner for potential buyers. Thus, collective value was created. Subsequently, it was necessary to start building clear relationships between these producer groups and buyers to guarantee all members the same possibilities as it turned out that some of the most active and capable producers were utilizing the contacts occasionally for their own purposes

In order to obtain social impact and sustainability in various development programmes in the poor countries, a stronger long-term commitment was essential from NGOs and business organizations. The local NGO teams play an essential role and need to have a continuous relationship with the beneficiaries by supporting and providing capacity building in the fast-changing environment.

Finally, the Ugandan case illustrates the need for a proper timeline and planning in the context of investing in local small agricultural enterprises. If the planning follows a solely Western perspective, there is a risk that not enough attention is paid to the whole value chain, starting from the local single farmers, and resources such as time and money are used to strengthen the production facilities rather than making a social impact. In worst cases the well-intended investments rather cause damage to the target enterprise than lead to sustained benefits.

References

- Bonsu, S. K., & Polsa, P. (2011). Governmentality at the Base-of-the-Pyramid. *Journal of Macromarketing*, 31(3), 236–244.
- Díaz-Méndez, M., & Saren, M. (2019). Managing advertising agency client partnerships for value cocreation: Characteristics, categories, and challenges. *Marketing Theory*, 19(1), 9–26.
- Ellis, N., Fitchett, J., Higgins, M., Jack, G., Lim, M., Saren, M., & Tadajewski, M. (2011). *Marketing: A Critical Textbook*. London: Sage.
- Laamanen, M., & Skålén, P. (2015). Collective–conflictual value co-creation: A strategic action field approach. *Marketing Theory*, 15(3), 381–400.

- Maclaran, P., & Kravets, O. (2019). Feminist perspectives in marketing: Past, present, and future. In Tadajewski, M., Higgins, M., Denegri-Knott, J., Varman, R (eds), *The Routledge Companion to Critical Marketing* (pp. 64-82). Abingdon: Routledge.
- Prior, D. D., & Marcos-Cuevas, J. (2016). Value co-destruction in interfirm relationships. *Marketing Theory*, 16(4), 533–552.
- Vargo, S. L., & Lusch, R. F. (2004). Evolving to a New Dominant Logic for Marketing. *Journal of Marketing*, 68(1), 1–17.
- Varman, R. (2019). Postcolonialism, subalternity, and critical marketing. In Tadajewski, M., Higgins, M., Denegri-Knott, J., Varman, R (eds), *The Routledge Companion to Critical Marketing* (pp. 49-63). Abingdon: Routledge.

The transition to peace. Colombia's implementation of the peace accord and Mexico's cycles of violence. A study in the use and value of social marketing in post-conflict resolution and integration.

Anthony Brown, Loughborough University London, UK

The research explores and aims to increase the understanding of how social marketing contributes and impacts the economic development and sustainability of previously marginalized populations in zones of conflict. The study is divided in two case studies: The first case study involves an examination of the peace process in Colombia, where violence derived from drug and guerrilla conflicts has led to the implementation of policies and accords to restore peace and integrate displaced populations during these conflicts. This case study explores the practical aspects of the implementation of the Colombian peace accord, and its impact amongst civilian populations.

The second case study focuses on understanding Mexico's place in the cycle of violence. Currently, Mexico is enduring an ongoing cycle of violence which has resulted in the loss of rule of law and trust towards its government and institutions. This makes it a suitable case for a comparative study in order to understand the social and economic impact of violence in these countries. The fact that they are in different stages of recovery can contribute to our understanding of social conflicts and the learning curve from the Colombia case can contribute to the development and a more informed implementation of public policy in Mexico which is concerned with restoring trust between the government and different social actors.

A key objective in the analysis is to bypass the perception of corrupt practices in both countries, and to secure and establish long-term relationships and trust towards the formal public sector by those that have experienced first-hand the consequences of living, operating a business or in general trying to survive economically in areas where conflict has divided families, communities and the nation(s) as a whole. This is argued to help to re-integrate these populations into the country's economic mainstream. Thus, the overall aim is to better understand the dynamics of peace and conflict resolution by looking at the current Colombian process and past experiences in order to uncover viable programs for the economic sustainability of these populations and used these learnings in order to assist countries like Mexico that remain deeply in the conflict phase.

The theoretical lens of this study is based on the value and use of social marketing. The study explores how the peace process and the reconstruction of trust are marketed and the role that entrepreneurs, enterprises and the business community play within this process. The proposed research would track some of the broad international, national and local policy initiatives at the national, state and local levels in both countries.

The research team also sees as a key objective to act and be seen as an impartial participant, enabler and documenter of the processes, actions and outcomes of the work performed by the divergent entities, groups and individuals who have been entrusted and empowered to deliver the goals and objectives within the peace accord in Colombia and the mitigation of violence in Mexico. Providing the implementation team with both the academic and practical methodology and tools to better understand, review and communicate the aims, methods of actions and outcomes of both cases will help to disseminate the accomplishments of the process during this historical moment.

SUBSISTENCE MARKETING & DEVELOPMENT

SrinivasVenugopal, University of Vermont, USA Catalina Estrada, Universidad de los Andes, Colombia



How Social Enterprises Work Through Nested Institutions to Foster Market Inclusion of the Differently Abled – a macro-marketing perspective

Priyanka Jayashankar, Iowa State University, USA

Srinivas Venugopal, University of Vermont, USA

In this qualitative study, the authors discuss how social enterprises work through nested institutions to bring about the mainstreaming of the differently abled in a developing market context. Market inclusion of the differently abled is a pressing policy issue in India, which is home to over 26 million persons with disabilities (PWDs). Many of these individuals have to battle cultural stigmas, assert their rights in public spaces and navigate their way through job markets by aligning with non-profits and social enterprises (Mandiberg and Warner, 2012). The research context focuses on the efforts of Amar Seva Sangam (a non-profit organization in Tamil Nadu) to create an inclusive market for persons with disabilities (PWDs). The authors bring to light how Amar Seva Sangam, works through nested institutions to empower PWDs at the macro, meso and micro-level. The study captures the lived realities of Amar Seva Sangam's employees, PWDs, families, special educators, medical professionals and government officials. The research discusses how the above actors engage in purposive action across nested fields to create, maintain and/or disrupt institutions, which include informal constraints and formal rules (Lawrence and Suddaby, 2006.) While researchers in the past have discussed the depiction of PWDs in advertising, there has been limited macro-marketing research on the institutional logics underpinning the market inclusion of the differently abled in emerging/developing market contexts.

The study builds on the extant macro-marketing literature on marketing systems and consumer welfare as it brings into focus how diverse spectrum of stakeholders impact the lives of PWDs via nested institutions in place of dyadic, exchange mechanisms (Mittelstaedt, Kilbourne and Schultz, 2015.) Building on grounded insights from the research the paper offers focused policy recommendations directed at various stakeholders to bring about the market inclusion of the differently abled. This approach ties in with Schultz's (2007) framework of re-orienting marketing activities toward societal outcomes that benefit diverse stakeholders.

References

- Lawrence, T. B., & Suddaby, R. (2006). 1.6 institutions and institutional work. *The Sage Handbook of Organization Studies*, 215-254.
- Mandiberg, J. M., & Warner, R. (2012). Business development and marketing within communities of social service clients. *Journal of Business Research*, 65(12), 1736-1742.

- Mittelstaedt, John D., William E. Kilbourne, and Clifford J. Shultz II. "Macromarketing approaches to thought development in positive marketing: Two perspectives on a research agenda for positive marketing scholars." *Journal of Business Research* 68.12 (2015): 2513-2516.
- Shultz, C. J. (2007). Marketing as constructive engagement. *Journal of Public Policy & Marketing*, 26(2), 293-301.

Fortune for the Bottom-of-the-Pyramid- A Macromarketing Perspective

Sujit Raghunathrao Jagadale, Xavier University Bhubaneswar (XUB), India

Nearly half of the world's population lives in villages (Department of Economic and Social Affairs, UN 2018). In the Indian context, despite rapid urbanization, this proportion is more than 65 % (Department of Economic and Social Affairs, UN 2018). With growing purchasing power, desire to spend, and growth of aspirational consumption (Arunachalam et al. 2019), it is an "untapped opportunity for growth-seeking companies" (Mahajan 2016). Multiple theoretical perspectives, like the bottom of the pyramid, with underlying assumptions that rural is poor, are posited to tap these opportunities (Anderson, Markides, and Kupp 2010; Mahajan and Banga 2005; Prahalad 2012). Due to the specific challenges, rural markets pose, like heterogeneity and infrastructural issues (Kumar and Srivastava 2019) and sociocultural conservatism and the dominance of primordial institutions like caste (Jagadale, Kadirov, Chakraborty 2018), a distinct practice and academic sub-discipline of rural marketing was conceptualized in India. The practice of rural marketing is always conceived as a dichotomous- either from for-profit (Arunachalam et al. 2019) or from a developmental perspective (Vaswani, 2005). However, it largely remained as the movement of goods and services produced in urban to rural geographies (Karnani 2012) discarding rural populace as producers. Some activists even call it as internal colonization. The scholastic neglect of 'rural markets' particularly producers, despite the fragmentary approach to understanding emerging markets (Kumar and Srivastava 2019), aggravated the woes of rural producers (Jagadale, Kadirov, Chakraborty 2018). At the micro-level bottom-up approach of subsistence markets consider the consumer-producer continuum. However, largely a scholarship is concentrated on firm-level marketing issues than at the level of primary producers, entirely invisibilizing them from a precinct of the scholarship on emerging markets. It throws many theoretical, ethical, and institutional challenges.

This paper aims to address above limitations by 1) considering rural-to-urban transfer of goods and services; 2) considering rural consumer-producer as an entrepreneur, as has been extensively documented in subsistence market literature (Viswanathan, Rosa and Ruth 2010)' 3) examining the role of state, beyond facilitation of market access, in creation of marketing system. The positive possibilities of such a shift, from a macro-marketing perspective (Aiyar and Venugopal 2019), is illustrated by exploring the Indian milk marketing system's historical evolution. We show how recognition of rural producers' agency and their inclusion in a marketing system through a collaborative structure of the state, communities and collectively owned firms (co-operatives) (Aiyar and Venugopal 2019) lead to an inclusive and sustainable market system. We further emphasize the positive effects of such Humanitarian (Shultz et al. 2019) and dignified (Jagadale, Kadirov, and Chakrobarty 2018) Marketing Systems on the well-being of the large segment of the world population otherwise ignored by mainstream marketing scholarship and practice.

The ability of marketing systems to generate assortments, its primary function (Layton 2010), that meet societal needs and wants is greatly influenced by the institutional (e.g., political, legal, cultural, physical infrastructure) contexts, and by the technological or knowledge forces as the critical drivers of change for both sellers and buyers (Layton 2009). Moreover, a "Humanitarian Marketing System highlights roles of multiple participants, their collaboration(s), alliances and reciprocities, and ultimately the well-being of the most vulnerable of those collaborators/stakeholders, over time and space" (Schultz

et al. 2019, p. 5). India's milk marketing system has emerged out of a call by different market actors from both within and without the system to serve a multitude of (vertical and horizontal) stakeholders.

"For at least 5,000 years, Bharat, the Indian sub-continent, has been a land of milk-the cow and the buffalo have been valued for their milk, their manure, and their male calves (for draft power). But by the 1960s, the land, and most poor farmers, had grown weary. The green revolution was yet to produce enough staples (mainly rice and wheat) for the swelling population. Milk production has fallen to 90 ml (3 ozs, less than a 1/4th pint) per capita per day" (Halse, unpublished manuscript). With the collective efforts of state and communities, India overcomes many infrastructural, institutional and market challenges to become a top producer of buffalo and goat milk (Cunningham 2009). More than 100 million people are involved in dairy farming, most of which are subsistence farmers and landless laborers (Cunningham 2009). It all started with the success of 'Amul' a co-operative milk Union owned by the small producers in the western province of Gujarat. Government of India, to replicate this success elsewhere, drafted a program called 'operation flood (OF).' The programme was initiated as the 'billion-liter idea' in July 1970 which turned India into the world's largest milk producer surpassing the United States in 1998 (Rupera 2013) with continuous growth.

We follow a case study approach, appropriate for illustrative purposes (Sigglekow 2007), as a method to explore the evolution and functioning of India's milk marketing system. Case studies are rich, empirical descriptions of instances of phenomena...and may involve "historical accounts or information" (Eisenhardt and Graebner 2007). Historical analyses, particularly the studies of path-dependent development of institutions, could unearth unexpected findings about taken-for-granted market structures (Acemoglu, Johnson and Robinson 2004).

The case study is unique in its ability to deal with a full variety of evidence, documents, artifacts, interviews, and observations (Yin 2003). Investigating India's milk marketing system as a case will help us to reify implicit meanings (Mintzberg 1979) associated with the evolution of this system. We are collecting data from multiple sources (Yin 2003) like documents, archival records and interviews. Triangulation of the data shall help establish the trustworthiness of the research.

Early findings indicate that the collaboration of state and communities, with the help of technology and modern marketing practices, leads to the creation of socio-economic institutions leading to stable humanitarian and inclusive marketing systems. It leads to the even distribution of value in a marketing system.

References

- Acemoglu, D., Johnson, S. and Robinson, J. (2004), "Institutions as the Fundamental Cause of Long-Run Growth," *NBER Working Paper Series*, Cambridge, MA, National Bureau of Economic Research.
- Aiyar, A. and Venugopal, S. (2019), "Addressing the Ethical Challenge of Market Inclusion in Base-of-The-Pyramid Markets: A Macromarketing Approach," *Journal of Business Ethics*, 1-18.
- Anderson, J. L., Markides, C. and Kupp, M. (2010), "The Last Frontier: Market Creation in Conflict Zones, Deep Rural Areas, and Urban Slums," *California Management Review*, 52 (4), 6–28.
- Arunachalam, S., Bahadir, S. C., Bharadwaj, S. G. and Guesalaga, R. (2019), "New Product Introductions for Low-Income Consumers in Emerging Markets," *Journal of the Academy of Marketing Science*, 1-27.

- Cunningham, K. (2009), "Rural and Urban Linkages: Operation Flood S Role in India's Dairy Development," Vol. 924, *Intl Food Policy Res Inst.*
- Eisenhardt, K. M. (1989), "Building Theories from Case Study Research," *Academy of Management Review*, 14 (4), 532-550.
- Jagadale, S. R., Kadirov, D. and Chakraborty, D. (2018), "Tackling the Subaltern Quandary: Marketing Systems of Dignity," *Journal of Macromarketing*, 38 (1), 91-111.
- Karnani, A. (2012), "Markets of the Poor: Opportunities and Limits," *International Journal of Rural Management*, 8 (1-2), 7-17.
- Kumar, V. and Srivastava, R. (2019), "New Perspectives on Business Model Innovations in Emerging Markets," *Journal of the Academy of Marketing Science*, 1-11.
- Layton, R. A. (2009), "On Economic Growth, Marketing Systems and the Quality of Life," *Journal of Macromarketing*, 29 (4), 349-362.
- Mahajan, V. (2016), *Rise of Rural Consumers in Developing Countries: Harvesting 3 Billion Aspirations*. Thousand Oaks, CA: SAGE.
- Mahajan, V. and Banga, K. (2005), *The 86 Percent Solution: How To Succeed In The Biggest Market Opportunity For The Next 50 Years*. Philadelphia: Wharton School Publishing.
- Mintzberg, H. (1979), "An Emerging" Strategy of Direct Research," *Administrative Science Quarterly*, 24, 580-589.
- Prahalad, C. K. (2012), "Bottom of the Pyramid as a Source of Breakthrough Innovations," *Journal of Product Innovation Management*, 29 (1), 6–12.
- Rupera, P. (2013), "Harvard hails White Revolution," (accessed Jan. 2016), [available at http://timesofindia.indiatimes.com/city/vadodara/Harvard-hails-White-Revolution/articleshow/18918902.cms].
- Shultz, C., Barrios, A., Krasnikov, A.V., Becker, I., Bennett, A.M., Emile, R., Hokkinen, M., Pennington, J.R., Santos, M. and Sierra, J., (2020), "The Global Refugee Crisis: Pathway for a More Humanitarian Solution," *Journal of Macromarketing*, p.0276146719896390.

Sigglekow, N. (2007)," Persuasion with Case Studies," Academy of Management Journal, 50 (1), 20-24.

- Vaswani, L. K., Aithal, R., Pradhan, D., and Sridhar, G. (2005), "Rural Marketing in the Development Paradigm," *International Journal of Rural Management*, 1 (2), 245-262.
- Viswanathan, M., Rosa, J. A., and Ruth, J. A. (2010), "Exchanges in Marketing Systems: The Case of Subsistence Consumer–Merchants in Chennai, India," *Journal of Marketing*, 74 (3), 1-17.
- Yin, R. K. (2003), Case Study Research: Design and Methods, Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.

Forgers Identity Formation: a study in the Brazilian footwear industry

Wagner Vicente Diniz, Pontifical Catholic University of Minas Gerais, Brazil Ramon Silva Leite, Pontifical Catholic University of Minas Gerais, Brazil

The present study seeks to define if the production of counterfeit articles can be considered by counterfeiters as the first alternative for survival, including the permanence of their companies in the market. The self- perception of the counterfeit production practice was investigated in the light of the critical judgment of counterfeiters when assessing other companies operating in the black market.

The practice of marketplace deviance for the production of a fake item has negative consequences that affect the legalized producer; it is also detrimental to the distribution, retailers, consumers, public coffers and shareholders of the genuine product. Layton (2007) suggests that limited or non-existent access to the marketing system, such as credit, education, legal protection or the like can influence what Upadhyaya et al. (2014) suggest as being subsistence economy.

In subsistence economies, individuals and organizations may exhibit deviant marketplace behaviour towards the established marketing as the only form of survival (Upadhyaya et al. 2014). A subsistence economy can contribute to an environment in which the creation of ventures outside the established marketing system is necessary for the survival of the counterfeiters.

A qualitative study based upon multiple data collection methods was conducted in one of the main footwear producing centers in Brazil. In 2016, 22% of all counterfeit items produced was footwear (Trade in Counterfeit and Pirate Goods: Value, Scope and Trends, 2019). The research relied on two data collection procedures. First, semi-structured interviews were conducted with seven producers of fake footwear, each with his own business. Second, an ethnography was conducted in a footwear facility. The counterfeiters interviewed were nearly all men, with a low education, who owned their small counterfeit footwear business. These forgers were former workers of other counterfeit footwear companies who wanted to set up their own business in the hope of achieving a better income.

As formally constituted illegal product companies declare part of their production to the government revenue service and are subject to tax collection, the activity is considered as grey market (Kim, Cho, & Johnson 2009). Counterfeiters had negative perceptions of their counterparts in the black market when the company is not formally constituted and is not subject to taxation. This condition of not being registered may be advantageous to a counterfeiter since he does not have to pay duties.

Counterfeiters observed three categories of counterfeiting businesses. The first is a fully informal and illegal activity, and all the output is counterfeit, which is a black market. In the second category, the company is registered but all the production is counterfeit; however, it lists part of the sales in the invoices but does not state the counterfeited brand name, but simply says `footwear`. In the third category, the company is formally established, part of its output is produced and marketed under its own brand, but a share of the production is counterfeit.

Most counterfeiters participating in the survey are willing to legalize their business and stop producing counterfeits. The counterfeit activity is quite a limited one, but it allows an initial growth up to

a certain extent, but there comes a time when the business must be legalized. Counterfeiters consider that, in this environment, a product even being counterfeit, has a better chance to be accepted by the market than his own unknown brand.

Counterfeiting is a continuum that relates the entrepreneur's maturity with the market. The entrepreneurs interviewed manufacture and market illegal counterfeit products to make sure they stay in business, especially in the beginning of the activities, but they believe that if they remain in a fake product business they are not likely to prosper as they would if they had their own brands. Thus, the results suggest that counterfeiting is a subsistence economy practice, it should be used only in the beginning, and as soon as the entrepreneur joins the developed marketing system, he should change his position. For counterfeiting is not an end, it is a means: it is the only choice they have to access the marketing system and survive in the early days of their business.

References

- Layton, R. A. (2007). Marketing systems A core macromarketing concept. *Journal of Trade in Counterfeit and Pirated Goods: Value, Scope and Trends*. (2019).
- Upadhyaya, S., Vann, R. J., Camacho, S., Baker, C. N., Leary, R. B., Mittelstaedt, J. D., & Rosa, J. A. (2014). Subsistence Consumer-Merchant Marketplace Deviance in Marketing Systems: Antecedents, Implications, and Recommendations. *Journal of Macromarketing*, 34(2), 145–159.

The 'nasi lemak' ladies: How female micro-entrepreneurs navigate transitioning markets

Victoria J. Little, Monash University Malaysia, Malaysia

Buriata Tofinga, Monash University Malaysia, Malaysia

Helen Ho, Monash University Malaysia, Malaysia

Roadside stalls, or hawkers, selling cheap, easily accessible food are an accepted part of the servicescape in Asian cities (Teh, 2019). In Kuala Lumpur (KL), Malaysia, site of this study, office workers and labourers alike choose from an array of proteins, rice and sambals (spicy sauces), provided by solo operators, mainly women. The 'nasi lemak' ladies operate in informal markets; those where exchange behaviors are guided by norms and understandings rather than rules and regulations. The women rise as early as 1am to cook for their customers, then pack their cars to set up and operate their stalls in all weathers. At the same time, they discharge caregiving responsibilities for dependent family members. While the women provide an essential safety net for their families, family and society take their practical, emotional and financial efforts for granted. Furthermore, they are unprotected by the regulatory structures and safety nets available to established businesses. However, not much is known about the issues and challenges facing these women, and how market transition will affect their businesses.

Our study focuses on important, and yet under-studied social actors: Female micro-entrepreneurs (FEPs). Previous research has focused on male-dominated industries such as dairy farming (e.g. Sutter et al., 2017) or male SME managers (Mohd, Kamaruddin, Yahya, & Sanidas, 2015); therefore a study of women contributes insight into a relatively under-researched group of market actors. Drawing on a case study of FEPS operating in an informal market in a transitioning economy, we address the question: "How do wider system dynamics affect FEPs in the conduct of their ventures?" Reflecting the dynamic, real world phenomenon, multiple actors and complex processes, we take a qualitative case study approach. Data are drawn from KL, Malaysia. Participant observation included stallholder areas, and street markets (three areas, 6 hours, 60+ photographs, fieldnotes). Fifteen Malay FEPs were interviewed and observed as embedded units of analysis in Bahasa Melayu (595 minutes of interviews, 1100+ photographs and short videos, fieldnotes). Analysis was in four stages: (1) Data review and memoing; (2) Descriptive codes, interpretive categories and themes (Saldaña, 2012); (3) Agreement on final coding framework; (4) Member checking. Constant comparison was undertaken by tacking between the data, the literature, on-going participant observation in the field, and reflexive team discussions. Analysis and interpretation are supported by lengthy immersion in the field.

Four findings are of note. First, these were well-established businesses (range 4-17 years in operation, average 10). To our surprise, they generated substantial daily revenues in the Malaysian context (RM400-2500/ \$US100-600, averaging RM600/\$US150), more than a university graduate, tax free. Second, religious values drove the FEP's business practices; not surprising, as by definition, Malays must be practicing Muslims: "We are all the same here, all trying to earn a living. [We accept] that which God gives." [Rosmah, 60, Area K]. Third, the women must accept trials, as their stalls operate outside the law and local authorities seek to reduce nuisance caused through food borne disease, littering and traffic congestion. Depending on the area, the women were either benevolently ignored (Area P), fined (Area K)

or fined and moved on with varying degrees of harassment including confiscation of equipment (Area S). Fourth, the women had freedom of action belying their modest mien ('tudung' or covered other than hands and faces in the now-prevalent convention). In general, despite the prodigious workloads and health issues associated with aging, the women wished to continue with their businesses until they could no longer do so. However, market formalisation may compromise that: "By 2020, [government] want to eradicate all the nasi lemak stalls by the side of the road ... [and set up in] kiosks instead. They want to make it look nicer. [But my] friend who's in a kiosk says her customers would much rather the feel of getting nasi lemak from the side of the road!" [Siti, 52, Area P].

Aligning with previous studies of (male) Malay entrepreneurs, reciprocal benevolence reflects the Muslim values of honesty, hard work, loyalty and discipline, and a view of externally imposed challenges as opportunities to test one's mettle (Mohd, Kamaruddin, Yahya, & Sanidas, 2015). A strong vein of determinism and collectivism permeated the data, contrary to Western entrepreneurial notions emphasising risk taking and individuality. However, the women's theory-in-use (as opposed to espoused theory) was to give the appearance of compliance, whilst pushing boundaries (i.e. obedient deviance). This strategy supported the FEPs in pursuing their own agendas in spite of family and market strictures (e.g. behavioural and regulatory constraints), reflecting strong (but hidden) propensity for individual risk-taking, similarly to the Western entrepreneurial mindset.

Policy makers should be aware that market formalisation comes at a cost for microbusinesses, which nevertheless represent an important source of family income, and economic independence for women. Equally, important aspects of cultural heritage can be lost. Stallholders are aging, and family succession is not assured. Therefore we investigate a moment in time that is unlikely to endure. Without enlightened support, an important part of the cultural cityscape may vanish, along with the nasi lemak ladies and their stalls.

References

- Mohd, R., Kamaruddin, B. H., Yahya, K. K., & Sanidas, E. (2015). Can values of honesty, hard work, loyalty and discipline predict entrepreneurial orientation of Muslim owner managers? *Journal of Emerging Economies & Islamic Research*, 3(1).
- Sutter, C., Webb, J., Kistruck, G., Ketchen, D. J., & Ireland, R. D. (2017). Transitioning entrepreneurs from informal to formal markets. *Journal of Business Venturing*, 32(4), 420-

Ethics of marketing persuasive technology: A research agenda

Yasmine EL-ALAMI, Aix Marseille Univ, Université de Toulon, CERGAM, IAE France Janice DENEGRI-KNOTT, Bournemouth University, UK

Popular persuasive technology like FitBit and Opower provide consumers with biological, physical, behavioural and environmental data to monitor and adjust their behaviour in areas such as health, parenting and energy use. These new technologies are not only popular consumer products, but also vehicles for continuous and highly targeted marketing activity. Companies can track consumers' physical movements, usage patterns, body changes, geo-location and reactions to external stimuli (including advertising), and use these data to enhance the effectiveness of their campaigns. With the number of persuasive technology set to grow anywhere from 20 billion to 100 billion by 2020, the number of people affected by their marketing and use is considerable, and therefore so are societal and policy implications.

The aim of this paper is to map possible areas of concern for marketing persuasive technologies. We focus particularly on wearable tracking devices as they are among the most popular in the market but also because it raises questions on consumers' relationship with their embodied understandings of practices. As wearable tracking devices are embedded in the users' phenomenological body, we consider this technology as a mediator of consumers' relationship with the world (Verbeek, 2005). We draw on Verbeek's ethical framework for persuasive technologies (2006) that considers ethics is about how to act, and thus, in technology embodying some for moral agency, it helps us 'do ethics' (Verbeek, 2006). We group initial areas of concern for designing and marketing technologies intended to mediate users' relationship with the world at both hermeneutic and pragmatic levels. Whereas the first levels consider how technology mediates users' perceptions and interpretations, the latter regards mediations of humans' actions and practices (Verbeek, 2006).

1) Shaping Interpretation (hermeneutic level)

Persuasive technology, in engineering desired behaviours like calorie counting or walking 10000 steps/day, can threaten consumers' autonomy and produce laxity in moral engagement (Neff and Nafus, 2016; Verbeek, 2005). It can also become an anti-democratic influence in society where businesses and technology steer behaviour to fulfil market objectives at the expense of individual and societal wellbeing (Zuboff, 2019). As self-tracking is promoted as a means to be healthier and maintain an optimal body, activity trackers increase social distinctions between those who can afford this technology to benefit from a healthier lifestyle and those who don't (Neff and Nafus, 2016). What is more, some devices are marketed as luxury which leaves other devices positioned for the mass market, creating consequently class distinctions among wellness and health tools (Neff and Nafus, 2016).

At a marketing level, consumer research needs to address the broader cultural discourses that are paired with the use of wearable activity-tracking devices such as neoliberal discourses that praise higher performance and optimal rationalization of time and resources. This is even more important as self-tracking devices promote a narrow form of a healthy body and target mainly young and fit consumers, raising concerns about those who are probably less profitable for the industry: the injured, the disabled, the poor or the middle-aged (Neff and Nafus, 2016).

2) Shaping Behaviour (pragmatic level)

The update that wearable tracking devices bring to the distribution of human agency is twofold. First, considering the potential of objects-either smart or dumb- to shape everyday practices, wearable activity tracking devices can transform and reshape how practices are carried and understood. Research should address how this technology's mediation affects everyday practices such as how people use their time, what they eat, how fast they run, etc. Second, it raises concerns about a third-party that benefits from this distribution. The data collected by these devices is, in fact, traded in a market that includes hedge funds and advertising agencies (Zuboff, 2019) interested in knowing what consumers do, where they go to, and what they consume. The idea of sharing one's ability to manage their time and energy to exercise and control calories intake with a device does not appear unethical, but what is questionable is what this device does with these data and how it encourages an uninterrupted use to feed a market (Zuboff, 2019). More research should address how companies can create value from tracking devices without translating phenomenological experiences into behavioural data intended to feed big corporations. The challenge appears to be even more important as most internet-based businesses have to deal with markets rules that force small business to extract data and trade it (Zuboff, 2019).

Explicit and considered reflection of a responsible and ethical marketing of persuasive technology- from its developmental phase, promotion, and subsequent use of data generated by these devices- is lacking in academic and professional circles. Largely, engagement with these ethical dilemmas has been avoided, leaving both the design and promotion of persuasive technology to market forces alone. The ethical implications of persuasive technologies are taking place in philosophy and engineering and the main aim of this paper is to draw attention to some issues that could and should be addressed by marketing practitioners and academics.

References

Neff, G., and Nafus, D. (2016), Self-tracking. MIT Press.

- Verbeek, Peter-Paul (2006), "Persuasive Technology and Moral Responsibility Toward an ethical framework for persuasive technologies," *Persuasive* 6, 1-15.
- Zuboff, S. (2019), *The age of surveillance capitalism: The fight for a human future at the new frontier of power*. New York: Public Affairs.

Instant loans as market violence

Ella Lillqvist, University of Helsinki, Finland Päivi Timonen, University of Helsinki, Finland

We analyze the Finnish instant loan market as 'market violence': suffering caused by markets and the excesses of capitalism. We use data from Finland's largest discussion forum to analyze anonymous debtors' personal narratives, focusing on the characteristics of the instant loan market and its negative consequences for the consumer. We point out and critique a neoliberal view where individuals are blamed for debt problems. Lauren Berlant's concept of cruel optimism helps explain how part of the market violence becomes internalized and comes about affectively, as an ironic consequence of hoping and striving for a better life; this can be understood as a form of market violence.

A Critical Discourse Analysis of newspaper articles under a reform of tuition fee removal in Chilean Higher Education

Patricio Sanchez-Campos, Universidad de Talca, Chile

Elizabeth Nixon, Nottingham University Business School, UK.

Ekaterina Nemkova, Nottingham University Business School, UK.

Heidi Winklhofer, Nottingham University Business School, UK.

This article critically assesses the representations of Higher Educations (HE) students identified from newspaper articles in a highly neoliberal context where the HE sector is undergoing controversial policy reform of tuition fees removal. The articles were published in the conservative Chilean newspaper El Mercurio during the discussion and first years of implementation (2014 - 2019) of this reform. Fairclough's Critical Discourse Analysis (CDA) three-dimensional approach is being conducted to determine how students have been represented in media, beyond the well documented representation of student as a consumer. The analysis discloses the dominance of neoliberal discourses in relation to Chilean HE and it addresses a confusing public dimension of private HE institutions; hence the rejection of any possibility of free public HE. But also, alternative, rather conflicting, representations are being unveiled such as the student as violent revolutionaries and lobbyists; and Private HE students conceptualized as second class and legally discriminated students.

Environmental protection initiatives and subsequent shifts in commodity production and marketing: A case study of Aba Prefecture, Sichuan, China

Gregory Veeck, Western Michigan University, USA

On May 8, 2008, the terrible Wenchuan Earthquake completely devastated much of Aba prefecture, killing 87,575, and injuring 374,643 people while effectively cutting most of Aba off from the rest of Sichuan for months. At that time, due to desperate need in the aftermath of the earthquake, and possibly due to concurrent ethnic unrest, the Sichuan (Province) and Beijing (National) governments decided to invest heavily in economic development efforts throughout Aba prefecture, so as to minimize economic impetus for protest and more importantly improve quality of life. To this end, many loan and grant programs were initiated to move the economy from transhumant pastoralism to nature- and cultural-tourism. Investment in tourism, infrastructure, economic diversification and four-season paved roads (north to Qinghai Province, and south to Chengdu, Sichuan) were paid for by national and provincial relief agencies.

Visitors in 2020 can observe improved conditions in many respects including better roads, more tourists, more B&BS, better clothing, more motorcycles, hospitals and even more diverse and better quality food. The local economies have benefitted from the government investments that opened the area to tourists from across China. During my visits, herders talked of their aspirations for their children which did not include herding yaks, but did include jobs in local tourism and transport which potentially could result in higher incomes, while limiting economic migration. Some residents worry that the influx of Han tourists and tour operators will accelerate the local loss of traditional Tibetan culture and autonomy (Hessler 1999).

With greater investments in development, came much greater attention to the severe environmental problems facing the prefectural alpine pastures as well. As a consequence, China's Ministry of Agriculture (now Ministry of Agriculture and Rural Development) demanded the adoption of a wide variety of ecological protection measures. Importantly, during the restoration process after the earthquake, the goals of developing sustainable ecological systems within Aba's grasslands were intended to meet two related goals: ecological protection and economic development through tourism. Planners believe that investment in ecological protection should not only help restore the fragile flora and fauna that constitute the alpine grassland biome, but also potentially could create income-generating opportunities for residents. The idea was that as herding families saw incomes rise through tourism and related activities, protecting the grasslands would become their priority as well, and incidents of ethnic unrest would decline apace. Faster than might be expected, language surrounding the grasslands shifted from concerns about an over-exploited resource abused by "uninformed" nomadic or transhumant herders, to the most effective use of an economic development resource that formed the foundation of lucrative pastoral/cultural tourism opportunities (Fu et al. 2020, Yuan 2019). The government instituted many draconian measures intended to shift the local economy from herding to herding/nature related tourism. Measures include: (1) outright bans on the use of degraded pasture typically for a period of up to seven years, (2) mandatory fencing of some pasture areas for restoration, (3) bans on more destructive

livestock, specifically meat goats, (4) required but subsidized forage/grass seeding programs, and (5) bans on pasture burning (Veeck et al. 2015).

All of the mitigation efforts noted above have definitely improved pasture quality and health in many areas of Aba Prefecture (Kang et al. 2007, Veeck et al. 2015, Xiong et al. 2019, Xu 2019). While the mitigation programs remain largely unpopular, many families we interviewed agreed, if pressed, that they were economically "better off" with higher incomes, improved quality of life, and new more-intensive production systems made possible with loans and grants. So, while pasture use was mandatorily reduced, at the same time, stocks of dairy cattle, beef cattle, sheep and goats have remained-remarkably-largely unchanged—despite the loss of access to most pasture. How did this happen? Currently, more than half of the livestock are now raised in CAFOs or corrals, or within fenced pasture areas, where pasture grass is heavily augmented with dry forage, grain supplements, salt and pumped water.

Further, there has been a significant increase in output of other semi-processed livestock-related products in recent years as well (milk, meat, fiber, skins) probably due to the fact that better roads and tourism create markets for new products with much lower transport costs.

There are many examples of new products, new marketing opportunities, and new supply chains that have developed as the herders and their families throughout Aba Prefecture have adjusted to life with the ecological protection regulations and controls that so dramatically and radically altered the pastoral way of life that existed in Aba for thousands of years while meeting needs of tourism and export strategies including honey, milk, meat, hides, and importantly traditional medicines. These opportunities brought in an influx of ethnic Han "middlemen" and locals feel the "lion's share" of profit now goes to "outsiders".

Based on extensive interviews with county, township and village husbandry, forestry, and grassland management officials, as well as with families raising livestock, this paper emphasizes the unforeseen economic and cultural consequences facing herders and pasture managers living and working in Aba. Given the complex ecological and economic inter-relationships within these fragile pastoral ecosystems, developing effective pasture-related ecological protection measures while assuring acceptable returns on investment has really proven to be a great challenge.

The reorganization of the economy in Aba prefecture including the growth of tourism, new means of raising livestock, new horticultural activities, and more intensive harvesting of TCM in response to new ecological mitigation measures raises important questions about how to manage pasture areas while promoting economic growth in Aba and many similar areas of west China. Through our interviews, and compilation and interpretation of archived data, we identify many unexpected and unforeseen consequences associated with new protection measures, including dramatic increases in commodity production of milk, honey, eggs, vegetables, and meat, including pork and yak. The changes in environmental regulations and ecological mitigation policies quickly and dramatically created a new economic system. We are neither celebrating this transformation nor condemning it. High incomes mean longer lifespans, better health, more security and less sorrow. But, as in almost all economic transformations, when something is gained, something is also lost. In this case, the dilution of authentic Tibetan culture, even as it is commodified for millions of tourists each year, was predicted by Peter Hessler in 1999 which recognized that the slow but steady in-migration of poor Han into these regions looking for better opportunities would change the Tibetan region, and Tibetan people forever (Gaerrang 2017, Hessler 1999).

The references cited in this abstract, and a complete copy of the paper may be acquired by contacting the author: Gregory.veeck@wmich.edu.

Just because we *can*, does it mean we *should?* From Nestlé's baby formula to vaping & e-cigarettes

Tara Radin, George Washington University, USA

Marilyn Liebrenz-Himes, George Washington University, USA

Terri Rittenburg, University of Wyoming, USA

A little more than half a century ago, we were facing the Nestlé baby formula debacle. For more than a decade, this mammoth Swiss consumer conglomerate deteriorated the health of millions of babies in developing countries in Africa by promoting a health product with actual and/or constructive knowledge that it was not being used properly in those markets. Although Nestlé disputes the magnitude of its share of the problem, it remains indisputable that their marketing at least contributed to a significant rise in infant mortality. The underlying problem was connected to the general lack of corporate accountability with absent legal mandates. This is a problem attributed to Nestlé, but shared by many multinational entities. Particularly in the global arena, where there is no governing legal regulator. companies typically weigh their actions according to a simple, binary utilitarian calculus: "Is a community better off with a product?" If the answer is, "Yes," companies move forward, often without ever considering how the product is marketed or distributed. When Pfizer decided to run its Trovan drug trial in Kano, a remote area of Nigeria, Pfizer was enticed by the opportunity of being able to treat a naïve population during an active epidemic. A "naïve" population, for the purpose of drug trials, consists of people who typically adhere to regular dietary regimens that do not include substances such as medicines. Drug trials are much more reliable and easier to administer in such an environment absent issues pertaining to drug interactions. When 11 children died as a result of the trial, and others were seriously injured (i.e., brain damage, paralysis and/or slurred speech), Pfizer responded that they should not be held accountable because they did more than they had to do. It turns out that meeting requirements is not the appropriate standard; companies are responsible for doing enough. What does "doing enough" mean? Companies are ultimately responsible for local conditions in the markets they choose to enter. This was true for Nestlé as well as for Pfizer. Even though they didn't have to address the costs up front, they ultimately did have to bear the cost of the negative consequences of their irresponsible behavior. Nestle suffered tremendous negative PR, and the company ultimate had to change marketing practices in developing countries. Pfizer literally paid the price of a lawsuit, settled for \$75 million, in addition to negative PR and the complete removal of Trovan from the market. The problem is not isolated to the global arena, however. Even in the United States, one of the most bureaucratic, litigious countries in the world, there is a long, unfortunate history of companies eying profit opportunities who forward hastily without any consideration of alternatives or responsibility until the regulators catch up. Take, for example, the Ford Pinto scandal as well as the entire development of the cigarette company. Such companies have intentionally taken advantage of the lag effect in the law to earn as much profit as they could before regulation and jurisprudence interfered with their profit streams. History repeats itself, like a washing machine cycle, in spite of the negative consequences suffered by communities around the world. The good news is that the trend is moving in the other direction. Companies are increasingly holding themselves – and their peers – accountable for attention to stakeholders, not just shareholders. The bad news is that this is voluntary, and there are still poignant examples of companies that continue to buck this trend.

The use of the term 'vaping' refers to the use of electric cigarettes, implying that this new product is safer than smoking cigarettes. The use of e-cigarettes is becoming popular, especially among younger consumers. The 'white smoke' of e-cigarettes helps to differentiate vaping from smoking by giving the user a sense of smoking without the medical hazards of traditional cigarettes. The design of the e-cigarette holders not only appears in regular cigarette or pipe forms, but also as USB drives or other gadgets which allow e-cigarettes to be disguised or hidden from others, such as parents or teachers. So far, this description of e-cigarettes appears a bit edgy but overall far less harmful when compared to regular cigarettes. However, medical issues involving severe lung damage and other medical problems have been attributed to the use of e-cigarettes, especially among younger consumers. It also should be realized that one 'pod' in an e-cigarette has been said to provide the equivalent of an entire pack of regular cigarettes. Recent legislation has created to prevent consumers under 21 from being able to purchase or use ecigarettes containing nicotine. Some fruit flavors of e-cigarettes have also outlawed, having been considered too appealing to younger consumers. Overall, such preventative legislation pertaining to ecigarettes in the United States is at best fragmented, confusing, and is not addressing the overall harm being caused by the use of e-cigarettes. The purpose of this paper is to argue against the ongoing absence of accountability evidenced by companies which exploit stakeholders in pursuit of short-term profits. The situation involving vaping and e-cigarettes provides poignant examples of how companies create profits at the cost of society. Using the vape and e-cigarette industry as an example, we assert that the appropriate question for a company is not, "Can we market a product," but "Should we?" The absence of legal regulation does not translate into a blank check for irresponsible corporate behavior. We propose a test to be applied by companies considering the introduction of new products in existing or new markets.

Using the vape and e-cigarette industry as an example, we assert that the appropriate question for a company is not, "Can we market a product," but "Should we?" The absence of legal regulation does not translate into a blank check for irresponsible corporate behavior. We propose that a test be applied for companies considering the introduction of new products in existing or new markets.

Responsible customer experience: exploring the missing link to encourage sustainable consumption

Julia Wolny, EADA Business School, Barcelona, Spain

This cross-disciplinary paper addresses the under-researched relationship between provision of responsible consumption experiences by retailers and sustainable consumption practices. While there is ample evidence that the consumer attitude in post-industrial economies towards sustainability has become more favorable in recent years, the limited provision and investment by large brands in broadly termed 'sustainable' options elicits consumption behaviors to the contrary. In their paper 'Blame it on Marketing' Pereira Heath and Chatzidakis (2012), identify that consumers' actual behaviours relating to sustainable consumption are negatively impacted by oversupply of products and marketing practices that encourage irresponsible purchase behaviour.

Taking as an example the fashion sector, one of the reasons, one could argue, for low incidence of sustainable purchases is the prevalence of fast fashion retail customer experiences. It follows therefore, that in order to shift behaviour, we should be interested in how companies can transform the customer experience to provide the right triggers, processes and outcomes that would motivate and encourage responsible behaviour in consumers throughout the customer journey. In other words, responsible customer experience design is here discussed as a necessary focus to accompany the often discussed sustainable production practices. Consequently, the aim of this paper and the broader transformative research that is being presented here is - how to introduce responsible customer experience design into the marketing system.

Customer experience management has been widely adopted in praxis by some of the world's top brands claiming it as key to their market success (e,g, Amazon or Airbnb). A growing number of academic articles have discussed the customer experience construct in recent years, yet its application to responsible and sustainable practices is just beginning. The definition adopted here, implies the individual as well societal aspects of customer experience and its potential to transform consumer reactions:

"The customer experience originates from a set of interactions between a customer and a product, a company, or part of its organization, which provoke a reaction. This experience is strictly personal and implies the customer's involvement at different levels (rational, emotional, sensorial, physical, and spiritual)" (Gentile, Spiller, and Noci 2007, p. 397),

If we relate this analogy to the complex fashion sector, it is evident how the most commercially successful business model – fast fashion – is shaping the customer behaviour through provision of cheap, speedy and resource intensive products. Furthermore, its ubiquitous presence in high streets across the globe shapes common consciousness of fast fashion consumption as normal and acceptable in our societies.

The customer experience design goes beyond the product, to integrate all touchpoints between the customer and the company - pre-purchase, during and post-purchase. In reality most retailers focus their effort on completing the transaction (purchase), with little concern for post-purchase experience in terms of both product usage and disposal. This prevailing approach to customer experience is generated by the current socio-economic system and techno-ecological reality, which is characterized by business growth at the expense of depletion of resources and economic of scale. Changing that reality is not only a challenge, but for many people and sustainable businesses, it is an ambition to become active agents of change.

Through industry workshops in the fashion sector that I have been conducting in London and Barcelona, it has become clear that the roadmap to fulfill this ambition of becoming sustainable brands is far from clear, as many designers and business struggle with translating their sustainable goals to everyday management and marketing practices. Throughout these workshops, the value of investigating how to design responsible customer experiences has been identified and validated as a practical and academic research question. The aims of the empirical part of the research are threefold:

- understanding the stages in customer journey where responsible customer experience design can enhanced or encouraged responsible consumption

- identifying specific pain points in the customer journey through ethnographic research with fashion consumers

- conducting interviews with brand managers / customer experience directors to understand the organizational and systemic implications of the shift to responsible customer experience design

As this research adopts the transformative consumer research philosophy, it both aims to aid practical decision-making and contribute to theory development while linking it to the broader discipline of macro marketing. Specifically, this study challenges the notion that the shift to sustainable consumption lies within production or consumption, but rather proposes customer experience design as a critical value exchange mechanism in adopting responsible practices by companies and consumers. The opportunities for responsible interventions are identified along the customer journey, while systemic implications are discussed in light of existing institutional logic and emerging world-views.

References

Gentile, Chiara, Spiller, Nicola & Noci, Giuliano. (2007). How to Sustain the Customer Experience:: An Overview of Experience Components that Co-create Value With the

Pereira Heath, M., & Chatzidakis, A. (2012). 'Blame it on marketing': consumers' views on unsustainable consumption. *International Journal of Consumer Studies*, 36(6).

Macromarketing









UNIVERSITY OF NEBRASKA-LINCOLN

BOGOTÁ, COLOMBIA